



- Deleted window at left elevation

#### **Board Questions and Comments**

- Blackburn: I would like to ask the architectural style?
- Frank: Neo-classical/New traditional
- Duke: Can you show us your inspirational photos for Neo-classical?
- Webb: We used the Field Guide as a reference. There are some eclectic details to this house; we were attempting to get some of that neo-classical look. It has traditional elements, with an eclectic look, as well as modern features. The staircase windows are larger than you will find on a Colonial house and there are different grid patterns, but the Field Guide is what we used for our influence.
- Webb used neighborhood inspirational photos to point out similarities in design, along with design attributes that the Shearer's want on the home.
- Duke asked that Webb use the elevation photos to point out the ten changes that Frank had gone over earlier in the presentation.
- Webb noted the changes made to the plans presented previously to the board.
- Blackburn: I'm looking through my Field Guide on Neo-classical design. Can you tell me why you are calling that Neo-classical? I'm going through some of the hallmarks of a neoclassical house and I'm not seeing them; from the windows to the rooflines, to the gables. I don't really see where it's neoclassical.
- Webb: It wasn't just Neo-classical. We have some symmetry in the center section. There's a little offset with the staircase above the front porch; There are hip roofs, the lower pitch which has colonial elements or influence. The reason we went with Neo-classical/New Traditional is the elements with the Windows. These are just more updated to what people are looking for in their plans. We feel this style covers all the elements of the home.
- Blackburn: One of the things that we have asked is for a pure architectural style. And if you are going to call it a Neo-classical house, it needs to have the hallmarks of a neoclassical house.
- Frank: And can you define what it does not have to make it a Neo-classical house.
- Blackburn: That is not our job. When you present a house to us as Neo-classical than you need to tell us what makes it neoclassical.
- Rosen: Hopefully, we've added some explanation from Webb on what style we have captured, how we classified it may not have hit on the definition quite as much.
- Blackburn: We have to have criteria that when we look at a house, and our guidelines are very clear. I'm just asking for you to tell us what makes it Neo-classical.
- Webb: It is the different elements in the house. With the hip roof, these are still very colonial elements even like on 1206 Nichol Lane as well. It is difficult to define exactly because of the new traditional elements. We are not trying to go modern transitional, but we definitely have some of those elements and it is hard to narrow it down

to just Neo-classical. This is why we called it Neo-classical slash new traditional and to pull those elements as much as we can.

- Frank: I think if you look at our inspirational photos of homes within walking distance.
- Blackburn: We did not approve that house. That was before our criteria was established.
- Frank: If you look at what's in the neighborhood, currently, for me as a neighbor in the community, regardless of the criteria, I think one important thing is what's on the street. What do you see now when you go there? These are all fairly recent projects within walking distance of our address at 1108 Nichol Lane. We do feel that the house that we've proposed for the Shearer's, is in keeping with the mass, and the style of what is there very close to us.
- Whitson: You mentioned that the front porch to the left is going to have black steel doors, Are all of the windows in the house going to be black steel? Can you tell us a little about that, and the colors?
- Webb: The regular windows, will be casement windows; they are Marvin windows, wood aluminum clad black and then the front, side entrance and veranda doors are black steel.
- Farris: Can we see the floor plans.
- Webb: We have custom designed the floor plan as much as we could to fit the parameters of the lot with the setbacks and to make the most sense of where the garage will be located and in laying things out for the pool.
- Duke: Do you have a grading plan?
- Frank: That is in process.
- Duke: I think that is part of the requirement isn't it, Lyle.
- Building Official, Patterson: Yes, it is.
- Webb: I believe the site plans are in the PDF
- Frank: It should be on the previous footprint.
- Building Official, Patterson: This is the previous.
- Frank: It has been in here previously. We were deferred last time and so I've included this update, I did not include that data on this submission, it has not changed. The stormwater plan is with our engineer and is basically complete with the exception of him dropping the footprint and then making sure all of the calculations match.
- Duke: Neo-classical is balanced and in proportion, this seems to go in and out, with rambling windows and the rooflines don't quite line up. Also, some of the inspiration photos you shared were not approved by us, and they depict the reasons this commission was formed.
- Farris: One of the overarching comments from the previous review of this was centered around its style. This does not fall into the category that you submitted to us.
- Webb: It is not straight up Neo-classical, but we've tried to pull in as many of those types of elements as possible.

#### **Public Comment**

- Clea Shearer: I live two blocks away from Nichol Lane on West Tyne. My kids don't understand why we would be moving two blocks away from our

house. Living on Nichol Lane has been a dream of mine since I moved to Nashville. We were out on Halloween this past year and when I saw this lot, I said I have to have it. I will give you symmetrical front door, no porch, whatever you want. We can figure it out. And it will be an honor to live there.

**Public Comment Closed**

**Motion to defer, not an identifiable style:      Blackburn      Second: Whitson**

**Board Discussion:**

- Farris: I struggle with this overall massing and forms. It's complicated. One of the things that a professor drove into my head early in life was editing. I think this needs to be edited. And I think it should be a clear shot at a particular style.
- Rankin: The whole modern take comes up routinely. I don't think the goal of this board is that every house in Belle Meade is a historic reproduction. We are willing to embrace an element of modernism in design. As it comes to styles, I think there are certain things that are timeless. And one of those things has to do with what Ron is talking about, the massing and simplicity of forms. We can then add a modern touch to that with the cleanness and the crispness of the windows. Simplifying that massing goes a long way to creating a timeless elevation.
- Poe: The fact that when we first asked what is the style, everybody had to look at paperwork, you should be able to look right at that elevation and know what that style is. It should have that of an strong identity.

**Vote: All Aye to defer.**

**2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for 4501 Alcott/Vintage South LLC, (21121) 438 Lynwood Blvd., to construct anew single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved December 14, 2021.**

**Presentation**

Andrew Morton with Vintage South offered a thank you to the commissioners and Building Official for the conversation and comments at the December 14, 2021 Historic Zoning Commission meeting. Noting that based on that conversation, they had made significant changes to the home proposed for 438 Lynwood Blvd. Morton stated it is a Spanish revival house, noting that Chris Goldbeck with P. Shea Designs would go through those changes in detail, and Goldbeck would answer questions on the architecture and that he, Morton, would respond to questions on materials.

Goldbeck highlighted the changes made following the December meeting which included:

- Hipped roof forms changed to gable forms to be more in keeping with the style

- Additional offsets were added to both the right and left side elevations
- Eliminated the arched windows in favor of narrower arched windows
- Added more detail and character to the chimney
- The massing on the rear elevation has been broken down
- Eliminated siding on the house
- Reduced the size of the decorative window over the front door
- Roofing will now be concrete round tile, if approved, as clay tiles are difficult to obtain due to supply chain issues.

Morton noted that the first choice for roofing material is the traditional clay tile, but because of the lead time which can be up to 50 weeks, they would use the round concrete tile, if approved, as lead time was only 15 to 17 weeks. We would submit to the Building Official for approval.

- Farris: The crown roof that is shown in the photo here is a concrete tile?
- Morton: Yes, it is a concrete alternative.
- Farris: Is the color shown in your photo, the color that you are proposing.
- We have not finalized the color. However, I prefer the brown shade shown. I would also like to use bronze windows, to stay in that brown shade. The example in the photo has texture and variation to the coloring and is my first choice.
- Duke: Is it true stucco.
- Goldbeck: We are proposing painted brick.
- Whitson: Would you be able to supply a sample of these colors to Lyle?
- Morton: We have tried to get a sample, it is on order, but has not arrived. If we do end up using the concrete tile, we will certainly have a sample for you.
- Duke: Is there a space above the garage?
- Goldbeck: No, these are the base ceiling heights.
- Duke: It seems like the roof pops up, would there be a way to do a hip, you have gables on those, and typically as a house descends it starts to relax.
- Goldbeck: We would be able to do hip forms.

**No Public Comment.**

**Motion to approve, with comment:**                    Farris                    **Second:**                    Duke

**Board Discussion:**

- Blackburn: You did a really nice job cleaning up the front elevation.
- Chairman Wall: Yes, it is a lot better looking house.
- Blackburn: My concern is approving something we haven't seen, and the color combination on these houses is a big part of the identity of this style house. I think the front of the house is really well done, but there are issues on the side that need addressing.

- Duke: I see the stippling and automatically think stucco. This would be a beautiful stucco house or slathered brick.
- Morton: We are not planning bright white brick. It will be more of muted, warmer colors to match the style the house. I will say that if the board requires stucco or mortar rub, our preference would be more mortar rub. And in order to get approval, we'd rather do that tonight. And if it if the entire house doesn't have to be mortar rub, that would be my preference.
- Blackburn: I think it needs to be stucco to be to go with the style of the house. Those elements are so important for this style house.
- Goldbeck: In terms of the question, on colors, is there a precedent for bringing those back to the commission at a later date, when we have more information and the samples, so as not to delay the entire process.
- Duke: For the tile, yes
- Whitson: For the tile and the materials.
- Farris: There are examples of painted brick Spanish style homes in the city, there is a one story on Ellendale.
- Morton: It is my preference to do painted brick. It is not going to be bright white.
- Farris: I think what the commission members are reacting to is that we're worried that the wrong color on the house even painted would be an issue. The house on Ellendale, is probably old, reclaimed brick and it has texture and movement to it, and we would want something in that vein. I would like to see the base below the water table step away from the brick that's above it so that it is more of a true base. Is there a way to center the master bedroom windows over the garage doors?
- Goldbeck: The floorplan has some limitation with the windows.
- Duke: It is a very charming house. I think it's got street appeal and you will see that back garage when you pass by. It is just a suggestion I would say if we could if we could hip that back garage element.
- Blackburn: What you could do to help with that too, is that frequently on these houses you'll see a small rail or wall, that you could add on that lower part where you have the flat roof.
- Rankin: The flat roof connector, is a little jarring. It drops down a full two-story height to that flat and to Gavin's point it pops back up over the garage. If there was a way to soften that transition a bit.
- Whitson: I disagree with that. If you look at the rear elevation, all the gables are very consistent.
- Morton: My preference will be the gables.
- Whitson: I understand that when we are looking at it two dimensionally, it does look like it's joined, but to me it is a good repetition of the roof elements.
- Rankin: I think I would be okay with the gable on the back, but I still wonder about that transition between the two.

- Blackburn: You could do a little rail on it; it would make it a little less jarring.
- Farris: In the interest of time, I think we could summarize our approval. And if we want to include a discussion about the roof section. they can proceed forward.
- Blackburn: Could we ask them to bring back materials?
- Whitson: We could approve it, with materials to be reviewed.
- Blackburn: Including paint color.
- Morton: Do we need to bring materials if it is a clay tile roof?
- Whitson: Yes, we want to see the colors.
- Blackburn: Yes, those colors vary, and could you bring us the paint color for the brick and the brick?
- Whitson: Or let us know if you are doing a slathered brick.

**Motion to approve with following conditions: applicant will submit final materials be it roof, brick, stucco, they will submit alternate suggestions for the flat roof section between the garage and the main body of the house. They will study the aligning of the three windows over the garage doors, and the addition of stepping out the water table, half-inch to inch: Farris**

**Second: Duke**

**Vote: All aye.**

#### **New Business**

1. **The application for a certificate of appropriateness for BlueSky Properties (22011) 510 Park Hill, to construct a new single-familyhome. The demolition of existing home was approved April 2021.**

#### **Presentation**

Chris Goldbeck with P. Shea Design, and Anthony Tavikoli with Blue Sky Properties

Goldbeck stated that the house be proposed is in the Colonial Revival style. Using inspiration photos of historic homes located in the United States (none of the homes are local), he provided examples and details of what they were proposing for the home in design and materials.

For the neighborhood inspiration photos, they used the homes to the north of Parmer Park, up to Deer Park Drive, and corresponding lots on the other side of the street for their context. Goldbeck noted that there is an eclectic mix, most noted in the newer homes, while the older homes in the area tended to be more Colonial Revival or Georgian. Goldbeck concluded that the lot would support a two-story home, however, they have chosen a one and one-half story home.

#### **Board Questions and Comments:**

- Duke: Have you submitted material samples?
- Tavikoli: We have not. It will be the same stone and roof we did at 715 Lynwood Boulevard.
- Duke: And the style again?
- Tavikoli: Colonial Revival.

- Duke: Do you have any examples of Colonial Revival that have dormers as shown on the front elevation? I'm looking at the Gothic arch in the window.
- Duke: I like the house; it seems the dormers are overpowering the relax feel of the house.
- Goldbeck: Pointed to page and photos in the Field Guide with windows in the style as depicted on the plans.
- Whitson: It looks like there is the body of a stone house on each elevation and then the back of the house becomes solid. Normally when you're changing materials you would have an inset, to help with the massing, and to make sense of why you are changing materials. These are all on the same plane and it just doesn't look correct.
- Goldbeck: After attending the December meeting, I adjusted the design, which includes insets. I have that in handout form if you would like to see those. I am not looking to amend the submittal, but I never expect to be approved on first presentation, so I brought the handouts for feedback.
- Blackburn: I think we have some contradiction with the style with the windows. I would work on cleaning up your windows. I agree with Gavin the dormers are too big and the volume patterns are not correct. You can have a curved window there, but you shouldn't have that volume pattern on the style house. The brick and clapboard and stone combination becomes confusing in the style; I would suggest cleaning that up. How many steps up to this front door and are you doing grading here.
- Goldbeck: There will be grading as there is a pretty good cross slope to the lot. We don't have the actual grading plan yet.
- Duke: I believe a grading plan is part of the requirements, Lyle?
- Building Official, Patterson: Yes.
- Whitson: One of the things that we have found is that people will do an overall plan, and you are saying you are not expecting to pass, but we also can't then be designing the house for you. It does need to be at a point where you are presenting a plan that will pass or else we are all wasting our time here. We can discuss some more general things, but there has been enough that has been said today that you need to take another pass at it, and we are not going to go through specifically telling you everything that needs to be done.
- Tavikoli: If I could step in for a minute, I'm going to try to wind this up. If you feel like there are some big things that we need to do, we would love to hear about it. I know that Chris said we don't expect to pass on the first time and that's just from history. I am not trying to insult anybody, but our objective is to be passed first time, every time, but we know that's not going to happen. If there are other items that you can pinpoint without spending too much time, we surely would appreciate it.
- Blackburn: I think we said materials, dormers, architectural style, and grading plan. Those are all pretty specific. And I think just go back and be true to an architectural style once again.
- Duke: The dormer style is a little hostile for this style of house. The chimneys concern me a bit; I'm not sure what the side shoulder thing is in that style. Colonial usually has good balance with a bit of weight



to them, and then you got one in the back that looks like straight rocket that goes up with no definition. Change that to be in keeping with the style that you're doing that would help too.

- Blackburn: Look at the windows, the windows on the back don't match the front in terms of style. Style, window package all needs to be revisited.
- Farris: The most successful piece is the front elevation; where it loses me is the detail and dormers. The big back dormer doesn't seem to fit, and I also agree with the Gavin's comment on the chimneys.
- Rankin: Talking to materials, I don't want to belabor the point about stone brick and siding. I like the presentation of a stone house, as I think about how to start combining materials, changing materials around the house; start to build a narrative such as this is a stone house that at some point had an addition, I would stick with stone and siding or brick and siding but the combination of all three starts to get confusing. You've got a stone mass in the middle, you've got a brick mass on the side, and a lap siding mass on that side. I would try to pull that into a more believable narrative.

**Public Comment:**

- Larry Brown: I live at 514 Park Hill, and I am an architect by the way. This is the first time I have seen the plans and I had a couple of thoughts. I like the sweeping down front porch, the roof pitch on the dormers doesn't match the roof pitch on the rest of the house, and curious about the gable that comes off of the sweep.
- Whitson: I would actually agree with that statement, with the roof sloping out why would there be a pitch on it?
- Goldbeck: If it were flush across the front?
- Whitson: It would be simpler.
- Rankin: Simplicity would go well with the style of the house.
- Chairman Wall: Is there anyone else who would like to speak
- Wesley Coker: Shared concern over the windows, and agreed with the statement about the sloping of the roof. Stating the house would be better if it were more harmonic.

**Public Comment Closed.**

**Motion to defer:**                    Blackburn                    **Second:**                    Duke

**Board Discussion:**

- Duke: It is headed in the right direction; it just needs some tweaking.
- Blackburn: Thank you too, to the people in the community, we appreciate it when neighbors come and share their thoughts and have their input and that helps us process and work better.
- Goldbeck: Is the motion on the floor for 30 or 60 days.
- Duke: 60 days.
- Whitson: But you can come back in 30 days.

**Vote:**                    All aye to defer.

**Board member Rene Poe left at approximately 4:48 p.m.**

**2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Joel Lyons (22012) 626 Royal Oaks Place (Property of Conservation) for demolition of existing home and construct a new single-family home.**

Presentation: Preston Shea, architect at P. Shea Design  
Shea noted the home at 626 Royal Oaks Place was built in 1952 and that Royal Oaks Place consists of ranch houses and two-story infill homes. As set by Belle Meade guidelines, this home is not a property of significance in design or workmanship, not meeting any of the criteria that would prevent demolition.

No Public Comment on Demolition.

**Motion to approve demolition: Farris            Second            Rankin**

**Board Discussion:**

- Whitson: I would agree that it falls outside of the criteria of what we have set for preservation.
- Farris: I would agree.
- Chairman Wall: I would agree.

**Vote: All aye.**

Presentation for construction of new home  
Shea shared inspiration photos, noting that they looked at both the City of Belle Meade as a whole and the Royal Oaks neighborhood and have chosen a Spanish Revival style home. Shea pointed out the location of the lot, noting the other homes are two-story in massing, comparable to the height of the home they are proposing. Shea reviewed the city guidelines on the Spanish Revival style, stating that their design met those qualifications, contending that the home embraced all the items except for a gable roof. He stated that the style often includes a gable roof, but it is not a must.

Shea noted they wanted to do a white, not stark white, painted brick, and concrete tile roofing material; noting that they would provide samples of the materials and color, including the windows.

Shea noted that on the elevation there was an error, and they would be using limestone over the front door, and they would be using cedar on the left side elevation (the elevation indicated artist stone and painted hardy siding respectively).

**Board Questions and Comments:**

- Duke: On the right-side elevation, it looks as if the windows didn't shift with the elevation. It seems that it's driven by the room, more than it is the exterior elevation. It is the street view, is there any way to make that more in proportionate to the elevation.
- Shea: I would suggest doing so by removing the two furthest back windows, and then have two in the center.
- Duke: So, off the centerline you would have those balanced?

- Shea: On the main mass, we see three sets of windows I would omit the ones furthest back on the right and keep the two.
- Blackburn: They are not centered.
- Shea: I think we could easily shift that pair six inches.
- Duke: What is happening in the space above the garage, where it will now be cedar? It seems like an odd profile.
- Shea: I initially used that shape to pick up on the shed on the front elevation and used the cedar so there wasn't so much brick. I would be happy to hip that.
- Duke: The shed on the front has brick on the side, seems that it could also hip or brick in there and not have the other introduction to simplify that.
- Blackburn: You don't usually see multiple materials. Another question I have is on the right side elevation, on the back porch, the triple windows don't really fit the style, it looks like doors.  
Shea: It is three French doors, one would be operable.
- Duke: Is there a reason you are doing a deck there as opposed to solid concrete, to continue the grip around.
- Whitson: Yes, if that's a deck, it needs a solid bottom to it.
- Shea: I can bring that in.
- Duke: For this style of house, something finished as opposed to a structure on top of the deck.
- Blackburn: On the front elevation I notice the water table does not go all the way across.
- Shea: With all the ins and out's I did not do traditional detail. I actually couldn't find examples of this style with a water table in Belle Meade.
- Duke: So, you have part of a water table?
- Blackburn: We need to commit one way or the other.
- Shea: I would prefer to omit a water table.
- Whitson: Will there be any grading to the right? That is a large area.
- Shea: We are not showing any grading at this point. What you see in the elevation is in line with the natural grade. We will grade the rear quarter up as you get to the back porch.
- Duke: I think that is a requirement.
- Whitson: The reason you don't see that grading on many of the homes in Belle Meade would be the shrubbery in front of the home, which isn't sitting that far off the ground. The house is more married to the landscape and topography, it is a comforting element.
- Blackburn: The door to the right appears to just be floating out there.
- Shea: We could also continue that water table around the right side to break it up.
- Blackburn: I agree with Jeanette, that is a lot of space. So why do you have it sitting up so high? How many steps up with to the front door?
- Shea: There is a cross slope, that is about thirty inches. We are cutting in a bit on the left, and then the grade slopes down and we are just more exposed on that side.
- Blackburn: Do you have a basement?
- Shea: We do not.

- Whitson: I think there needs to be some grading.
- Shea: There is only 18 inches or so of grading that we can do before we start covering the access to the crawlspace. We could do that though.
- Blackburn: Are the front doors double doors, glass, or wood? The front doors on these homes are usually interesting like a wood door but maybe they're arched, or they have an interesting design on them. That's one of the distinctive characteristics of the style.
- Duke: How far is the overhang over the front?
- Shea: Those are 30 inches.
- Farris: I would like to see the detail on how the brick is going to make its way around the arch. Left to the vises of a brick mason you will end up with a train wreck.
- Blackburn: Will you have exposed rafter tails?
- Shea: Yes, we will.
- Blackburn: How big is the overhang?
- Shea: It is about 30 inches.
- Blackburn: I think that's a little big. Why did you go 30 inches?
- Shea: Some of the examples we saw had fairly large overhangs.
- Farris: 30 inches is okay.

**No Public Comment**

**Motion to defer:**                    Blackburn                    **Second:**                    Farris

**Board Discussion**

- Whitson: He is headed in the right direction; he needs to address those items we have indicated.
- Farris: I don't think we had a real decision on the water table, and I think it needs a water table.
- Duke: I would agree.
- Wall: And you want that water table to go around to the right side.
- Whitson: The water table should be continuous.
- Blackburn: The front stoop is big for this style house, frequently the doors are recessed, and I think that should be visited as well.
- Duke: More detail is needed on the front door, and the right-side elevation window issue needs to be cleaned up and the back garage, a revision on the painted hardy, and the deck should be a solid surface.
- Blackburn: We need to see the materials.
- Duke: And we need a grading plan, I believe that is a requirement, isn't it Lyle.
- Building Official, Patterson: Yes.
- Rankin: We also discussed seeing more detail on the arched windows.

**Vote:**                    All aye to defer.

**3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Cullen Roberts (22021) 201 Scotland Place (Property of Conservation) for demolition of existing home and construct a new single-family home.**

Presentation

Ron Farris representing owners Cullen and Kerry Roberts  
Farris stated that the Roberts' are asking the Board to consider the demolition of an existing residence and the design of a new residence rendered in the Colonial Revival style. From research the original residence was constructed around 1974 though with numerous additions, we're guessing between three and five, it's hard to tell. With the aid of photos, Farris pointed out what he believed to be the original structure and where the additions are located. He noted that the front porch is not original to the structure. Farris stated that he did not believe that the home possessed any evidence of millwork detail or style that's worthy of maintaining. Our study also shows that most of the windows have been replaced with nondescript contemporary windows. Though habitable, we do not feel that it is an identifiable style and offers no significant contribution to the city.

- Whitson: And 1974 is the original construction date?
- Farris: Yes
- Duke: I do not see any significance.

**No Public Comment**

**Motion to approve demolition: Whitson            Second:            Duke  
Vote:            All aye.**

Presentation for construction of new home

Using site drawings, Farris pointed out that the lot, at the corner of Scotland Place and Parmer Avenue, had been before the Municipal Planning Commission to request, and was approved, an allowable building envelope. With site drawings, Farris noted the existing building envelope, which is unbuildable, and the building envelope that was approved by the Planning Commission, noting the new setback lines on the lot. Farris also noted that the Planning Commission had given the latitude to determine the orientation of the new home, and the new home will front Parmer Avenue, the old home faces Scotland Place.

Farris provided photos, showing the overall context of the homes in the neighborhood, in the area of Park Hill and Bellevue Drive, describing the overall architectural fabric in the vicinity as eclectic with a variety of styles. The Roberts desire their home to fit into the existing architectural fabric of the neighborhood, in both style and scale, and inspiration photos provided by them leaned toward the Colonial Revival style, which is a common style throughout Belle Meade.

Using the Field Guide to American Houses, Farris noted the identifying features of a Colonial Revival home and detailed the features of the proposed home that qualify as a Colonial Revival style. Farris noted they will be seeking approval for a pool from the Board of Zoning Appeals, and that the landscape plan, from Landscape Architect, Jason Gabbard was available for reference if needed.

**Board Questions and Comments:**

- Duke: Is there a grading plan?
- Farris: Yes.
- Blackburn: Is this a spec house?
- Farris: No. The home is for Kerry and Cullen Roberts. I will go over the materials: windows will be aluminum clad exterior, wood interior; stone will be a full bed stone; painted clapboard wood siding; railings, columns and pilasters will be painted wood; chimney material will be stone; composite shingle roofing material; eaves and cornice will be painted wood; the gutters will be half-round copper.
- Whitson: What color will the exterior aluminum clad windows be?
- Farris: They will be white.
- Duke: On the three top windows, if you try to close the shutters there will be a big gap.
- Blackburn: What about your shutter color?
- Farris: We have not picked it yet, but I think it'll be a contrasting color.
- Blackburn: What about the center shutters that will not cover the windows? That's what Gavin and I are both concerned about.
- Farris: I will have those scaled so that they will cover the windows.
- Duke: We will put that in comments.
- Blackburn: The ridgeline seems high.
- Duke: What is the pitch?
- Farris: I believe it is 10 and 12 which isn't unusually large for the style. We did consider the ridgeline of the house next door; Farris used a drawing of the new construction next door, to show they are in line with the contextual components of that home, which was recently approved by the HZC.
- Duke: Can you explain the flat roof bay on the left side elevation?
- Farris: I looked at doing a slope on the roof.
- Duke: How far does it project?
- Farris: About eight to nine inches, and that is why I did not slope the roof.
- Blackburn: What about to the far right on the left elevation there are no windows
- Farris: That is the garage in the background, I could introduce a window there.
- Blackburn: I think it needs something there. It doesn't necessarily have to be a window, but a faux window with shutters over it, you will see that driving down the street.
- Rankin: Are the two smaller windows to the left and right at the front door centered underneath the second-floor windows.
- Farris: Yes, they are intended to be centered.
- Blackburn: This house really needs a shake roof.
- Whitson: I also believe this house would benefit from a cedar shake roof.

**Public Comment**

Wesley Coker, resident at 215 Scotland Place, offered comments on the house and the orientation of the house.

Beatrice Isenhour, resident at 204 Scotland Place, voiced her concern over the size of the new homes being built.

Cullen Roberts: owner of the new home proposed for 201 Scotland Place, thanked the neighbors, advised the board and Farris that the roof would be cedar shake

- Whitson: You have accomplished a beautiful home, and this is an example of creating an abundance of living space and remains below the maximum on height. As far as height and size, if this is a concern it should be addressed to the city commissioner's, I encourage you to let them know your concern.

Rankin and Blackburn both also commented to Whitson's statement, sharing with those in attendance that the HZC must work within the guidelines it has been given, and that concerns about the standards should be shared with the city commissioners.

**Public Comment Closed**

**Motion to approve the house with changes to shutters, windows on the right-side elevation and the addition of a window on the right side:**

Whitson      Second:      Duke

**Board Discussion**

- Blackburn: It is a lovely house and I think it will fit in very well. And I think that the shake roof is going to make a big difference. How big is the lot and how many square feet in the house?
- Farris: The lot is 28,114 square feet; the allowable footprint is 3,374 square feet and we are maximizing our footprint. The heated and cooled area is probably hovering around 5,000 square feet.
- Whitland: The ceiling heights are very reasonable.
- Duke: The ceiling height is nine-feet seven inches on the main floor and nine-feet one inch on the second floor, which overall is thirty-two feet, when you could max it at 40 feet. The house has some real character, and it blends into the neighborhood.

**Vote: All aye.**

The meeting adjourned at 5:58 p.m.

---

Chairman Mal Wall

---

City Recorder Rusty Terry