

**Minutes
City of Belle Meade
Historic Zoning Commission
November 9, 2021**

Commission members present

Mal Wall, Chairman Gavin Duke Ron Farris
Bunny Blackburn Charlie Rankin Renee Poe

Staff Members Present

Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney
Lyle Patterson, Assistant City Manager & Building Official
Rust Terry, City Recorder

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Mal Wall at 3:00 p.m.

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held November 9, 2021

Motion to approve: Farris Second: Duke Vote: All aye

Old Business: None

New Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Billy Frank (21101) 1108 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved April 13, 2021.

Billy Frank representing Catalyst Builders

For this new construction we were here in March of this year, and got a demolition permit then tabled that design. We have come back with a finished plan and requesting approval. We are requesting no variances. This is a traditional transitional Georgian Colonial. Approximately 7,703 heated and cooled, 8,901 under roof.

The house will be painted brick with siding, where noted and metal roofs where noted. Asphalt or Cedar Shake, probably leaning toward Asphalt shingle. The fireplaces will be all masonry brick, painted as well. The site plan does show a pool, it is optional, but we are not requesting approval of that at this time. I would be happy to answer any questions. Champ Webb is the architect on the house.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Duke: My first question is on Georgian Colonial and I have a hard time seeing inspirational photos that represent this.
- Frank: There should be inspirational photos in the back.
- Duke: Those are all new.
- Blackburn: I'm not familiar with transitional Georgian Colonial.
- Webb: it is modern transitional with black windows, basically Georgian.
- Blackburn: It has to be a true identifiable style and this house does not meet that at all. I'm happy to lend you my book (Field Guide) to see what Georgian features are. One reason this committee was

established was so that we could have homes that would stand the test of time and part of that is having a true and accurate architectural style and in materials.

- Farris: Is this for a spec house or resident build
- Frank: Originally for a residence, then we decided to design what most people seeking a home of this type and size would want.
- Rankin: I'm struggling with its broad composition and proportion to be more specific. The board is not adverse to contemporary or a house that has modern features.
- Frank: How do we take your comments individually and take those to present something that you're going to be comfortable with?
- Blackburn: Start with an identifiable architecture style.
- Frank: Our success has been on a transitional style.
- Duke: Come back with a representative style that you can support in inspirational history and some historic examples in Belle Meade with proportionate balance.
- Frank: I would ask, so we don't continue to burn money and time, can we circulate to you guys so that we don't have to continue to come back.
- Poe: You don't have six different opinions, I think you have different pages of the same chapter. There's a lack of balance and symmetry.
- Blackburn: We spent a lot of time writing our expectations. We are not telling you what architectural style to build, and we are open to different architectural styles. Every point we've made is about architectural style being in agreement. If you have any doubts about it, we always recommend this book, *A Field Guide to American Houses*.
- Frank: So it's okay to use black windows.
- Blackburn: I think it's very trendy, I'm not going to say we are not going to approve a house with black windows. We look at overall house.

No Public Comment

Board Discussion:

Motion to defer: Duke Second: Poe Vote: All aye

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Wilson Sisk (20102) 112 Lynwood Terrace, to construct a new single-family home. This is an empty lot. Demolition of existing home was approved June 8, 2021.

Ron Farris, architect, presented for Wilson Sisk. With my assistance, Wilson is asking the board to consider the design of the new residence rendered in the Tudor style. We don't have to look at demolition.

Pictures of the neighboring residence give insight to the street's character. From Harding to the 3-way stop, this area has a variety of styles, from a mission style house to an Italianate style which is the center picture. Middle top picture is mid-century modern, or ranch. And then we have several Tudors. A variety of character for this section of Lynwood. I think our proposed Tudor style will blend in well with the overall character of this section of Lynwood. According to the Field Guide, which we were just referencing, the Tudor style falls under the category of eclectic houses.

What I've tried to put in these inspiration images is insight to where we are taking our residence. Stone and brick veneer are the prominent exterior veneers. Both are commonly used and mixed with stucco and false half-timber.

The next inspiration file gives a better cross-section of materials. Prominent use of natural stone in a lighter tone variety. Typically, stone is found throughout the base of the home and the stone increases or runs vertical in areas. And then blends in or mixes in with the use of real stucco and false half-timber.

Our client, Wilson Sisk, does not want the stark contrast between stone and dark timbering and the stucco that are in the previous images. He's after more of a tone-on-tone value, a softer palate more in line with the residences on this street.

The lot topography on this is a challenge, it slopes nearly 21 or 22 feet from the center of the lot all the way back.

We want to avoid a front elevation that would require a full story of stairs and help to keep from burying the rear of the residence and the pool terrace into the slope. We came up with a more balanced approach on how we're dealing with the house entry sequence. The solution was to develop a bit of an unexpected entry sequence and still allow for a symmetrical front elevation. Giving one the sense that the elevation could still propose a front door, but the actual front door is around the left side. We are still within the allowable height calculated from average natural grade from the front elevation. We've eliminated the need for extensive retaining walls along the front and tall retaining walls along both front and back. We still have retaining walls and will need review and approval from the board of zoning appeals because they exceed 3 feet. We are well within the building envelope. And the retaining walls along the back are right at the rear setback lines and except for that half-moon shape we're not encroaching our retaining walls to the furthest point back on the rear of the property.

The window manufacturer will be Marvin or Sierra Pacific or equivalent, the window tone and color will be a bronze or lighter color. Windows will be clad with a wood interior; the windowsill will be wood. The wood and stone will be full 4-inch veneer. Stucco will be real, it's a full 3/4-inch stucco with half timbering. There are no clapboard materials no other materials, no railings. Chimney material will be stone, we do have appropriate clay pots. Exterior doors will be Marvin or Sierra Pacific.

On this elevation sheet the dashed line is average natural grade, from there up is where we are measuring our building height and we are under the max allowable height of 40 feet.

The shingles will be Cedar shake. Eaves and corners will be painted wood, gutters will be copper half round. Both the front and back elevation give a nod to symmetry. Balanced center point and top elevation will be centered by the fireplace. Stone base is consistent and blends itself into the stucco and half timbering. We've used vertical stone elements both at the front door, and then on the left side. The right-side elevation has a similar stone element. All chimney's will be stone, and the entire house will have a base of stone.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Blackburn: Is the stucco dark like the windows?
- Farris: No the stucco is going to be a lighter buff color like the stone.
- Blackburn: But with dark windows?
- Farris: We are looking at a bronze window.
- Blackburn: So, you're saying the windows will not be dark.
- Farris: They will not be black
- Duke: I'm wondering if you could get a little more whimsy, like the inspirational photo.
- Farris: I think it will be a question for the client on how much we would do. He (Sisk) is a little hesitant to make it that strong.
- Blackburn: I appreciate your examples because it helps us grasp where you are headed with this.

Public Comments - None

Motion to approve with the caveat that we add some Tudor cross members for whimsical effect: Duke Second: Blackburn Vote: All Aye

3. The application of Hill McAlister, (21103) 1216 Bell Meade Blvd., to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved June 8, 2021.

Charlie Rankin, architect, representing Hill and Emily McAlister presenting a house that is under consideration for 1216 Belle Meade Blvd. This is the final lot on the left side alongside the parking at Percy Warner Park parking lot.

We designed the house with a colonial revival inspired exterior, with a relatively simple massing in repetitive multi-paned windows accentuated by louvered shutters on both the front elevations and along the right-side elevation as well. Primary massing is what ties this into that colonial revival style. The primary massing is side facing gable that runs parallel to Belle Meade Blvd. It has a balanced front elevation with symmetrical front facing gables on either side of the front entry porch. Then there are two wings extending off the center mass, while not symmetrical they are balanced on either side of the main mass of the house.

The right-side elevation shows a 3-car garage that is separated from the main house by way of a screened in breezeway, where we will use copper screens and copper standing seam roof on the lower pitches. The breeze way is connected to the back entry hall which is set off in a typical break wall with lap siding and that lower sloped copper standing seam roof.

Exterior material palette will consist of a handmade old Carolina brick, they are looking at a custom color mix, pending a larger sample board build on site. It is meant to replicate the Cheek House at First Presbyterian Church. In a few locations we will be using a composite lap siding, bringing the formality of the house down a little bit, and also using it in a few of the larger gable ends as well. The roofing material will primarily be a Divinci

brand synthetic slate tile. These are a composite material that the McAlister's currently have on their house at 1312 Page Rd. There are a few sections of standing seam copper roof on the breezeway and at the lower sloped hip roofs at the back entry hall and the dog room entry. The gutters will be 6-inch Ogee shape copper gutters with matching copper downspouts. The walking surfaces will be a natural stone to be determined, likely a crab orchard. The windows are Anderson E series aluminum clad window. To capture some of that historical colonial look we will be using a 3 ½ inch wide brick mortar casing with a 1-½ inch seal, to bring more historic character to those windows.

I'll open it up to any questions you all have

Board Questions and Comments:

- Blackburn: Do you have any inspirational photos?
- Rankin: here is an image from the Field Guide. This is the one-story colonial revival page. A lot of our massing has been taken from this. With the dominant side facing gable form. We did use some front facing gables that are not uncommon in this style. Expressed mostly on these images with dormers and the rectangle window shape with shutters, classic louvered shutters. In our case multi-pane windows, the repetition of windows, the balance of windows we've tried to demonstrate on our front elevation as well. It's sort of the classic colonial look. If you'll scroll through the next couple of pages just a few more modern contemporary examples of houses that we considered when we were putting together this design. The one on the top right is a Belle Meade residence on Walnut, the one below it, probably a little more neo-classical in its style but there are similarities to the massing of that with the two front facing gables, the recessed front porch, with a low sloped roof over the porch. Just some similarities to the massing there although a different style. But still sort of falls in that early American vocabulary. The following page really speaks more to some of the material choices that we've made. That picture on the bottom left is the Cheek house that I referenced earlier. That served as an inspiration for brick color, the idea for a shade to water table that forms a base around the house. The Cheek house is more of a step-down brick application, ours a little more like the one on the right, concave curve on the top, convex curve on the bottom so it forms a nice little skirt to go around the house.
- Duke: Was there any consideration for Double Hung (windows)
- Rankin: We have talked about double hung windows and realize that is more authentically colonial, the homeowner has a request that we would use a casement window for ease of operation. Pushout casement.
- Farris: I'm struggling with the window choices, particularly on the front elevation, the right and left gables. To me those windows appear to be short in the composition. Is there a reason why the columns are not with an emphasis to them? Or a tapered column?
- Rankin: They would be a Tuscan style column, I'm not opposed to the emphasis, one of my design directives from the client may be best expressed when they told me they want this to be a blue jean style house, not too formal. I think of those more as porch posts as opposed to formal classical columns.

- Duke: What is your distance for the window off the floor?
- Rankin: It is 24 inches.
- Blackburn: Does your ceiling height allow for a taller window?
- Rankin: It has 10-foot ceilings.
- Duke: It seems like it would proportion better if you could get 30 inches off the floor.
- Rankin: I'm not opposed to taking up to 8'6 or 8'7 inches
- Farris: I think it is broken down by those two windows on each gable. Your gutter lines are higher than the two wings right and left, but your windows line up. That'd be my proposal, to try and elevate the composition of those two gables.
- Blackburn: Charlie, the windows are more the style of French Colonial. The center section of the house, with those windows, I feel like that needs some work. Particularly the windows on either side of the door. So there won't be any shutters, but they are the same size as the other windows. I want to see some examples of that.
- Rankin: I think maybe the best reference is to go back to the one, that was a little more neo-classical in style.
- Blackburn: But we really can't use the neo-classical style if it's not a neo-classical house.
- Duke: Doug (Berry, City Attorney) have we approved a synthetic roof before?
- Berry: I don't believe you have.
- Blackburn: It's synthetic slate?
- Rankin: It's a composite material. The homeowners have it on their current house, they have had actual slate roofs on previous homes, and they had issues. I'm not aware of any restrictions.
- Blackburn: How does that (composite slate) do over time holding its color?
- Rankin: I'm afraid I can't really speak to that, the homeowners have used it before.
- Hill McAlister: The roof has a 50-year guarantee
- Blackburn: In holding the color also?
- Chairman: is there anyone in attendance that would like to speak for or against this proposal.
- **Public Comment:**
- Hill McAlister: The slate roof I'll address quickly. My mother lives in a log house on Old Hickory Blvd., we successfully put it on that house. On the windows, what you see here is a compromise. We wanted vertical pieces of glass, that's very important to us, we do not want double hung windows, the shutters will be operable. We can make a few windows a little taller. Respectfully I'd ask you to approve it the way it is, we can make those front windows a little taller.
- Emily McAlister: Spoke supporting her husband's statement and offering to compromise on the window size if necessary.
- Rankin: I cannot argue that a double hung window wouldn't be the most authentic stylistically, but this is modern house, for modern day conveniences. With client desire to have convenience and modern

amenities of a casement window, its fairly true to the style with the presence of the panes.

- Duke: The only reason I have the question about synthetic roofing materials, is setting a precedent.
- Blackburn: I see some French casement windows on page 335 on Colonial Revival, so I'm satisfied. But we have not approved any synthetic roofs.
- Rankin: The Commission does approve other synthetic materials, composite siding, fascia materials. I don't know that we can just blanket say no composites, it needs to be considered on a case by case basis.
- Patterson: There is nothing in the guidelines about roofing materials.
- Farris: I'm not opposed to that material.
- Duke: I would agree with Charlie, it's a case by case.
- Chairman: Anyone else that would like to speak for or against this proposal?

Public Comment closed.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve for owner to obtain building permit and begin sitework, pending verification by the Building Official that the synthetic slate roof material is as shown on the sample board on the building site and verification of the window arrangement, specifically making the front two window gables taller, taking the head height to between 8'- 8" and 9'; sill height remaining the same and leaving the front porch window as is:

Duke Second: Poe Vote: All Aye

4. The application of Joel Lyons, (21104) 712 Lynwood Blvd., to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved June 8, 2021.

Charlie Rankin presented on behalf of Joel Lyons for 712 Lynwood Boulevard. This project is located on small corner lot at Lynwood and Trimble at just over half an acre. The lot has a small building envelope, which led in large part to a more open concept floor plan that centered around an open living room, kitchen, dining space that opens on to a covered porch and patio area in the back.

A pool that's under consideration. That'll be a BZA matter on down the road, but for the purposes of the site plan, it's a placeholder right now. So given the open concept interior, the design of the exterior was intentionally steered in a slightly more contemporary direction. While still being rooted in a vocabulary of traditional architecture style I refer to on my application as transitional English.

I have divided my inspiration pic into two sections: historic precedence and inspiration images.

Rankin presents images of homes designed by English architects of the early 1900's - C. C. Voysey, Edwin Lutyens and Baillie Scott.

In taking cues from these historic precedents, the design developed a fairly simple massing, consisting of a main side facing gable punctuated by a series of front and rear facing gable forms. The one-story parapet wall on the right side of the front elevation is very typical English form with the limestone wall cap on the pitch of the roof behind and the flat shoulders on the other side which was demonstrated in the Baillie Scott's Blackwell project. Also the twin gables on the rear elevation recall the massing of Scott's Blackwell and Kings Close projects, and was a fairly common architectural element of English houses of the early 20th century.

The second set of inspiration images shows several case studies of some more contemporary interpretations of the style. Including the Mason's house at 4301 Warner Place.

On the whole, these case studies demonstrate a similar type of aesthetic and serve as a general guideline for the direction of the exterior color palette. The exterior material palette will consist of a painted brick and a white / off white-ish tone. Again, these sort of serving as our sort of inspiration for the direction of the color palette. So painted brick with buff colored Indiana limestone accents; most notably on the base of the gable to the left of the entry door and then used again as wall coping in several locations as well as accent on the chimney on right side of the house as well.

The roofing will be composite architectural shingle and standing seam metal roof on the dormers, and on the rear dormer as well.

The windows will be a wood window, exterior metal cladding. We're looking at Kolbe, Sierra Pacific. The front entry door will be a custom fabricated steel unit. Simple awning roofs at the front door, garage doors, and at the rear porch will be a metal clad with a tongue and groove wood product views on the exposed ceiling surface below.

Board Questions & Comments:

- Farris: What I see in the black and white inspiration images Charlie are very austere. I'm not finding the austerity in what I'm seeing presented. I would like to get to this sort of simplicity. I find a similar austerity in the color images, just consistent use of stucco. I am wondering why we are doing a painted brick versus a stucco.
- Rankin: We certainly considered stucco for this project, but it is a product that really needs to be executed extremely well, or it can cause some major damage. That along with consideration of the budget, pushed this towards a painted brick versus a stucco, with the idea of using a smoother face brick.
- Blackburn: I think that this mix of materials takes you completely away from where those (inspiration images) are. I think to pull that off the house needs to be stucco.
- Rankin: Well, it's got a very contemporary floor plan and a lot of that is driven by a very limited footprint. And with the more contemporary floorplan I felt like the exterior is a presentation of what is happening inside the house as well.
- Duke: I think there's some proportions for me that can be better just with a little tweaking such as the front door.

- Rankin: The doors are the ones with no vertical muttons, that are great for that simple porch.
- Duke: I think you would have a better sell with s stucco house.
- Rankin: With a more modern floor plan, the idea was to bring contemporary elements to it. When I do that, I always try to do it with a language that's sort of rooted in classicism.
- Blackburn: I look at this and I see the gable with the shoulders and it's right next to this ultra-modern front door and the flat roof with the gables. That's a lot of information right there next to each other. I don't think we can approve these materials because The builder wants to save money on the project.

Chairman Wall: is there anyone else who would like to speak for or against this proposal?

Motion to defer in order to obtain clarification of products and of the style of the house. Blackburn Second: Poe Vote: All Aye

Meeting adjourned at 4:44 p.m.

Mal Wall, Chairman

City Recorder, Rusty Terry