

**Minutes
City of Belle Meade
Historic Zoning Commission
March 8, 2022**

Commission Members Present

Mal Wall, Chairman
Jeanette Whitson, Vice Chairman
Bunny Blackburn
Rene Poe
Gavin Duke
Charlie Rankin

Staff Members Present

Beth Reardon, City Manager
Doug Berry, City Attorney
Lyle Patterson, Building Official
Rusty Terry, City Recorder

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Mal Wall at 3:00 p.m.

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held February 8, 2022

Motion to approve: Duke Second: Rankin Vote: All aye

Old Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Billy Frank, (21101) 1108 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved April 2021.

Presentation

Danny Rosen Contractor and Champ Webb Architect presenting for owners Clea and John Shearer

Rosen briefly reviewed their progress with the property at 1108 Nichol Lane, noting that previous presentations had been denied and that the architect, Champ Webb, had redrawn the plans for the home. Rosen then presented streetscape photos and inspirational photos from the neighborhood for the home that they are presenting.

Webb stated that the new design was Georgian Revival, noting the traditional elements, through design drawings, that placed the home in this style. He did note that with a slight change of the roof pitch the house could be considered French Eclectic.

Webb stated the entryway would be limestone, as would the headers and sills on the windows and doors.

- Blackburn: What is the material on the mass of the house and on the roof.
- Webb: Brick and an asphalt shingle – a dimensional shingle.
- Duke: Is it a painted brick.
- Webb: The client's wishes are to have a white painted brick house, with black windows and black gutters.

- Rosen: We have tried to begin showing an unpainted brick, even though the client is not asking, but we are trying to be open to what this board has said previously.
- Duke: We need to know the type of white painted brick as there are different qualities brick.
- Rosen: I don't believe that will be an issue.
- Duke: Are the gutters copper, what kind of guttering is it? It seems to disappear into the cornice.
- Webb: The gutters will be black, not copper, with scuppers and gutter boxes.
- Blackburn: I have a concern that this is just another trendy white house with black windows. And, the front door is not a Georgian style door.
- Webb: The plan is for a black steel door.
- Blackburn: I understand that maybe what they want but that is not what we're looking for. We are looking for timeless and quality architecture. And a trendy white brick house with black windows and steel front door does not meet those criteria.
- Rosen: I appreciate what you're saying, there are things such as the front door, we worked hard on in order to be back here in 20 days; I've found the Shearer's to be reasonable.
- Blackburn: We gave you 60 days.
- Rosen: We have to be considerate of the timing for our clients.
- Blackburn: Twenty days to do the architecture for house would be extraordinarily fast. Those details need to be a little more well thought out before you bring the presentation to us. It is frustrating for us as well, and this is the third attempt, and each time we say bring us pure architectural styling.
- Duke: Are there other elevation views?
- Webb: Yes there are.
- Whitson: I would like to say, in reference to the previous presentations, here the massing and window placement and cornice are much improved. I do believe there are some details that should have been more developed before the plans were brought to us. I would like to hear more about the window package and type of windows.
- Rosen: We will be using Marvin windows
- Duke: Looking at the front elevation, I am unable to tell if those are windows or doors to the side.
- Webb: They are French casement windows and are fixed, they are nine feet tall. They are intended to give the appearance of doors as we do have a terrace across the front.
- Duke: A Georgian style house does not have French casement windows, you could do triple or double hung windows on a Georgian. The house doesn't have the details that make it a Georgian style. If you want to do steel doors, and some of the other features you have, you might want to go with a French Eclectic style.
- Blackburn: I also think the house is more French Eclectic than it is Georgian.
- Webb: We did look at the French Eclectic section in the Field Guide.

- Duke: The gutters are also in the French Eclectic look, and possibly a lime washing on the brick as opposed to white paint, and possibly talk the Shearer's out of black windows, do a teal green on the windows as opposed to black.
- Rosen: I do not want to be presumptive but are we at a point where we can get a conditional approval.
- Blackburn: I think that we're too far away to give a conditional. You have made a lot of progress and it is much closer to French Eclectic than Georgian; What Jeanette said is a good idea but, that is going to require us to see the colors. If you want a darker window or a colored window or mortar rub, and cleaning up some of the window details here
- Whitson: I would like to add that those times where you have seen us do something on conditional, it is the second time on a house, and while this is your third time here, this is our first time to see this particular house design.
- Rankin: I think that this has come a long way, and even in your introduction you mentioned French Eclectic discussing the roof pitch. Changing the style to French Eclectic opens you up to being able to use the French casement windows and maybe even a double steel door.
- Blackburn: I would like to add, study the French Eclectic style, you have more flexibility on the windows with French Eclectic, the top windows also need work.
- Whitson: We will need to see a sample of the shingle.
- Rankin: Bring us a brick sample as well. The more information that you can bring to us on the brick, colors, shingles, details on the cornice, can help to expedite the process.

No Public Comment

Motion to defer: Duke Second: Whitson

No Board Discussion

Vote to defer: All aye.

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for 4501 Alcott/Vintage South LLC, (21121) 438 Lynwood Blvd., to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved December 14, 2021.
 - Building Official Patterson: This item has been deferred.
3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Blue Sky Properties (22011) 510 Park Hill, to construct a new single-family home. The demolition of existing home was approved April 2021.

Presentation

Chris Goldbeck architect with P. Shea Designs and Anthony Tavikoli with Blue Sky Properties

Goldbeck began by noting that the Belle Meade historic resources survey identifies two main classically inspired styles that were present in the

first half of the 20th century, Neo-classical and Colonial Revival and stating the differences between the two. Goldbeck noted that the historic resources survey stated that Colonial Revival designs, reflect restraint, simplicity, symmetry, and order; the three main subtypes of Colonial Revival architecture are identified as Georgian Revival, Federal Revival and Dutch Colonial Revival. This is in keeping with what the Field Guide describes as the subtypes of Colonial Revival architecture. There are three main subtypes in Belle Meade Georgian Revival, Federal Revival and, Dutch Colonial Revival, and sometimes there would be some crossover between the subtypes. Goldbeck noted that this is a feature of Colonial Revival architecture.

The home at 510 Park Hill is designed in the Colonial Revival style, sub-type Georgian Revival, with some influences from Dutch Colonial Revival architecture. The Georgian revival features would be a story and a half massing, a first floor with three simple dormers above, flanking chimneys on the front, louvered shutters, nine over nine windows on the first floor and six over six windows on the second floor. There is a flush rake at the gables and a decorative cornice, with both crown molding and dental molding. The full width front porch with the curved roof above is more of a Dutch Colonial Revival influence.

Using inspirational photos and the plans, Goldbeck went over the changes in the massing and setbacks; the dormers were scaled down and simplified and the roof pitch of the dormers was adjusted, pointing out changes to the rear elevation and the addition of an offset where the materials are changing as well as changes to the number of windows, their placement and size. Goldbeck noted that they would like to add skylights for additional light.

- Duke: What is the offset on the windows on the side elevation? Is there a staircase?
- Goldbeck: Yes there is. The landing is half-way between the first and second floor, the window nine feet in height, the windowsill would be a foot off the landing.
- Blackburn: What are the materials?
- Goldbeck: The materials will be stone.
- Blackburn: What is the stone?
- Tavikoli: It is a full bed, grey stone, which is what we used at 715 Lynwood. I would like to use a veneer version of the stone on the sides. This is what was used on Walnut Lane.
- Blackburn: We did not approve veneer; we require full bed.
- Tavikoli: I am sorry, I thought it had been approved, at least that is what I was told.
- Blackburn: It wasn't presented as a veneer.
- Tavikoli: We will do full bed stone all the way around.
- Whitson: I want to say that you have done a nice job implementing the comments from last month, it is a big improvement.
- Rankin: Can you provide the details on the front door, is it a generic drawing block? Or is there an idea of what the front door will be?
- Goldbeck: It is a generic style drawing block.
- Whitson: What is the height of the door?
- Goldbeck: It is a 9-foot door.

- Blackburn: Talk to us about the pickets and the size of the columns.
- Goldbeck: The rail is a 3 6-inch wood rail. To Tavikoli, do you have a way you like to construct your rails?
- Tavikoli: I don't know if the rail is necessary, we can put it in or take it out. I think we are within the height requirement to be without the rail.
- Rankin: If you are at 30 inches, I would eliminate it if you can. If you have to have it, keep the details of the railing simple, square pickets.

No Public Comment

Motion to approve with stipulation that all stone is full bed stone:

Whitson Second: Rankin

Board Discussion

- Blackburn: Are you grading it down, or is this (elevation) representative of the down grade?
- Goldbeck: It is the natural grade.
- Whitson: I do like the flower beds, and they tie into the foundation.
- Chairman Wall: The motion is to approve with the stipulation that all stone is full bed stone.

Vote to approve with the stipulation that all stone is full bed stone:

All aye.

4. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Joel Lyons (22012) 626 Royal Oaks Place (Property of Conservation) for demolition of existing home and construct a new single-family home.

Presentation

Preston Shea, architect P. Shea Designs

Shea began with revisions based on the comments by the board at the February 8, 2022 meeting.

Shea noted the following changes:

1. Raised the front grade
2. Continue brick band on the first-floor level
3. Embellish front entry with a timber awning and style specific front doors, which will be mahogany wood doors
4. Reduce the depth of the overhang
5. Window headers at arches will be flush brick
6. Raised the grade line 16-18 inches
7. Mirrored the windows on the far right to the mirrors on the far left

- Whitson: And there is going to be a large mass in between? I'm not sure that's an improvement.
- Shea: I could add closed shutters in the center.
- Whitson: Do the windows need to remain that close to the gutter on the right side?
- Shea: I could omit the outer two and keep the four in the middle.
- Duke: Would they be centered off the hip?
- Shea: They are not perfectly centered; it would require complete reconfiguration of the interior space to achieve perfect symmetry.
- Blackburn: It does not look good from the outside.
- Poe: And this is Spanish Revival?
- Shea: That is correct.
- Chairman Wall: Did you get clarification on the availability of roof tiles?
- Shea: They are still backed up; I do not have any to show you.
- Blackburn: I checked with a couple of roofers, and they said they're not having trouble getting the barrel tiles.
- Duke: You have the concrete?
- Shea: Yes, correct. Crown Tile I believe is the brand.
- Poe: Is there a possibility of keeping the six windows but aligning the middle row with the point of the roof and then placing that whole arrangement into a more balanced formation under that roof. If not it will always look off centered. I know there are interior constraints.
- Shea: Yes there are.
- Poe: This is the floor plan with the two middle windows removed?
- Shea: Yes is. I could add a blank shutter that would be in the center.
- Blackburn: Even with the shutter, the other windows are still off balance.
- Whitson: You could move those away from the corner.
- Shea: These could be moved and add two sets of shutters in the center, and everything would be balanced, and it would appear that there are 6 windows.
- Blackburn: You know you could also do some variety on the window styles, which Spanish Revival will allow.
- Shea: We do have greater variety on the front elevation.
- Duke: What are we looking at downstairs on the first floor?
- Shea: A kitchen bedroom and bath downstairs.
- Whitson: It's four stacked bedrooms where the windows are placed so that there is a bed wall?
- Shea: That is right.
- Whitson: So that is the interior constraints.
- Shea: Yes. We can also move the downspouts if necessary, that way the windows would not be so snug against the downspouts.
- Chairman Wall: Did we not talk at the February meeting about doing this in stucco?
- Blackburn: Yes
- Shea: It was discussed, but I did not leave with the impression that it was a requirement.

- Duke: We talked about stucco or slathered brick.
- Blackburn: I'm looking through the Field Guide Spanish Revival section, and I would revisit your window design on the side, it is too much of the same and if you would vary your windows within the styles, it would help the side elevation.
- Shea: Last month we talked about doing something symmetrical, and I hate to come back next month to redo something different from what we discussed last month. If we get hung up on these windows. Is it a suggestion to vary or required?
- Blackburn: You just don't usually see them lined up like that. On the front elevation, do you see the window variety?
- Shea: Yes, it is balanced and a variety, and I understand what your suggestion is.
- Rankin: You have variety on the front and left elevations, and I think if you can get those on the right side balanced, with it being a non-dominant elevation, add the center shutters, it will bring it to a point where the architectural style is sound.
- Whitson: If the dummy windows could be a different type of window, that would break up the massing but would show some variety.
- Blackburn: That would help, but just not another arched window.

Public Comment

Louise Bryan 4314 Iroquois Avenue inquired if the house located at 618 Royal Oaks Place and this design for 626 Royal Oaks Place were too similar. She stated that she was not against this house but wanted to see what the design experts thought about the similarity in the designs.

Building Official Patterson: presented the houses on the screen for the board.

- Duke: What is the roof on 618?
- Shea: It is a composite.
- Rankin: Noted they are in the same style and pointed out the differences in the two homes.

Public Comment Closed

Motion to approve with the stipulation of the window changes to the right elevation: Poe Second: Whitson

Board Discussion

- Whitson: To Building Official Patterson, are they able to bring the window changes to you for approval?
- Building Official Patterson: Yes they are.
- Duke: I want to make sure of a comment that Farris made at the February meeting about the arch, did you resolve that?
- Shea: He wanted detail on the arch over the window, and we have changed how that will be done and the lines will be clean.

- Blackburn: And what did you decide on materials? Is it painted brick or stucco?
- Chairman Wall: It is painted brick.
- Blackburn: We will need to see the brick, we asked that of a previous presentation today, and we will need to see this as well.
- Duke: Can the brick be wrapped into the approval?
- Blackburn: We need the paint color as well, and roof color.
- Shea: The brick will be pewter; we are going for the tones that are on the home at 601 Belle Meade Blvd. in our inspirational photos. This is washed out here, we are looking at a beige based paint, a porpoise/darker brown for trim, the windows will be bronze. The roof is in the brown family.
- Whitson: You will have piece of that tile which Building Official Patterson will approve.
- Shea: Yes, we will submit that to Mr. Patterson.
- Whitson: If he (Patterson) has any issues he can bring that back to the full board.
- Building Official Patterson: We are looking at the brick, the paint, the roof tile. I would prefer the board to approve that.
- Blackburn: We need to see the brick with the paint on it and sample of the roof tile.
- Rankin: I am concerned about the logistics of bringing in a sample of the painted brick. The brick boards are borrowed from the brick yard, they will not let you paint those. I'm not going to keep 48 different painted bricks in my office for every project I do for the next 25 years. I think in the way we have addressed in the past is that there will be a sample board on the site. I think it is beyond what we are asked to do to make site visits and review colors.
- Duke: My point is there are different types of brick. It would be nice to have the type of brick and how it is going to perform.
- Rankin: Can we approve the brick sample and the color palette?
- Whitson: I agree with Mr. Rankin, the massing is correct, the architecture style is correct. I would like for him to be able to move forward with his project. These are design details that are important and need another review. I'm asking, do we hold the entire project up to get those finishing elements reviewed, or can we ask them to come back for approval on those elements and allow them to move forward?
- Blackburn: I have no objection.
- Building Official Patterson: Has the Stormwater plan been approved.
- Shea: It has been submitted.
- Building Official Patterson: You have plenty of time.
- Whitson: I will make an amendment to the motion

Motion to approve, with the stipulation that the brick, paint color, roof material and overall palette is further approved by this board by submittal to the board: Whitson Second: Blackburn Vote: All aye.

Chairman Wall: We will now vote on the main motion as amended.

Vote with the stipulation of the window changes to the right elevation and that the brick, paint color, roof material and overall palette is further approved by this board by submittal to the board: All aye.

New Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Ray Hayles, (22021) 1207 Canterbury Lane, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of home was approved by the Building and Zoning Department for uninhabitable conditions.

Duke: I will recuse myself from this application, I am working on the project.

Chairman Wall: For the record, Mr. Duke is recusing himself, but a quorum still remains.

Presentation

Catherine Sloan, architect

This is a new construction house, a French stone, one and a half story with hip roofs. This is an L shaped house, there will be a pool in the back, but there will not be a separate pool house. It's a mix of mainly stone, with limestone accents around the windows, the trim around the front door, the headers above the windows, and at the arched dormers. There are a few plaster elements around the front door and the side wings of the house. It will be a wood shingle roof, stone chimneys and a stone water table that is continuous around the house. This is a formal house, it is not French Country, it is more a formal European, introducing the limestone is the direction we are heading with that.

Using inspirational photos, Stone provided details on the massing and hip roofs. We are looking at Austin stone in solid grays and creams; the limestone and trim will be similar in color.

Stone stated they are not asking for a variance, that they are within the building envelope and the FAR.

- Rankin: What is the gutter material?
- Stone: Copper. And the wood shingle roof will be a clean look, not a rustic wooden shake.
- Blackburn: What is the horizontal line between the windows?
- Stone: That is limestone, with a bit of profile at the edges. It is essentially a water table like you see a at the base, but higher. There is a consideration that if it is not possible to use the stone that we will use a mortar rub over a brick. The low sloped roofs on the back over the porches will be either flat oil copper or standing seam copper.
- Poe: What is the wall surface inside, is that a Loja area at the back?
- Stone: Yes.
- Whitson: You go through the false front (louvered) door and then there is a wall, is there a garden inside the wall?

- Stone: When you go inside the louvered door you are in a covered porch, not a garden.
- Whitson: So, we are looking at a stone wall on the front and that's just a porch.
- Stone: Yes.

Public Comment

- Charles Thornburg, 1212 Nichol Lane, asked if the Stormwater plan had been approved yet
- Building Official Patterson responded that it had not.
- Thornburg stated that he and his wife Gray had a concern regarding a culvert under the street on Canterbury that empties directly on to 1207 Canterbury, and heavy rains create a small lake at the rear of the property. The concern is that if the flow of the water is changed, that his home will flood.
- Gray Thornburg also spoke to the same concern.
- Chairman Wall: This board has zero accountability or responsibility for stormwater management.
- Building Official Patterson assured the Thornburg's that they are on top of the problem.
- Ray Hayles, owner of 1207 Canterbury addressed the Gray's stating they will do all they can to mitigate the stormwater issue. Hayles also addressed an issue with the building envelope regarding the garage, the setbacks and that the fact that one end of the house looks incomplete because of the setback guidelines.
- Blackburn asked if making the garage end of the house symmetrical would limit the space for the pool equipment.
- Stone stated that was correct.
- Blackburn inquired of Building Official Patterson if changing that would require the BZA's approval.
- Building Official Patterson stated that it would require BZA approval.
- Blackburn: Are you going to ask the BZA to grant an exception? Because if I lived next to the house this not being symmetrical would drive me crazy.
- Building Official Patterson: We can discuss that.
- Whitson: I think there are other things, maybe a window, a potting sink, that could help mitigate the issue.

Public Comment Closed

**Motion to approve as submitted: Whitson Second: Blackburn
Vote: All aye.**

Board Discussion

- Rankin: In the spirit of fairness if the stone is changed to brick do we want to ask to see the brick?
- Chairman Wall: Yes we would need to see the brick.

Vote to approve as submitted: All Aye.

Motion to adjourn: Whitson Second: Duke Vote: All aye.

Meeting adjourned at 5:03 p.m.

Chairman Mal Wall

City Recorder Rusty Terry