

**Minutes
Historic Zoning Commission
City Of Belle Meade
October 12, 2021**

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Mal Wall at 3:00pm.

Board members present

Mal Wall Jeannette Whitson Gavin Duke Bunny Blackburn

Staff members present

Beth Reardon, City Manager
Lyle Patterson, Building Official and Assistant City Manager
Rusty Terry, City Recorder Doug Berry, City Attorney

Consideration of Minutes:

Minutes of the regularly scheduled meeting held September 14, 2021.

Motion to Approve: Farris Second: Duke Vote: All aye

Old Business: NONE

Chairman Wall stated the Other Business item will be moved to the front of the meeting due to the presenter, Mr. Thomason, having a time conflict.

Other Business:

- 1. Power Point Presentation by Phil Thomason of Thomason & Associates, updating the Belle Meade Historic Resources Survey Report (Cataloging of Homes) .**

Mr. Thomason reported the purpose of the project was to update the 490 properties previously surveyed and also survey 272 additional properties built between circa 1950 and 1970, for a total of 762 properties documented. The survey team left questionnaires with property owners and took several photos of each residence. The neo-classical and colonial revival style of homes were favored by residents in the 1930s as well as architects such as Emmons Woolwine, Donald Southgate, Edwin Keeble, and Henry Hibbs. Other styles popular were Tudor revival, French eclectic, Dutch colonial, but only a few Craftsman bungalows, Spanish influenced styles, and contemporary mid-century modern homes. In addition to houses, photos were also taken to document and inventory garages and outbuildings, dry stack stone walls and other historical landscape features such as the Jackson Blvd. bridge. Many properties have retained the integrity of their design, others have not.

Mr. Thomason stated there are two areas in Belle Meade that could possibly qualify for a National Register Historic District: the Belle Meade Park area of approx. 95 homes and 45 homes in the Lynwood Boulevard/Terrace area. The City should have public meetings with these residents to discuss this and get feedback. There are no requirements for additional overlays and this is an honorary designation that recognizes these areas have architectural and historical significance and should be preserved. There are only two properties in Belle Meade listed in the National Register: the Belle Meade Historic Site and the Belle Meade Apartments.

There is a survey report that contains guidelines in a narrative form with accompanying photographs and graphics to illustrate the design guideline principles. The survey reference will include age of properties, define architectural styles, identify known architects or notable persons and growth and development of Belle Meade since 1906. This is all in digital form and

will be hosted on the Tennessee Historical Commission Property Viewer website in about 4-5 months from now.

Board Questions/Comments:

- Farris - What is the process to obtain community feedback?
- Thomason - Put all information on the website and publicize, as well as have a series of public meetings, especially for those residents who have homes in the areas that could qualify for the National Register Historic District.
- Whitson - Thank you for this comprehensive survey. Is it correct that you are saying the residences in the areas that could be designated for the National Register would not have any additional requirements or strict standards to adhere to when making changes to their properties? And if so, then the HZC would not be required to treat property owners in these areas any differently than property owners outside of these designated areas? It has always been the intention of this Commission to treat properties in Belle Meade as a whole and apply the rules evenly to everyone. Having these two areas designated for the National Register would be a great honor, and we do not want to deter this from happening by making it more difficult for these property owners to come before us.
- Thomason - I agree. The National Register designation does not mean you must assign different standards to these areas.
- Blackburn - How did you choose these two areas as eligible for the National Register?
- Thomason - We look for a concentration of properties that retain sufficient architectural and historical integrity that is considered contributing.

New Business:

1. **The application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Paul Murfree, (21101) 621 Westview Ave., for a partial demo and exterior alteration, addition to existing home.**

Presentation:

Ron Farris, Architect, and Wade Rick, Landscape Architect presented the plans for 621 Westview. Farris stated this property was slated for demolition by the previous owners and construction of new home was approved by the BZA. However, the project did not move forward, and the Murfree's purchased the residence with the goal of renovating and expanding it, while preserving its history. Farris give a brief account of the original owners and stated the residence was designed in the colonial style, but it has been dramatically modified and altered on numerous occasions over the years. He pointed out on the display screen the parts of the home that were added on to or altered. Most windows have been replaced, and are not in the original style of the house. The right and left wings have been added on to, and not in the original style of the home. The Murfree's would like to renovate the residence with improvements that reflect a more neo-classical style, which is prevalent in the city.

The proposed front elevation includes improvements to the front porch and the two side wings, making them more consistent with the desired neo-classical style. The rear of the residence will also have proper balance and symmetry introduced by aligning the windows and keeping them in proper scale.

Farris pointed out other homes on Westview (e.g. 625, 617) that have a neo-classical style, emphasizing that the proposed Murfree home will maintain harmony with the neighborhood. Materials proposed include a tone-on-tone soft white painted brick, windows clad in soft white, cedar shake roof, dark

(Belle Meade black) painted shutters and authentic hardware. Railings will be metal or iron painted soft white, copper gutters and downspouts. A pool and pool house is planned and will be presented to the BZA, along with requests for necessary retaining wall variances. The proposed house is within height requirements for the front, side and rear.

Board Questions/Comments:

- Blackburn - please speak to the different window styles shown on the front elevation.
- Farris - They follow the neo-classical style and are rendered in a classically paned proportion. The oval center window is replicated in the two side wings for balance and symmetry.
- Duke - Are the windows in the same location or did they change?
- Farris - Proposed windows to the left and right of the front door are actually doors that will replace existing double-hung windows. In the original home, we believe these were French doors. The two windows above the front door are being replaced with one center window.
- Whitson - please address the roof massing.
- Farris - there are breaks in the roof at both the left and right wings.
- Blackburn - what is on the left side of the house, lattice?
- Farris - Yes, this is lattice on both the left and right sides, where ivy will be planted to climb up, in and around the lattice.
- Blackburn: What is the square footage of the proposed home?
- Farris: Livable area is in the high 7,000s, but current home is 4-5 thousand. The lot can take almost double that amount.
- Duke: It was stated that the lot drops almost a story and a half. How is this being managed, by building up the grade?
- Farris: multiple retaining walls are proposed and will go before the BZA.

Public Question/Comments:

- Peter Zimmerman, 600 Jackson Blvd. - Asked if there was a plan for stormwater engineering. He currently receives runoff from this property and would like to review the plan.
- Farris - The stormwater plan will be submitted to the city during the design phase.
- Tom Connor, 619 Westview - Concerned with the height of the proposed retaining wall that will be next to his property. Is it going to be 11 feet, 9 inches tall? How will that affect stormwater runoff and what will the wall look like from my viewpoint. It sounds like it will be massive.
- W. Rick - The wall will be screened by landscaping on the downhill side.
- Debbie Pitts - 625 Westview. Same concerns as the other neighbors about drainage and runoff. She built a detention pond years ago, but is not sure it will be sufficient.
- W. Rick - Explained that at the end of the driveway, there is currently a significant and dangerous drop-off that is now camouflaged by heavy vegetation. The plan is to level the driveway somewhat and build a retaining wall behind it to make this safer.
- L. Patterson - Stated this property never had a stormwater plan, so what will be done with this project will be very helpful to all neighbors.

Public Hearing closed by Chairman Wall.

Motion to Approve: Blackburn Second: Whitson

Board Discussion/Findings:

- Blackburn - What is the design on the top of the chimney? Is it brickwork?
- Farris - Yes it is.
- Whitson - I believe it is the existing chimney and not something new.
- Farris - That is correct.
- Blackburn - I like the style; it is very interesting and am glad the color scheme is tonal.
- Whitson - You are taking something that has historical value and working with that and elevating it even more. The proposed changes will make the house more aesthetically pleasing and will make it look as though this house could be the original design.
- Duke - Struggling with the number of window sizes. Also, on the rear elevation, the shutter size does not match the width of the windows.
- Farris - We can address this with a bi-fold or change the proportions.

Motion to Approve the Application with Modification to the rear window shutters: Blackburn Second: Whitson Vote: All Aye

Motion to adjourn: Duke Second: Whitson All aye

Meeting adjourned at 4:28pm

Chairman Mal Wall

City Manager Beth Reardon