

**Minutes
City of Belle Meade
Historic Zoning Commission
April 12, 2022**

Commission Members Present

Jeanette Whitson, Vice Chairman Bunny Blackburn Rene Poe
Gavin Duke Ron Farris Charlie Rankin

Staff Members Present

Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney
Lyle Patterson, Building Official Rusty Terry, City Recorder

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairman Jeanette Whitson at 3:00 pm

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held February 8, 2022

Motion to approve: Blackburn Second: Farris Vote: All aye

Old Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Billy Frank, (21101) 1108 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved April 2021.

Application incomplete, denied by Building Official Patterson.

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for 4501 Alcott/Vintage South LLC, (21121) 438 Lynwood Blvd., to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved December 14, 2021.

Presentation: Andrew Morton with Vintage South, provided samples of final materials, as requested by the board at the meeting held February 8, 2022. These included:

- Brick sample
- Paint color sample for brick
- Clay tile roofing sample, including color
- Windows will be Marvin or Sierra Pacific in a bronze color

Using project plans, Morton reviewed the adjustments made per the board's conditions:

- A four-inch offset between the basement level and first level
- Added closed shutters creating an illusion of centered windows above garage doors
- Balanced the windows on the left side elevation

- Adjusted the roof form between house and garage by adding a slight pitch

Board Questions and Comments

- Duke: Remind me of the gutter color
- Morton: Dark bronze to match the windows
- Whitson: You have done a great job of addressing our concerns
- Duke: Is the site plan included in this package?
- Morton: Site plan is being finalized by Steve Casey, CEC.
- Duke: Does that include grading.
- Morton: Using plans, Morton noted the layout and stated they are waiting for the final approval on the grading.
- Duke: It would be helpful to have that plan, to show how you plan to grade it out, so that we have it for the record.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve with the condition that we receive the grading plan for review prior to beginning construction: Duke
Second: Farris Vote: All Aye:

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Joel Lyons (22012) 626 Royal Oaks Place (Property of Conservation) for submittal of materials needing approval as requested by the HZC commission 3/8/22.

Motion to defer: Poe Second: Rankin Vote: All aye.

New Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Walter Morgan (22031) 212 Clarendon Ave., to construct a new single-family home.

Presentation: Michael Ward and Brian Haun, architects with Allard Ward Architects

Ward: This is a new lot on Clarendon, we have designed a house in the Colonial Revival style at the Morgan's request. There are some height restrictions and massing restrictions on the property, and we have chosen a story and half to stay within those restrictions. Using the elevations, Ward stated that the home was Colonial Revival with side gables, pointing out those features that qualify the home as Colonial Revival. Using contextual photos from the neighborhood, Ward indicated most other homes in the neighborhood are Colonial Revival, except for a few Tudors. Haun provided information on the setback and height restrictions for the property, noting that the style enabled them to work within those guidelines.

Board Comments and Questions

- Vice Chairman Whitson Are you going before the BZA with this house?
- Ward: We are not.

- Vice Chairman Whitson Can you provide more detail on the window casing?
- Ward: Providing a window sample Ward stated they are using Marvin windows, and the color will be cashmere.
- Vice Chairman Whitson Are you painting the brick.
- Ward: No; Providing a sample of the brick Ward noted, that it is from General Shale, a Tennessee made brick. Ward provided a sample of the cashmere and stated that the gutters and downspouts would be copper.
- Haun: The cornices are full return. There will be a limestone surround on the front door, providing a sample.
- Ward: The front door will be a six panel, mahogany stained, wood door, not with glass as shown. The decision to change was made after we had submitted the plans.
- Duke: I struggle with the dormers penetrating the front roof, that's not common in the Colonial Revival style; and most Colonial Revivals have a front portico.
- Ward: It is not the most common form of Colonial Revival.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: Is that the design you would like to have or is it assisting with interior space.
- Ward: It is assisting with the interior space.
- Duke: What is the height?
- Ward: It is 40 feet for about a 15-foot depth, and it seemed like a good compromise to keep the scale down since the neighborhood is already sort of a combination of two stories and story and a half homes.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: So your main height for the main portion of the house is 40 feet and then you drop down to the sides.
- Ward: We are not close to 40 feet. It is a narrow slot.
- Farris: Can we see the front elevation; what is the height, from grade plus or minus, of the main ridge above the five dormers.
- Haun: To the main ridge, plus or minus 28 feet.
- Farris: Where are you exceeding 40 feet? Or can you?
- Haun: We can exceed 40 feet closer to the front, behind that is 25 feet.
- Farris: I believe that this project needs to be before the Board of Zoning Appeal for height relief. This house does not have a base, and the current height proportion is not commensurate with the style.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: It is wide, and it needs that water table line. The scale seems very horizontal.
- Blackburn: I also think it is lacking some of the features of the Colonial Revival Style. The front door, the dormers, the width of the windows on the bottom. The double windows on the far right- and left-hand sides. I struggle with some of those features when I'm going through the Field Guide and looking at Colonial Revival. And if it is because you are being constrained by height, then that would be a really good reason to go to the BZA.
- Ward: They may appear small, but they are sitting at 8 feet. Everything is a little taller than they may appear. All of the contextual houses around set pretty close to the ground. It would be nice for us to be up off the ground a little further. Our head height/indoor height is

already taller than those. It actually is not as compressed as I think it probably appears in the drawing.

- Duke: Is that a flat roof?
- Ward: There is a flat roof section behind the ridge.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: And that is to comply with the 25-foot rule?
- Ward: Yes it is. We discussed the possibility of going to the BZA, however in terms of the square footage that was wanted for the house, we were able to achieve that within the parameters we had. Ward provided examples from the new version of the Field Guide, noting that the new version has a more expanded section on Colonial Revival.
- Poe: Are there any chimney's and is there a fireplace?
- Ward: The chimney is on the back, which you cannot see from the front.
- Farris: I am concerned that the gable on the right elevation is going to look as if it has been forced in to achieve the height requirement.
- Ward: I do want to point out that you don't see the full gable from the front, but you do from the side.
- Farris: I would target the scale and proportion.
- Blackburn: On the side view, there is a lot of brick. Are the windows on the side placed as they are for a reason?
- Ward: That is the master bath and closet end of the house.
- Blackburn: I think revisiting that side view is necessary.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: Normally the windows would be double hung. Are they all casement windows? I am unable to determine from the front elevation if the dormer windows are six light.
- Ward: They are six light, and the upstairs (dormer) windows have to be casement for egress due to their being located in the children's bedrooms. We made a conscious decision to use the casements across the whole façade.
- Blackburn: What is the material over the dormers?
- Ward: It is a solid panel.

Public Comment

Dudley Morgan White, 4825 Harding Road, stated that she lives next door to the property and is thrilled her grandson is building on the property.

Public Comment closed

Motion to defer with comment: Farris **Second:** Duke

Board Discussion

- Vice Chairman Whitson: What I have heard from the board is that there are a number of issues. It is proposed as a Colonial Revival, and there are elements that are not Colonial Revival, such as the front portico; it lacks massing with a proper foundation; windows are casement and not double hung and are more Tudor than colonial revival. The dormers that are connected to the front facade of the house are a bit unusual, although there may be some examples in the eclectic section of the Field Guide on Colonial Revival.

- Farris: There is a foundation of design, that needs refinement. I feel like they are constrained by the ordinances, and I believe if they were allowed some relief they could improve upon the design.
- Poe: It is not within the purview of this board to give them that variance that would address raising that foundation for aesthetic value. Does this need to go to the BZA to address that?
- Farris: What weight would this board carry to make a subtle suggestion to the BZA?
- Building Official, Patterson: Did you struggle with the shallowness of the lot?
- Ward: Yes.
- Building Official, Patterson: There is some light weight carried from this board over to the BZA, and historically speaking, I think the BZA takes into consideration challenges of lots when it comes to the shallowness.
- Rankin: Is there a height comparison to the other houses on the street?
- Ward: If you look at the contextual images I think this is close, none of the nearby houses on Clarendon are particularly tall.
- Rankin: There is a balance; a lot of what we talk about is controlling the scale of houses. I appreciate that they have attempted to comply to the zoning ordinance and appreciate the smaller scale of the house. I agree with elevating the house out of the ground. I also would suggest looking at the scale between the head of the first-floor windows and the sill of the second-floor windows. The space between the windows appears accentuated between the first and second floor windows.
- City Attorney Berry: They can go before the BZA with a site that has a hardship, it doesn't have to be impossible, it just needs to meet the criteria of hardship.
- Farris: I do not want my comments mis-interpreted. There are ways to do what you are doing with the design without a variance. Going to the BZA would be your decision. This board will support that if you choose to do so.

Vice Chairman Whitson: I am going to call for a vote on our motion to defer for up to 60 days: Vote: All aye.

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Tarek El Gammal (22032) 4434 Shepard Place, to remove previous addition and porch and construct an addition to rear of home.

Presentation: Ron Farris, architect, Farris Concepts in Architecture and Richie Jones, landscape architect, Hodgson & Douglas Landscape Architects. Farris stated the home was built in 1969, placing the residence in the category of property of conservation. Noting that the majority of the home is original, with the aid of photos pointed out where there appear to have been two additions. Using inspirational photos from the neighborhood, Farris noted the cross-section of home styles on Shepard Place stating a number of them lean toward the Georgian style as does this home, and the improvements being proposed are not intended to deviate from the style of the residence. Farris

referred to the Field Guide description of the Georgian style home noting the home at 4434 Shepard met those qualifications.

Farris provided a description of the proposed additions:

Except for the master suite addition, the additions are two story in mass and adhere to the simple geometry and massing of the original residence. The two addition's will be removed.

The columned side porch, while architecturally compatible, appears to have been added. We propose to replace the porch within the new addition as a sunroom/porch that would overlook the new pool courtyard. Continuing through the plans, Farris noted that a railing is proposed on the flat roof section over the front porch. An addition to the right includes a new side entry and small porch, and a one-story master bedroom on the left side of the home. Farris stated that except for the telescoping doors on the sunroom porch, all windows will be double hung, with appropriate pane proportions, taller than wide; shutters will be scaled to their respective windows and cornice details will match existing.

Using an inspiration photo, Farris noted the tonal color plans for the exterior brick, stating that the entire home, which is currently painted brick, would be painted the same color as the inspirational photo. The shutters will be authentically hinged and along with the headers and sills, will have a slightly different tonal value than the brick. Window frames will be painted a complimentary tonal value but will not be dark. The roof will match existing, windows will be wood clad aluminum, gutters and downspouts are currently painted and will remain so, eaves and cornices will be painted wood with a color to complement the gray.

Farris stated they will be seeking a small height variance on the rear addition from the Board of Zoning Appeal.

Board Comments and Questions

- Vice Chairman Whitson: Are the darker windows the windows you are adding, and are they six over six or eight over eight?
- Farris: All of the windows will be paned; they are all double hung. The sunroom porch doors will also be paned.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: I think the shutters on the triple across windows could go away.
- Duke: When you take the shutters away there will be big blank stuccos on the side. Is there something you can do, like a recess?
- Farris: We could do a false shutter.
- Blackburn: That would be a good solution. If you could separate the windows, and keep the shutters, that would work as well.
- Duke: What is the interior room behind that window?
- Farris: It is a recreational room.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: It is the back of the house; you are never going to see it from a street view.
- Blackburn: What about those on the right side elevation?
- Farris: I would propose to remove those; the bottom window is a large kitchen window.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: And then you could possibly create a false shuttered window to the left.

- Farris: Yes or something.
- Rankin: Why do you feel the side porch isn't original to the house?
- Farris: The floor has cracked and settled.
- Vice Chairman Whitson: Is it concrete?
- Farris: Yes, it is concrete. And to be forthright, we need it for the footprint. We are creating an outdoor uncovered room on that side of the house.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve: Duke **Second:** Blackburn

Board Discussion

- Blackburn: The comments that we made regarding the windows and where to remove shutters, and if you can separate the windows. We understand that those are not elevations that are going to be seen from the front, but I do think that those were improvements. Do we need to go back and say what those changes were on the Windows specifically?
- Farris: If you would.

Motion to approve on the following conditions: Shutters on right elevation to be removed where they do not cover the windows; left elevation, two upper shutters to be removed off the center section of the new addition; rear elevation remove upper shutters over office entry: Duke Second: Blackburn Vote: All aye

Other Business:

City Attorney Berry: The commission had some good ideas at the annual workshop. Would you want me to provide amendments to your guidelines that would address those items? Some are procedural, some are more substantive.
 Vice Chairman Whitson: Yes please.

Meeting adjourned at 4:34 p.m.

 Vice Chairman Jeanette Whitson

 City Recorder Rusty Terry