

**Minutes
Historic Zoning Commission
City Of Belle Meade
September 14, 2021**

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Mal Wall at 3:00pm.

Board members present

Mal Wall Ron Farris Charlie Rankin Gavin Duke Rene Poe

Staff members present

Beth Reardon, City Manager and temporary City Recorder
Lyle Patterson, Building Official and Assistant City Manager
Doug Berry, City Attorney

Consideration of Minutes:

Minutes of the regularly scheduled meeting held August 10, 2021.

Motion to Approve: Farris Second: Duke Vote: All aye

Old Business: NONE

New Business:

1. **The application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Steve Cates (2109), 407 Westview Ave., to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing was approved January 12, 2021.**

Presentation:

Ron Farris, architect, presenting on behalf of Steve and Lynn Cates along with landscape architect Ann Daigh to discuss the style of the new residence, which will be designed in the arts and crafts style. Ron distributed a handout summarizing the characteristics of arts and crafts style homes and included pictures of several residences built in the arts and crafts style.

He then displayed site plans and elevations for the proposed home at 407 Westview. Farris stated there is quite an eclectic mix of styles on this street, notably two recent new homes at 423 and 425 Westview that exhibit characteristics similar to the design of 407 Westview. They are not symmetrical, and have an eclectic mix of gables, roof forms and materials. The 407 lot has a fair amount of slope from left to right and slopes almost 20 feet in the back portion of the lot. This type of architectural style embraces sites like this that allows front elevation massing that steps down and follows the nature of the slope of the lot. Broadly, the massing consists of both gables and hips and shed and dipped dormers and typical roof geometry found in the arts and crafts style.

Proposed use of materials will be similar to the house located on Jackson Blvd., specifically: similar exterior stone, painted wood clapboard siding approximately 7-inches in spread, metal or steel front door, aluminum clad windows (Marvin or Sierra Pacific brand), window sills will be aluminum clad. There is no brick; stone will be 4-inch full bed thickness. Railing, columns and pilasters will be wrought iron or painted wood; chimney will be stone to match other exterior stone, copper half-found gutters.

Board Questions/Comments:

- Rankin - I have a question on the small arched top window in front, with curved muntin bar pattern. Should it have a straight or diamond pattern, which is more in keeping with the arts and crafts style?

- Farris - I can easily take that to a crosshair or diamond pattern, but would like to defer to the owners to give input.
- Duke - on the double peaked dormer, how does that drain?
- Farris - there will be a slight valley between the double hip that will drain forward. I've done it before, and it does work.
- Wall - what do the red lines on the plan represent?
- Farris - the average natural grade at the rear. We will be asking BZA for a slight variance in height in the rear only.
- Rankin - is the lap siding real wood or fiber?
- Farris - it is real wood and will be painted.
- Wall - I am concerned that the front elevation will appear to be too tall from the street, due to the slope of the lot.
- Farris - I looked at grade lines with Ann Daigh, landscape architect. The far left side is the issue. Ann helped set the FFE and as we dropped it down, we ended up retaining into the far left side a fair amount.

Public Question/Comments: None

Motion to close public hearing: Duke **Second:** Rankin **Vote:** All aye

Board Discussion/Findings:

- Duke - This is a nice house, well proportioned and balanced.
- Wall - It's well done, but I am still a little worried about the height.
- Rankin - I am not very worried from a scale standpoint and I think it will read well from the street.

Motion to Approve the Application: Rankin **Second:** Poe **Vote:** All Aye

2. The application for an amendment to a Certificate of Appropriateness for Catalyst Builders, (21092), 1206 Nichol Lane, for a change in roofing materials from cedar shake to asphalt. Approval of original CoA was given May 2021 under the applicant Castle Homes.

Presentation:

Billy Frank of Catalyst Builders stated that at the May meeting, the owners committed to use a cedar shake shingle on the proposed home. However, they like the appearance of two asphalt shingles that are an upgrade from the typical asphalt shingle, one being a shake asphalt look and the other a slate asphalt look. Mr. Frank displayed a sample board of the two types of shingles and stated the owners feel these fit in with the design of the house. The owners request approval to make this change.

Board Questions/Comments:

- Gavin Duke - Are there any changes to the architectural elevations at all?
- Mr. Frank - No

Public Question/Comments: None

Motion to close public hearing: Farris **Second:** Rankin **Vote:** All aye

Board Discussion/Findings:

- Wall - Does anyone have a problem with either shingle?
- Farris - I do not, but I have a question as to which shingle on the sample board is being referenced specifically?

- Mr. Frank - I believe the owners will choose the slate look with a mid-gray color.
- Farris - the board members would like a final decision today, if possible.
- Mr. Frank - I would be happy to update Lyle Patterson of the owners' final decision if the board agrees.

Motion to Approve as submitted, with the applicant notifying the board of their final decision: Farris Second: Rankin Vote: All Aye

Other Business: None

Motion to adjourn: Duke Second: Rankin All aye

Meeting adjourned at 3:32pm

Chairman Mal Wall

City Manager Beth Reardon