

**Minutes
City of Belle Meade
Historic Zoning Commission
December 14, 2021**

Commission members present

Mal Wall, Chairman Jeannette Whitson, Vice Chairman Ron Farris
Bunny Blackburn Charlie Rankin Renee Poe

Staff Members Present

Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney
Lyle Patterson, Assistant City Manager & Building Official
Rust Terry, City Recorder

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Mal Wall at 3:00 p.m.

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held November 9, 2021

Motion to approve: Whitson Second: Rankin Vote: All aye

Old Business:

1. **The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Billy Frank (21101) 1108 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved April 13, 2021.**

Old Business:

Building Official: This property has sold. Billy Frank, the builder, will be building this home. They will submit new plans at a later date.

2. **The application of Joel Lyons, (21104) 712 Lynwood Blvd., to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved June 8, 2021.**

Charlie Rankin representing the owner, Joel Lyons

Rankin presented revisions, from comments at the November 9, 2021, HZC meeting, to the English arts and crafts style home. He provided inspiration images, showing the influence of English architects Charles Voysey and Baillie Scott. Also provided were color images showing examples in a more contemporary context.

In simplifying the design, in materials and massing the following changes were made:

- Exterior cladding material changed from a painted brick to a traditional cementitious stucco.
- Limestone wall cladding around the entry area was removed.
- Removed parapet wall from small front facing gable and brought consistency to the gable and eve design on all the gables.
- Removed flat roof metal canopy on the front entry and garage doors; front entry now defined by a small, covered portico, clad in stucco and capped with a limestone wall; garage canopy was changed to a sloping standing seam metal roof with stucco clad ends.

- Mutton divisions on the windows and exterior doors now have a similar pattern; adjusted mutton pattern on rear elevation patio doors; reformatted front entry door so that there is consistency to pane size and fenestration.
- Addressed narrow proportion by broadening the two-story large front gable so it now sweeps over the entry.

Board Questions & Comments:

- Farris: Did the elevation changes result any in plan modifications?
- Rankin: None other than just the thickness of the cladding material.
- Blackburn: Could you tell us about the colors of the stucco and the windows?
- Rankin: The stucco will be a creamier off-white neutral color as in the inspiration images. There will be stucco samples on the site to drill down to that color because it will be an integrated color. Windows will be dark bronze cladding, as in the inspiration photos.
- Poe: And the color of the standing seam roof?
- Rankin: It will complement the other colors, probably in a dark bronze.
- Blackburn: What about the asphalt shingle?
- Rankin: A gray dimensional architectural shingle.
- Wall: This proposal is in front of the BZA this month?
- Rankin: That's correct.
- Chairman Wall: How will it affect the design if they don't allow a setback?
- Rankin: Rankin provided an overview of reasons for going before the BZA. Noting, the home fits inside the building envelope set by the Planning Commission, however a height variance is needed.
- Farris: You have been given the building envelope that we see.
- Rankin: That's correct.
- Whitson: How many square feet is the home?
- Rankin: Heated and cooled it is right at 4,000 square feet.
- Blackburn: What is allowed on the lot?
- Rankin: The FAR allows 5,123 and we are right at 5,003.
- Blackburn: How will the stucco be done?
- Rankin: It will be a traditional old-world three coat system.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve: Whitson **Second:** Poe

Board Discussion:

- Blackburn: This is a definite improvement. It still feels like a lot of the spec houses that have been built around.
- Whitson: I would love to see something rather than an asphalt roof. None of the inspiration photos have an asphalt roof. And it would really bring a look to the house. But I'm also understanding of people's budgets, and

if that architectural shingle is brought to the Building Official for approval, I could let that go, because the other elements of the house do raise it up.

- Chairman Wall: The house is much better than last month, but I do have severe reservations about whether the BZA is going to allow that much of an infraction on the setback.
- Rankin: The setback has been approved by the Planning Commission. The question is height, and only the BZA can grant a height variance.
- Blackburn: What are you asking the BZA for?
- In explaining the BZA presentation, Rankin noted that the Planning Commission has grandfathered the rear setback of the original house. He noted that it was impossible to reach the FAR of 5,123 square feet without a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals.
- Blackburn: If the BZA does not approve, you would be back here.
- Rankin: We would have to redesign according to the BZA recommendations.
- Whitson: We will see it again if it changes at all.

Chairman Wall called for a **Vote:** All aye

New Business

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for 4501 Alcott/Vintage South LLC, (21121) 438 Lynwood Blvd., for demolition of existing home (Property of Significance) and construct a new single-family home.

Chris Goldbeck with P. Shea Design representing for the owner, speaking about the design; Andrew Morton, from Vintage South will speak about materials and colors.

Mr. Goldbeck stated they are asking, first for the demolition of the existing house. The existing house, built in 1938, does not possess any of the attributes as laid out for a Property of Significance for a home in Belle Meade. The home is also uninhabitable and offered photos for verification.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Farris: Mr. Chairman do we want to bifurcate this?
- Chairman Wall: Yes, we will do the demolition discussion first.
- Farris: I've been at the residence briefly walked around and I don't see it as a property of significance.
- Chairman Wall: I've been there twice and it's in rough shape.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve demolition: Farris **Second:** Rankin **Vote:** All aye

Presentation on new home design

Goldbeck: There are 13 houses in the neighborhood we considered in terms of height and style, to be in context with the design we are considering. It is an eclectic mix of houses, some older houses; 5 houses were built in the last 25 years. Style wise we have a Spanish Revival home. The Spanish Revival style is found in Belle Meade, and I've included examples in the packet.

Goldbeck went over the style attributes of the proposed construction, and the features of the design that qualify the home as Spanish Revival. These included window and arch design as well as gable formation. Goldbeck also pointed out that the previous presentation brought concerns about window shutters which had been added to the home. Goldbeck briefly discussed the footprint of the home, noting that it was less than might be expected because currently surveyors are backed up and the lot had not yet been surveyed.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Whitson: A key part of the Spanish Revival is the clay tile roof. Can you tell us about roof you'd like to put on this house?
- Morton: We are showing a composition shingle. We are trying to make that work as part of the Spanish Revival style. The Belle Meade notebook said that the clay tile roof is often, but not always, a characteristic of the Spanish Revival style.
- Whitson: Do you have any examples in Belle Meade of that style of composition shingle?
- Goldbeck: I do not have examples of that.
- Blackburn: I have a Spanish Revival house and I've never seen a true Spanish revival house without the roof that she (Whitson) is referring to.
- Whitson: I have seen them in slate.
- Blackburn: A tile roof is a defining feature. I would like for you talk us through how your house represents these examples (from the inspirational photos).
- Goldbeck: The house at 221 Deer Park Circle has an arched entry, the home on Jackson Blvd. has arched windows; many of the homes had very simple reforms as is also in our design. There are shutters on many of the homes which we have incorporated as well. The home at 716 Enquirer Ave. has small decorative windows above the front door which we've also incorporated.
- Whitson: Can you tell me what the materials are for the balcony that you're showing above one of the arched windows on the right side.
- Morton: Ideally, that would be cedar.
- Blackburn: Painted or stained cedar?
- Morton: Stained as close to a natural color as possible.
- Blackburn: Your windows on your example are curved but they are different proportions. One of the defining features about the Spanish Revival is usually they are smaller windows.
- Farris: Can we see the other elevations?
- Blackburn: Is that clapboard?
- Goldbeck: Yes, that is to break up the material and color to keep it from being too monolithic. He pointed out examples from the Field Guide of the larger arch windows, in response to Blackburn's earlier concern about the window size, noting the windows on the first floor could be better scaled.
- Farris: What is the ceiling height of the first floor?
- Goldbeck: 11 feet. Second floor is 9 feet.

- Whitson: My issue with the right-side elevation is the massing. It's just a long, big box and I don't agree with putting siding on a Spanish Revival to break that up. Normally that is broken up with identifiable sections of the house that step back a number of inches, becoming another part of the house. That is the way you handle massing, not just one long wall. Breaking up the massing creates shadow lines and seems more architecturally savvy.
- Goldbeck: On the right-side elevation where the siding starts, if we made that brick and recessed that, it would feel better?
- Whitson: I think a number of those steps, in and out, would break this house up.
- Farris: On the garage side I see a long composition. Start on the left side with the two windows, top and bottom, there is some play of massing that could compliment the front. The hip could be completed down to break down the long elevation. The roof of the garage ridge could hip into a small cricket to break this massing down. That would be a compliment to the Spanish Revival style. The same thing could occur on the opposite side. What's the purpose of using the transom windows other than the ceiling height?
- Goldbeck: That allows windows to align with the front arch windows.
- Farris: I'd like to see the side elevations given the same oversight and depth of study as the front. It is the sides that have given the board some pause.
- Blackburn: I have issues with the front as to the scale of the decorative window above the front doors, they are too big for the style. I think you can't do a Spanish Revival without a tile roof. I don't think there should be any clapboard on the house, no siding at all. It is not in the Field Guide. The size of the balcony on the back is too large; balconies are smaller and are usually viewing balconies. I would like to see some examples of where the window styles came from.
- Goldbeck: I'll have to do some research on covered porches on Spanish Revival homes.
- Blackburn: The balcony on the front elevation does look accurate.
- Goldbeck: I'll research the back porch.
- Blackburn: Could you talk more about your window choices.
- Goldbeck: The windows are an attempt at keeping the Spanish Revival style.
- Blackburn: I think when you look at the scale on the examples, they are narrow. This arch window looks like what you see on a lot of spec houses right now.
- Goldbeck: I'll work on that.
- Poe: The chimney is plain for this style house. Speak to your decision on the chimney?
- Goldbeck: We put more of a higher detail on the front of house than the main body of the house. From the back you generally make it simpler.
- Poe: I see a metal roof over the back porch.
- Goldbeck: Yes, that is a metal roof.
- Whitson: Tell me about the gutters and the downspouts.
- Morton: Most likely they will be copper.

- Whitson: I like the detail of the collection boxes at the top. I think that's really appropriate. Just small things like that can really elevate the house.

No Public Comment

Motion to defer up to sixty days: Whitson Second: Blackburn

Board Discussion:

- Farris: There needs to be a broader overview and breaking down the massing to avoid the long broad side elevation. The massing needs to become aligned and organized. Some of the components on the front being used on the side. The balcony on the front is successful, you could center one above the garage doors. There are things that can be pulled from the front success to the side.
- Blackburn: The roof lines on the Spanish are usually simple. And this is a much more complicated.
- Rankin: I could accept an asphalt shingle look, next time bring some examples of Spanish Revival homes with an asphalt shingle. I also struggle with the lap siding component, but that could be resolved with creating some dimension and some stepping. On the left side, break up the long mass and get that material a little bit more consistent. The stepping could eliminate the need for lap siding on the second floor.
- Blackburn: Spanish Revival has some very specific architecture; windows are crucial; it is the details that define them.

Vote: All aye

2. The application for an amendment to a certificate of appropriateness issued September 2020, for Matt Cowan, (21122) 4417 Harding Place, for a change in approved windows.

Justin Lowe, Centric Architecture presenting for Matt Cowan.

Lowe summarized the reason for their return, noting it had not been their intent to make unapproved changes to the design. At issue is the stair window on the east side elevation, showing side by side photos of the original submission and the windows that had been installed. Noting that the original window, at this location in the house, had previously been redone and was not original to the home.

Lowe noted that as they got into the design, the stair placement and then the window placement on the stairs needed to be adjusted. They made the adjustments, changing the window design, pointing out in inspiration photos that interior stair placement often influences the window pattern on the exterior of the home. They did not believe that they should resubmit that plan change to the HZC.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Blackburn: This was brought to my attention by people who attended the first meeting, and we are not pleased that the changes have been made. We care a lot about windows. And we put a lot of time reviewing and approving plans and we did not approve these windows. The plans, stair

placement and window selection, should have been finalized before you submitted the plans to the committee for approval. The window is too large to be on the side of the house, considering the home is on the property line. This is a fundamental change that we did not approve.

- Whitson: We just ask if you do have changes, just come back to us. Let us review them, I think it's better for everybody. My issue with windows is the transom windows, you don't see this in Craftsman style homes.
- Chairman Wall: Bunny, were the people who brought this to your attention upset about the windows?
- Blackburn: Yes. I will also add that because of the age of the house we gave the plans a lot of scrutiny, and we are thrilled that they are renovating the home. I also don't believe we would have approved these windows if they had been part of the original plan submitted to us, for exactly the reason stated by Jeanette, that they are not part of the Craftsman style. These windows are not accurate to the style.
- Whitson: Was there an issue with the color? Has that been changed or is it accurate?
- Building Official, Patterson: It is accurate.

No Public Comment

Board Discussion:

- Blackburn: This is the first time this has happened, and we need to take it very seriously so not to set a precedent about asking us after the fact.
- Farris: Can we see the picture and construction of the window and stairs?
- Blackburn: I think it should be built as approved.
- Rankin: Can we see the photo comparison of what was submitted, what was permitted and then what was constructed? It looks like there was a change from the HZC submission to permit. The window that was installed appears to be what was submitted for permitting.
- Whitson: When it was submitted for permits, Lyle, you saw it but didn't realize that it was a different window.
- Building Official, Patterson: When someone submits a set of plans for permit that has been approved by the HZC, that's the set of plans that should be presented.
- Chairman Wall: Board architects, can they physically build stairs with the originally submitted window?
- Farris: My quick analysis would be yes.
- Building Official, Patterson: There's a special beam supporting that landing coming off the wall in the middle picture. It's quite an engineering feat.
- Poe: To the architects on the board: If the interior arrangement of that window were changed to make it more Craftsmen pure, could the overall opening of the window stay?
- Whitson: I do see precedent for triple windows. We don't have the neighbor on that side present and they have not come forward to say that's too much exposure for them. Why did you add the middle transom?

- Rankin: The only issue that I have with the design of the window is that middle transom. How to address the issue of making the change without first submitting the plan to the HZC is a separate issue.

Motion to approve the changes to the window pending the removal of the middle transom window: Rankin Second: Whitson

- Blackburn: There were more changes than the window, you are also asking for changes on the back of the house.
- Lowe: Yes, ma'am.
- Blackburn: The side window, this picture window and the doors on the back? I want the owners to know I'm glad you are renovating and not tearing the house down, and we are trying to work with you. I also want to say that we cannot monitor and cannot ask Lyle to monitor every set of submitted plans and construction site.
- Whitson: This was done a year and a half ago. And we are better about being clear. I did go back and read the minutes to understand what we said and there was some discussion that some of this could be embellished and possibly there was a sense that it was okay to make some changes. I do think you should have come back. I think now as we move forward as a committee, we've gotten better and we will make things very clear, moving forward, that any changes whatsoever must come back.
- Wall: There are two issues one of them being the window. I think everybody can agree the transom comes out. And the other is that there was a breakdown in the system.
- Blackburn: As a committee, we want to work with the homeowners, and we are trying to determine how to make this as least burdensome as we can.
- Whitson: Taking the middle transom out of the side window, would be the least drastic.

Chairman Wall: All in favor of the motion: Vote: All Aye

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Jeff Orr (21123) 1201 Canterbury Drive to construct an addition of more than 35%.

Ron Farris architect and Gavin Duke Landscape for Jeff Orr

Farris: We are asking the board to consider the renovation and expansion of this neoclassical house at 1201 Canterbury Drive. The original structure was built in 1955, it is not a property of significance, it is a property of conservation. Images reveal Canterbury Drive is comprised mainly of residences built within the last 25 years, are eclectic and lean away from a textbook identifiable style. Pictures show mid-century moderns and others would probably be categorized as French eclectic. This residence is a certainly a good example of neoclassical style. And in the opinion of myself and my clients worthy of conserving, but needs improvements to meet current trends and address some of its past ills. Farris noted features of the home which represent the neo-classical style as well as the fact that additions made in the 1970's-1980's had deviated from that style.

Farris noted that proposed additions will be within the envelope established by the existing residence but will require review from the Board of Zoning Appeals. Farris presented new exterior elevations plan showing the primary

component of the addition will replicate the main cross gable, matching the scale and proportion of the original structure while correcting or eliminating most of the flat roof issues from previous additions. Material will match the existing condition, which is painted brick, the roof will be a composite shingle, windows will be wood clad aluminum, gutters today are a painted ogee and will be replicated, the eaves and cornice are painted wood.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Blackburn: Are you replacing all the old windows.
- Farris: If we replace the old windows they will be replicated. This may be a broad discussion for the board, we could say they had to be replaced with a painted wood. The new owner prefers the clad.
- Blackburn: Are they doing it as a spec house?
- Farris: Two considerations, one is a spec the other that it would be for one of their children.
- Rankin: How you're treating the front, bay bump, where you're introducing the pediment railing there as well the new pilasters is that going to be lap siding infill matching existing lap siding on the addition to the left?
- Farris: Our plan is that these would be engaged pilaster columns, and this would be painted brick.
- Rankin: I'm wrestling with the railing along with the roof of the addition wondering if it competes with the railing on the front of the house. Is there a way to make it more secondary to the front by possibly using siding?
- Farris: I am not opposed to siding; it is a step back and is secondary. Landscaping in front of the step back will create a more secondary appearance.
- Whitson: I like the detail myself and then it repeats around the back of house; if you're looking at it, it is obviously secondary.
- Blackburn: It just reads flat right now.
- Poe: It will look different in the shadows.
- Farris: We went through several rear iterations, until this plan with the rail that you see.
- Whitson: I think it's a design decision. They're saving the house. It's not a 1920's house. And 50s is history here. I'm happy to have that there as well.
- Poe: Is there any detail on the garage? What is the garage door going to be?
- Farris: I think we'll wind up with windows in the top of that garage door. It's the one that's there today.
- Blackburn: Complements on erasing the 1970s from this house. Yes, you hit it very well.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve and submit: Blackburn **Second:** Whitson **Vote:**
All aye.

4. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for (Alex Palmer) 533 Belle Meade LLC, (21124) 533 Belle Meade Blvd., to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved June 2021.

Ron Farris, Architect, presenting for Mr. Alex Palmer, with the assistance of Ben Page, Landscape Architect.

Mr. Palmer is asking the Board to consider design of a new residence being built for resale. This property was purchased and approved for subdivision by the Planning Commission into two equal size lots. This residence is proposed for lot one which is the lot closest to the apartment building to the north. Lot two would be directly below this and a lot of that was on the corner of Belle Meade Blvd. and Leake Avenue.

Belle Meade Blvd. has an eclectic mix of style, as residences along the boulevard were not developed in a discernible chronological order. What is prominent, I think, is a consistence of residences along the Boulevard being often symmetrical, often with an elevated sense of proportion, scale, and presence.

I submitted the proposed style as Mission. The design could be argued and identified as an Italian Renaissance. If you refer to the Field Guide, these two styles are under a category of eclectic and have very similar characteristics. In general, both styles are often symmetrical, have lower pitched hipped roofs with broad overhangs, and a prominent use of curved openings. Farris noted that this home is more in line with the Mission style due to the use of parapets on the front, as well as an elliptical arch on the rear.

Farris used inspiration photos to show both the Italian Renaissance and Mission style homes, and the features of the home he is proposing. Farris noted they are not going to be using the entire setback space for the home, even though it is large, they are in fact giving green space to the street view.

Materials are a simple palette of smooth materials. The exterior will be rendered in real stucco, and limestone. Farris pointed out additional details, including entry porch columns, and window openings and the use of the stucco turning back to the window around the entire home. The stucco will be a complimentary light color to a buff limestone. The roof will be wood shake, windows will be aluminum clad in a weathered cocoa. The front door will be color matched steel, gutters will be half round copper, and eaves and corners will be painted wood in a light color to complement the stucco.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Blackburn: Do you have an example of a shake roof with limestone?
- Farris: I don't have a picture of it. It is used a lot out in California, which inspired this. I think if Mr. Palmer had his choice, it would be slate.
- Blackburn: I think that slate or barrel tile would be much better. I just can't see the shake.
- Whitson: I have seen that.
- Farris: A heavy dimensional wood shake would work with the house.
- Rankin: Wood shake would work; slate or barrel tile would also be nice choices.
- Blackburn: It is a pretty house.

- Whitson: The massing is great. What you have done with the main structure, and then adding square footage with the additions. It is very elegant, unusual, and very high end, which is what we like to see in Belle Meade.
- Farris: I am excited to hear that because it was a lot of effort by Mr. Palmer and myself.
- Whitson: What is the square footage?
- Farris: Total heated and cool we're hovering in the eights
- Whitson: And you haven't gone to the lot lines? It can be done.
- Farris: We are at our maximum footprint; and Ben has a nice direction for landscaping.
- Poe: I Love the central entry, the circular driveway, all the circular elements to the round columns around the windows, just stately. Very beautiful.
- Blackburn: I like how you've done the windows on the front elevation with the columns in the middle and the way you are returning the stucco.
- Farris: Does the Mission style make sense?
- Whitson: It is, especially with elliptical windows, I think this is a little bit more approachable house.
- Farris: One thing I would say to the board, currently the chimneys are austere. We may envelop those again if the budget allows. It would be subtle, and I would share with the Building Official.
- Rankin: You have indicated brackets on there, what material will those be?
- Farris: Those will be wood.
- Whitson: And all the chimneys are functioning.
- Farris: They are.

Public Comment

- Thank you very much. My name is Larry Butler. I inhabit the apartment building that faces this lot. Which way does the garage face?
- Farris: It faces the side of the apartments.
- Butler: Before the excavation there was a great amount of greenery between our lot line that shaded us from the lot and the lot from us. A lot of that greenery was removed recently. The trees remain but most of the shrubbery, which provided that visual barrier is gone. It also left behind, and I'm sure this will be corrected when the final excavation is done, a lot of standing water on the lot, and there always was standing water on the lot in the far corner among all the trees. It's a mosquito problem in the summertime, and I would hope that that will be addressed as far as grading and drainage to wherever that water is supposed to go. And I'm sure there's a lot of conflicting lot lines along the back. It would be beneficial to address the standing water problem and perhaps keep an eye on maybe not losing any more greenery.
- Whitson: Lyle, can you assure him about stormwater and Ron, can you make sure that that's addressed.

- Building Official, Patterson: I've seen that plan. This house will be coming to the board of zoning appeal for the pool and a grade change and it's a very lush landscape plan on that side. And there'll be a full stormwater plan to address any sort of water on the property.
- Butler: I'll let the other residents know, thank you.
- Farris: Ben has developed a landscape plan that is going before the zoning appeals this coming Tuesday. I believe he's addressed those comments and the stormwater we will address.

Public Comment Closed

Board Discussion: None

Motion to approve as submitted: Rankin Second: Blackburn Vote: All aye.

Meeting adjourned at 5:16 p.m.

Mal Wall, Chairman

City Recorder, Rusty Terry