Minutes City of Belle Meade Historic Zoning Commission July 12, 2022

Commission Members Present

Mal Wall, Chairman Jeannette Whitson, Vice Chairman Gavin Duke Ron Farris Charlie Rankin

Staff Members Present

Beth Reardon, City Manager	Doug Berry, City Attorney
Lyle Patterson, Building Official	Rusty Terry, City Recorder

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Wall at 3:00 p.m.

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held May 10, 2022

Motion to approve:	Farris	Second:	Whitson	Vote:	All aye
--------------------	--------	---------	---------	-------	---------

Chairman Wall asked that item 3 on the agenda be shifted to the beginning of the meeting; stating that there had been a request to defer the item. There was no objection from Whitson, Duke, Farris or Rankin.

New Business:

 Historic Zoning Commission to review and take action concerning alleged violation of certificate of appropriateness for 1206 Nichol Lane, change of color for roof shingles.

Shawn Henry, attorney for Mr. & Mrs. Russell McClean, stated that he had been hired last week, had requested and received records pertaining to the property just prior to the meeting. Henry stated he wanted to review the materials and return before the Historic Zoning Commission at the August 9, 2022 meeting to make a fully informed presentation, so the commission could make a fully informed decision.

Motion to approve deferral: <u>Farris</u> Second: <u>Whitson</u> Vote: <u>All Aye</u>

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Sloan Thomas, (22071) 1220 Chickering Road, to construct multiple new accessory buildings, and a change to the front façade.

Presentation: Catherine Sloan, architect

Sloan stated that they would be keeping the home, which had originally been approved for demolition; completing the renovations on the existing home which had been started, as well adding garages and an office which would be

connected to the main house by a porte-cochère and walkway; a detached pool house and pool is also included in the project. Sloan provided details on the renovation to the façade of the home as well as information on the addition of the garage, sports car garage, office area on the left side of the property, and the pool house which will be on the back right of the property. Sloan noted that the wall in front of the sports car garage area was designed to look like a garden wall to hide the fact that it was a sports car garage, and to break up the massing. Sloan noted that the addition is planned for the left side of the existing home to preserve views from the existing family room to the back of the property. It was also noted that there will be a potting shed structure that opens to a kitchen garden, and it will be done in old, reclaimed brick, that will be left natural; the plan is to do a combination whitewash/lime wash, to give an appearance of old brick on the existing home exterior as well as the additions. Sloan stated they are within the footprint of the building envelope.

- Duke: Is there a grading plan?
- Sloan: Not yet.
- Duke: I am familiar with the property, and I know there is some sloping, will that be filled in.
- Sloan: Some will be filled in, we are building the garage up, there will be step downs from the house to the garage to the office areas.
- Farris: Are there elevations of the connector to the main house?
- Sloan: There are not, but there are elevations of the rear of the structures.
- Farris: Is there an elevation of the back side?
- Sloan: Yes, there is. (These were pointed out using the plans)
- Rankin: Is there a retaining wall at the elevation of the garage doors and past the office?
- Sloan: Yes.
- Rankin: What is the scale of that wall?
- Sloan: It has not been designed at this point. This is all generic at this point, it was our understanding we did not need the grading plan at this point. It will be done for the presentation of the pool to the Board of Zoning Appeal.
- Farris: There appears to be a combination of materials, can you explain those.
- Sloan: The main house will still be brick; currently the brick doesn't match with additions that have been done, we will cover all the brick with whitewash/lime wash.
- Farris: Is the front porch coming off?
- Sloan: It is, and two bay windows will be added on the front.
- Farris: Can you explain the materials at the back.
- Sloan: The family car garage is where you see the siding, it will be painted a warm white, the garage doors will probably be a dark greenish color. The garden wall in front of the sports car garage will be old, reclaimed brick, but not painted or whitewashed. Then the office goes back to the warm white painted siding.
- Farris: And the pool house?
- Sloan: The pool house will be a painted wood shingles.

- Rankin: And what is the material on the garden house structure on the front?
- Sloan: That will be old, reclaimed brick, like the sports car garage.

No Public Comment

Motion to defer until a full site plan, and design implemented into that plan, is submitted: Farris Second: Chairman Hale

Board Discussion

- Whitson: There are details that we do need to see, there is a ten-foot drop and how that will be executed. I am happy the home is not being demolished, but we don't want to say yes to something and then it has to change because the site plan had to change.
- Farris: I echo those comments, my motion to defer does not mean I don't like what has been presented. I want to understand it better, and all other applicants have been required to submit a grading plan.
- Duke: Aesthetically it is very nice; I just want to make sure that functionally it doesn't have to come back to us.
- Sloan: It was our understanding we did not need a grading plan for this. I am confident, that the information I have presented is what the project will be. We thought this was only to look at the architectural structures or we would have completed that plan.
- Chairman Wall: The board just needs to see those elevations, there are no architectural issues.
- Sloan: We spoke with Building Official Patterson about completing the renovation on the existing structure, would it be possible to approve the main house and then return next month for the additions with a grading plan?
- Duke: We could bifurcate the project.
- Farris: I am comfortable with that, and I believe you can continue with your drawings.
- Whitson: I am comfortable with that.
- Rankin: I am as well.

Motion withdrawn: Farris Second withdrawn: Chairman Wall

Motion to approve alterations to existing residence and defer construction of proposed structures pending the submission of a full site plan: <u>Rankin</u> Second: <u>Farris</u> Vote: <u>All aye</u>

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for John Montgomery (22072) 436 Lynwood Blvd., to demo existing home (previous demo approval given June 9, 2020, expired June 9, 2021) and construct a new single-family home.

Presentation, Chris Goldbeck, Architect P. Shea Designs Goldbeck stated that the house was built in 1937, and is habitable, however the home does not embody the qualities and characteristics to qualify it as a property of significance, nor to be qualified for the National Register of Historic Places. Goldbeck also stated that the home does not have significant architectural style found in Belle Meade, and it was not listed in the Belle Meade Historic Resources report nor does that report list the home as being designed by a notable architect or built by a notable builder.

Chairman Wall: We would normally bifurcate the demolition from the construction. I will entertain a motion to approve demolition of the house.

Motion to approve demolition: <u>Whitson</u> Second: <u>Duke</u> Vote: <u>All aye</u>

Goldbeck continued with the presentation of the home to be constructed, which will be a one and one-half story home in the Neoclassical style. Goldbeck's presentation included photos of 13 existing homes in the immediate neighborhood; referencing the Belle Meade Historic Resource Survey noting the use of the Neoclassical style in Belle Meade. Goldbeck described the features of the home that qualify it as neoclassical style. The home will have a brick veneer foundation, with siding and composition shingles.

- Rankin: Will the brick be painted or natural?
- Goldbeck: It will be painted off-white to match the siding.
- Duke: Can you provide a sample of neoclassical with a six over one window as you have here?
- Goldbeck: Referencing the inspiration images, Goldbeck stated that the only one is a newly constructed home, on Tyne Blvd. Goldbeck noted that one of his references for the style, an online publication on the neoclassical style in Louisiana, referenced both six over one and nine over one as windows characteristic of the minimalist neoclassical subtype.
- Farris: Are there any variances needed for the project?
- Goldbeck: No, and there is a grading plan included.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve: Whitson Second: Farris

Board Discussion

- Duke: The windows seem top heavy for the style
- Whitson: Are the windows a design preference or something that the client wants.
- Goldbeck: It was a design decision.
- Farris: Do you have inspiration images that show this style.
- Whitson: The home on Tyne, in the inspiration photos, is not in Belle Meade.
- Goldbeck: It is in Forest Hills.
- Farris: It is good to see that windowpane pattern.
- Rankin: You cited a source in your presentation for keys to the neoclassical style, and there was a reference to the six over one pattern. What was that resource?

- Goldbeck: It is a document prepared by Valenzuela Preservation Studio in Austin, Texas, for the state of Louisiana Cultural Development, Division of Historic Preservation, "Historic Context for the Neoclassical architectural style in Louisiana".
- Rankin: Did the document make reference of that (six over one) being a common feature, how is it worded?
- Goldbeck: The resource lists features of each subtype of the neoclassical style, not in specifics but in general terms.
- Duke: I am not aware of a home in Belle Meade with that design.
- Whitson: Especially when it is triple hung.
- Rankin: It is the transoms that give me pause, I don't mind it on the single windows; it is on the sun porch, to the side and the back, the transoms look top heavy.
- Duke: I think they should all be divided. I guess that would be nine over nine.
- Goldbeck: And then six over six.
- Duke: Aesthetically that is the better solution.

Motion amended to include that windows be altered to include divided lights in the lower portion where they are currently single pane: <u>Whitson</u> Second: Farris Vote: All aye

Motion to approve motion as amended: <u>All aye</u>

New Business:

None

Other Business: Discussion for a change in language to the current Citywide Conservation Overlay Interim Design Guidelines.

City Attorney Berry addressed the board regarding items discussed at the Historic Zoning year-end retreat to amend certain sections of the Historic Zoning Commission bylaws (BETH: Is that correct or is it guidelines) which enable the commission to be more flexible with certain designations. Berry also addressed concerns of incomplete applications which had also been discussed and how to approach those going forward, as well as other terminology, and adopting new rules of procedures. Berry stated that the changes would need to be on the August agenda, and there would need to be a public hearing.

Meeting adjourned at 4:15 p.m.

The next scheduled Historic Zoning Commission meeting will be held <u>Tuesday</u> <u>August 9, 2022,</u> at 3:00 P.M. at Belle Meade City Hall.

Chairman Mal Wall

City Recorder Rusty Terry