

**Minutes
City of Belle Meade
Historic Zoning Commission
May 10, 2022**

Commission Members Present

Mal Wall, Chairman Jeannette Whitson, Vice Chairman Bunny
Blackburn Rene Poe Ron Farris

Staff Members Present

Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney, joined
the meeting at 3:40 p.m.
Lyle Patterson, Building Official Rusty Terry, City Recorder

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Wall at 3:00 pm

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held April 12, 2022

Motion to approve: Whitson Second: Farris Vote: All aye

Old Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Billy Frank, (21101) 1108 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved April 2021.

Presentation: Danny Rosen Contractor and Champ Webb Architect presenting for owners Clea and John Shearer

Rosen recapped the previous presentations, with streetscapes and in inspiration photos. Rosen noted that the French Eclectic style home would be constructed of brick with a stucco veneer in a white tone, windows would be black with limestone headers and sills, and the front porch would also be limestone.

Champ Webb presented the elevations showing the changes to the home that were addressed based on comments the commission had provided during their presentation at the March 8, 2022 commission meeting. Champ noted window changes, and roof line changes; the limestone entrance was refined, and limestone details were added to the center window. On the rear elevation, the doors that access the veranda and pool will match the front doors.

Board Comments and Questions

- Farris: What is the overall height of the house?
- Webb: 36 foot 6 from the grade.
- Poe: On the left side of the front elevation, you have a flat roof and a parapet?
- Webb: The left side elevation shows where the setback. The setback is 10 feet.

- Blackburn: What is the material for the body of the house now?
- Rosen: It is brick with stucco veneer.
- Poe: What is the color of the stucco veneer?
- Rosen: Soft white.
- Blackburn: Is it like a mortar rub?
- Rosen: It is an applied stucco.
- Blackburn: Is it hand applied or sprayed on?
- Rosen: It is hand applied.
- Blackburn: It is a white house with black windows?
- Rosen: It will be a version of white.
- Webb: It is not a stark white, it is a softer white, warmer than the trendy look being done now.
- Whitson: Did you bring any materials for us to see today?
- Rosen: We did not.
- Chairman Wall: What is the roof material?
- Rosen: It is an architectural asphalt shingle.
- Blackburn: You have a harsh black roof, a white house and black windows, it is that stark trendy look, and this is concerning to me. I think there are some improvements on the windows; you have a whole lot of roof lines on the front elevation; it looks like a spec house to me. Can you tell me how I'm wrong?
- Rosen: The home is custom, and the color scheme is the desire of the client. This architectural shingle is dual black and will not be a jet-black roof.
- Poe: I appreciate the changes you have made; the massing and details are better; the parapet roof creates a point of interest to the left of the main trunk of the house and it balances with the window to the right of the main trunk of the house. I am not triggered by the black window, any design element that is done well will be a welcome sight on the street.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve as submitted: Poe Second: Wall

Board Discussion

- Whitson: To the Building Code Official; Can they submit all materials and colors to you.
- Building Official Patterson: I do look at Materials, and colors if the commission requests them to be provided to me.
- Whitson: If you could also prepare a sample board for the site.
- Rosen: Yes, we can do that.
- Farris: I think curved eave lines would improve this house. The limestone front porch is generically drawn, and I do not want it to come across as being inexpensively done; The water table base needs to be stronger in appearance.

Motion amended to approve with comments – the introduction of curved eave lines, applicant to present details for the front limestone porch and trim

around the front door, a detail for the water table base and a color board to be available: Vote Aye: Poe, Farris, Wall, Whitson Vote Nay: Blackburn

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Joel Lyons (22012) 626 Royal Oaks Place (Property of Conservation) for submittal of materials needing approval as requested by the HZC commission March 8, 2022.

Presentation, Joel Lyons, Chandelier Development

Lyons presented materials as requested, these included colors for paint, brick, windows and unable to get a sample of the roof as presented at the March 8 meeting, provided a sample of a new clay tile roof.

- Blackburn: Would you bring the paint samples and the roof tile to us so we can see them up close.
- Lyons: Provided materials for the commissioners to review, pointing out the variation in the color of the roof tile, and the choices for the cornice and the windows.
- Whitson: I would suggest using the Revere Pewter color, the White Dove will be bright, and it also pulls yellow. All of the colors and materials you have provided are acceptable.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve materials as presented with the color selection and textured brick: Whitson Second: Farris Vote: All aye

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Walter Morgan (22031) 212 Clarendon Ave., to construct a new single-family home.

Presentation, Michael Ward, Allard Ward Architects

Ward provided information on changes made in response to comments at the April 12, 2022 meeting. A water table base with offset brick and a covered stoop with Doric columns have been added, all windows, except for a few on the back have been changed to a double hung with 6 over 6 on the upper level and 9 over 9 for the central body of the house. The amount of brick space has been decreased between the lower level and upper-level windows by raising the heads of the lower-level windows. The brick surrounds on the dormers were changed to standard flat trim which is more typical of the Colonial Revival style. The ridgeline on both wings has been dropped to create more hierarchy between center massing and the sides. On the north elevation a small window in the master closet, has been changed to two windows that are 9 over 9 and a double hung above.

- Blackburn: The front door looks like it is lower than the windows, we like to see those in line together.
- Ward: The door is at 8, the window is 8'8".
- Blackburn: It's just unusual to see the front door lower than the windows.
- Poe: Are all the shutters functioning.
- Ward: Yes they are.

- Farris: The columns are proud of the rack, can that be returned to a classical scale, normally the column is in line with the rack above.
- Ward: We have an 8-inch rack wrapping on 3 sides, the Doric column is centered, and the capital of the column extends on either side of the rack. We can do a 10-inch rack.

Ward provided samples of materials and colors for the commissioners to review. These had been presented and approved at the March 8, 2022 meeting.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve: Whitson Second: Farris Vote: All aye

New Business:

None

Other Business: None scheduled.

The next scheduled Historic Zoning Commission meeting will be held **Tuesday June 14, 2022**, at 3:00 P.M. at **Belle Meade City Hall**.

Meeting adjourned at 4:05 p.m.

Chairman Mal Wall

City Recorder Rusty Terry