

Minutes
Historic Zoning Commission
City Of Belle Meade
August 10, 2021

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Mal Wall at 3:00pm.

Board members present

Mal Wall Jeannette Whitson Charlie Rankin Rene Poe

Staff members present

Beth Reardon, City Manager
Lyle Patterson, Building Official and Assistant city Manager
Edie Glaser, City Recorder Doug Berry, City Attorney

Consideration of Minutes:

Minutes of the regularly scheduled meeting held July 13, 2021.

Motion to Approve: Whitson Second: Poe Vote: All aye

Old Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Roy Manning (21071), 11 Carriage Hill, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of existing home was approved July 13, 2021.

Presentation:

Van Pond, Architect, addressed the concerns stated by the Commission at last month's meeting:

- Porch railings - Solution: Porch railings are currently shown on the plans due to building code requirements; however, if grading changes are made and building codes permit, the porch railing may no longer be required. In this circumstance and with the Commissions' permission, we request to have the option to remove the railings from the plans.
- Porch column caps not proportional to base - Solution: columns have been modified so the base and cap are now proportional.
- Eliminate combination of stone with brick on front porch - Solution: the base for the front porch will be all brick to match the rest of the home.
- Side elevation profile and small windows not centered - Solution: side elevations have been revised to present a more symmetrical composition and smaller windows now have single shutters instead of double.
- Brick sample needed - Solution: sample of full-depth brick was shown, in a medium gray/brown color. Also presented was a sample of the roofing material. Van Pond stated the windows were changed from all wood Marvin "Elevate" to Marvin aluminum clad "Integrity" and showed a sample of "Integrity".

Board Questions/Comments:

- Whitson - I appreciate that you brought samples, it's very helpful. The windows on the side elevation look much better now that they are centered and if you are not required to do the railing due to grade modifications, the Building Official can approve that change from your plans as shown.
- Rankin - If you must do the railing, will it be painted metal? Van Pond replied it would be powder coated steel.

Public Question/Comments: None

Motion to close public hearing: Poe Second: Whitson Vote: All aye

Board Discussion/Findings:

- Wall - great job on the design; it will fit well on the lot.
- Whitson - beautiful addition to neighborhood

**Motion to Approve all changes and samples: Whitson Second: Poe
Vote: All Aye**

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Jay Fulmer, (21073), 1106 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home.

Presentation: Jay Fulmer addressed the Commissions' concerns from last month:

- Front door style and shutter length - Solution: the shutters will come down all the way to the sill of the window and the broken pediment causing the mix of architectural styles is removed and the front door surround is redesigned to be more harmonious with the windows.
- Define architectural style (Georgian or French)- Mr. Fulmer stated the style is French and they have removed the Georgian details.
- Brick sample - Solution: Mr. Fulmer presented two different samples, stating they preferred the Ashwood style, unpainted brick.

Board Questions/Comments:

- Whitson - the window surrounds and around the door are all limestone, correct? And the brick is full-bed?
- Fulmer - Yes, to both questions
- Poe - Design is beautiful, more symmetrical and more French European.

Public Question/Comments: None

Motion to close public hearing: Whitson Second: Poe Vote: All aye

Board Discussion/Findings:

- Wall, Whitson - changes are an improvement and look good
- Rankin - change to front entry eliminates confusion of architectural style
- Whitson - are there any other changes to mention before we vote?
- Jay Fulmer - the only other change could be the roofing material. We prefer cedar shake with copper gutters, but for budget reasons, we are also looking at a high-end architectural asphalt shingle.

**Motion to Approve all changes and samples: Poe Second: Whitson
Vote: All Aye**

New Business: None

Other Business: None

Motion to adjourn: Poe Second: Rankin All aye

Meeting adjourned at 3:19pm

Chairman Mal Wall

City Manager Beth Reardon