

**Minutes
City of Belle Meade
Historic Zoning Commission
July 13, 2021**

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Mal Wall at 3:00pm

Commission members present

Mal Wall, Chairman	Jeanette Whitson, Vice Chairman	Gavin Duke
Ron Farris	Bunny Blackburn	Charlie Rankin
		Renee Poe

Staff Members Present

Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney
Lyle Patterson, Assistant City Manager & Building Official
Edie Glaser, City Recorder

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held June 8, 2021

Motion to approve: Wall **Second:** Duke **Vote:** All aye

Old Business: None

New Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Hunter Ford (21071), 512 Parmer Avenue, to construct an addition of more than 35% to existing home.

Presentation: Erin Cypress, Cypress Road Architecture, we have two letters of support from neighbors that were submitted with the application. This is an existing house on Parmer Avenue. The front of the house faces Belle Meade Plantation. It is a ranch house that was built in the 1940's and has sustained an addition in the early 2000's. The current homeowners did a front porch addition two years ago. The garage will remain the same as well as the friend's entrance. We are going up with the second story. The second story is existing in the roofline. There is a room that is protruding out towards the street. That part of the house is what is driving continuing out that existing front porch to catch it so that we can use the architecture that is already there and just minimally adjust the footprint to receive the second story. Because the style of the house is a more traditional ranch, we are taking it to a colonial style with the Chippendale railing at the top of the evening room and very simple but traditional eve details. We have taken some leads from the existing neighborhood particularly the gables and dormers to really tie it into the look and feel of the neighborhood. We want to stay consistent with the neighborhood. That is why we are doing the second story within the roofline and nestling in the dormers within the eave of the roof line. Copper gutters will run in front of the gables and dormers. The Chippendale railing will bring a colonial woodworking detail to an otherwise all brick façades. The entire house will be replaced with a cedar shake roof. We are demolishing more than 35% of the house while trying to maintain as much of the existing footprint. The places where we are adding on in this house are the front porch, the rear of the house, and the second story that is in the roof line of the house. We are using a shed dormer on the rear of the house to get a tight interior stair, that will go to the second floor. The second floor will accommodate two bedrooms, two bathrooms, two walk in closets, and a very small

lounge. The house will remain a painted brick. All of the shutters and trim work will be painted, and the house will have copper half round gutters. Wade Rick will be the landscape architect on the project.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Whitson, what is the new style of the house?
- Cypress, I would say the house is colonial. It is brick with articulated railing detail, columns, and gable end dormers.
- Whitson, I think it is wonderful. I appreciate the fact that you have taken a seventy five year old house in Belle Meade and used what is there to make it a really beautiful house. Whitson, there are three letters from the neighbors in support of this project.
- Farris, what is the max height?
- Cypress, we will be going before the BZA asking for a footprint increase on the front porch, footprint increase on bathroom and a rear setback variance. The setback line cuts through part of the existing house, and we are pulling the addition to align with the existing house.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve as submitted Blackburn Second: Duke
Vote: All aye

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Roy Manning (21071), 11 Carriage Hill, for demolition of existing home (Property of Conservation) and construct a new single-family home.

Presentation: Van Pond, Van Pond Architecture, this home was built around 1946. It is a ranch style home. It is a slab on grade construction so making modifications to this house is difficult at best, even making repairs to it is difficult. Along Carriage Hill there is a language of a story and a story and a half houses. We were asked by our clients to create a house that felt like the street in scale perspective. I would call this design a simplified Colonial Cape Cod. Cape Cods usually do not have a front porch, but we are in the South, and it does come up here. We have a pitched roof with dormers and a cat slide roof covering the front porch. We have a story and a half that will be done in brick. The brick will not be painted. We will select a natural color brick. There will be wood windows with fiberglass, Marvin Elevate Collection that has a simulated divided light. Shutters will be wood with an architectural shingle fiberglass roof and Ogee gutters that are painted with round downspouts. We are bringing in a 1930'/40's basket weave detail to the brick at the floor level of the first floor. There will be a two car garage and a friend's entrance. We will use square columns. All of the trim will be wood. Major doors will be mahogany, secondary doors will be wood. There will be a stone base at the front porch and brick around the rest of the house.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Wall, what is the height of the retaining wall in the back?
- Pond, at the highest it is six feet.

Motion to approve the demolition: Duke Second: Blackburn
Vote: All aye

- Blackburn, what color have you chosen for the windows?
- Pond, it will be a white or light cream.

- Blackburn, what color have you chosen for the brick? Do you have an example of what you would like to use?
- Pond, the brick color for the house has not been chosen yet.
- Blackburn, is this a spec house or owner occupied?
- Pond, the owners will live in this house.
- Duke, at the upper dormers, are those casements?
- Pond, those are casements.
- Duke, on the side elevation the arrangement of windows are much smaller than the window above.
- Pond, that is a typical response to having a limited amount of space.
- Duke, what is the shingle?
- Pond, the shingle is an architectural shingle in brown/grey called weathered wood. The columns are painted wood cedar, or harmony. It is not pressure treated.
- Pond, we are right at the height where we have to have a railing or do not have to have a railing on the front porch. Because of the three risers we are required to have a railing from the steps.
- Blackburn, what is the surface?
- Pond, it will be blue stone. There is brick at the top of the porch. The brick will form a pocket for the blue stone to go in to.
- Farris, can you describe the A symmetrical gable?
- Pond, we wanted to bring the scale of the house down, so it was not overpowering the neighboring houses. From the front façade we wanted to have a tiered elevation so that there is a higher elevation in the middle and lower on the perimeter so that it flowed out on the sides.
- Duke, what are the dormers?
- Pond, the dormers are metal siding with painted finish.
- Rankin, can you talk about the brick detailing at the window headers?
- Pond, we are using a brick paver header. The brick paver is an inch and half thick.
- Duke, the base on the column dominates the top.
- Blackburn, I am concerned that we do not have a brick sample to approve.
- Pond, I am happy to provide that and do apologize we don't have it with us today.
- Rankin, can you talk to us about the shutter design, the intention not to do the 50/50 split on the levered shutters?
- Pond, I wanted a more vertical appearance.
- Farris, hardware for shutters?
- Pond, it will be iron. They will be functional shutters. They will not have decorative hardware.
- Blackburn, we have a lot going on at the front steps with materials. Instead of the stone could you consider doing the brick? It is feeling a bit busy.
- Pond, we can certainly entertain that. We did that to give the front porch a little bit of differentiation.
- Duke, what style is this house.
- Pond, this is a simplified Colonial and Cape Cod.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve the design with some modifications: Farris Second: Duke

Farris, I find the classification of a Colonial Cape Cod an acceptable style for us. What I am struggling with are the materials at the porch. I would entertain a brick there more than a stone. I find the front elevation meets the criteria for a pleasing proportion rhythm. Where it breaks down is on the two sides. I am struggling with that A symmetrical gable with a Cape Cod and the windows not centering up and giving a better rhythm.

Duke, I would agree. The rhythm of some of the windows could be modified slightly. I am a little bothered with the side profile with the dormers on the skinny window. Proportionally it seems a little drawn up and unusual. The column caps might be nice to have in proportion to what the base is doing. You have a nice limestone base.

Blackburn, I think we are going to need to see the brick sample.

Motion to defer the application: Blackburn **Second:** Whitson
Vote: All aye

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Jay Fulmer (21073), 1106 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home.

Presentation: Jay Fulmer, this will be a Georgian style home, brick with significant limestone accents. The roof is a cedar shake roof. Ceiling heights are 12ft on the first floor, 9ft on the second floor. On the side elevation there will be a two car garage. It will have four fireplaces all of which will be capable of wood burning. The maximum height from the center is 37ft.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Duke, what is the shutter material?
- Fulmer, they will be operable custom made shutters.
- Duke, the shutters should come down all the way to the sill of the window.
- Blackburn, what style is this home?
- Fulmer, Georgian.
- Blackburn, the windows on the first floor on either side of the front door are not Georgian.
- Fulmer, are you suggesting we change them?
- Blackburn, yes.
- Fulmer, they have a limestone surround with limestone between them.
- Blackburn, that would not be part of Georgian architecture. We like a specific style of architecture and elements to support it.
- Fulmer, this is one of my favorite parts of the house.
- Duke, it has some Georgian and some French Eclectic to it.
- Farris, I am seeing more French Eclectic then Georgian as well. The front door is Georgian, the other elements are not. I do not struggle with the front windows I struggle with the style and identification. The other two sides I see more French Eclectic.
- Duke, some of the stone details and two windows on each side are more of the French style.
- Rankin, I think it is more of a definition problem. I am not opposed to the windows, it is a beautiful composition, but I see a lot more European with the steepness of the pitch and some of the other vocabulary there potentially not being Georgian.
- Blackburn, if the windows is what you want, we need to change the front door. The front door is very Georgian.

- Rankin, I think the limestone detailing could change around the front door to be more harmonious with the windows.
- Whitson, do you have a sample of the brick?
- Fulmer, we do not.

Board Discussion:

Motion to defer pending the example of the building material (brick), and to either have it be a Georgian house or a French house how ever the applicant would like to alter it to be more in keeping with one or the other styles:

Whitson Second: Farris Vote: All Aye

Other Business:

1. **407 Westview**, City of Belle Meade Attorney Doug Berry stated the Historic Zoning Commission approved the demolition of a log house at 407 Westview in January 2021. Building Official Lyle Patterson has since been contacted by former owners of the house that have asked to address the Commission about some history of the house that they believe was neglected or incomplete at the hearing in January 2021. This is not on the agenda today as an action item. They are here today to make their presentation. The applicant has been informed of this and their attorney is present.

Mr. Warren Randolph Kane, Jr., 2705 Belcourt Avenue, addressed the Commission stating, we have no problem with the new owners whatsoever. We grew up in this house. Our Grandfather built the house in 1929. Lynwood and Westview at that time were dirt roads. It is one of the oldest houses in Belle Meade and we feel it falls under the Historical Guidelines and would like the house to not be demolished. It is an icon in Belle Meade.

Mrs. Bolin Kane Stumb, Tyne Boulevard, addressed the Commission stating, our family owed this house for almost eighty years. Our Grandfather had the red cedar logs refurbished, numbered, and brought from Kentucky to Nashville to build the log home in 1929. The total cost back then to build the home was \$7,700.00. In 1943 when our grandfather died our parents lived there and my brother and I grew up in the house. We would like the Commission to reconsider the approval of the demolition of the house. The family who bought the house from us in 2008 did an excellent job of matching the logs when adding a master bedroom and bath to the back of the house and kitchen renovation. They maintained the integrity of the house.

Doug Berry, the Commission decided in January 2021 to allow demolition based on the information they had at that time. It was discussed that this was a property of significance given the age, but the other factors were that it did not have information to support the decision, amid the criteria, for property of significance at that time. The Commission then voted to allow demolition. We have now possibly new information that might change the commissions decision. The sixty days in which to appeal or reconsider the demolition is long past. The commission can place this item on the agenda in August for possible reconsideration because of new evidence or do nothing. Application is currently pending for demolition.

Jeanette Whitson asked Building Official Lyle Patterson to explain the notification process by the city.

Lyle Patterson stated notification is put on the City's website at least thirteen days prior to the meeting. The contiguous neighbors are notified by mail.

Mal Wall, the logs in the house are two hundred years old and Col. Luke Leigh's son lived there, this is significant.

Bunny Blackburn, what will be done with the logs by the current homeowner?

Jeanette Whitson, as the house sits today everything is original other than the addition of the master bedroom and bath on the back.

Georg Dean, representing the property, we would be happy to return the logs during the demolition process. The current owners have no plans for the logs and there is no reason that they could not be re-used. If that is something that would be helpful. The board heard all the evidence and ruled in January 2021. They found the structure did not meet the requirements. My client, the owner, did not own the property when he applied for demolition. Once the demolition was approved, he bought the property. If he had known there was a difficulty, he would have either waited or passed on the property. We ask the board to not rehear this and allow us to move forward with the project.

Steve Cates, 407 Westview Avenue, we did not close on the property for several months because there was a renter in the home. We then lived in the home. In living in the home, we noticed the windows are not historical. They are not true divided light. The windows that were added in the last few years are Pella snap in grids. There are no light fixtures, doors, trim, or appliances in the home that are of the original period. I know there is a wonderful emotional connection to the home, and I am willing to let them have what they would like from the home. Anything that is important to them from an art perspective. We bought the property based on the demolition decision. The home has been changed and not what it was when it was originally built.

Bunny Blackburn, the new information to me is the two hundred year old logs. Are you confirming that you will be giving them the logs?

Steve Cates, that is correct.

Mr. Warren Randolph Kane, Jr., we had no idea that there was a proposal to take the house down. I thought the city had to put a sign in the yard that says we have sixty days.

Lyle Patterson, no.

Mr. Warren Randolph Kane Jr., how are we to know?

Jeanette Whitson, it is published on the website.

Renee Poe, I will abstain from the vote since I was not present for the vote and hearing at the January 2021 meeting.

Motion to close the public portion: Farris Second: Wall Vote: All aye

Board Discussion:

Jeanette Whitson, procedurally did we follow the proper procedure at the time, was adequate notice given, did we evaluate all the facts that we had

when the decision was made. I am struggling with the fact that we made this decision over six months ago. I am not sure revisiting this is something I feel is timely given that there has been no malfeasance and no question of malfeasance. There does need to be some finality. I looked at my decisions for allowing the demolition to proceed and they were mainly based on the structure of the house and the number of alterations that had occurred with this house notwithstanding the 200 year old beams which I would have assumed were 100 or more years old. It was the fact that there were new windows, new doors, it had been altered, it is sitting on a slab, there is not way to actually go into a log wall and update wiring. There is a distinction between the nostalgia of things in our hearts we would like to preserve and then the legal rights of people purchasing property in Belle Meade. At the time the notification measures were fulfilled.

Farris, I struggle that we are six month down the road. I am respectful of the information that is before us, but it would not change my mind. The applicant has made a meaningful gesture to give the family the logs. I want a clear path for this board on when we are going to hear matters like this again. Where is the limitation. We have to have confidence from our citizens that when they hear from us, and we vote on it, that it is going to stick otherwise we are not going to have the kind of support that we should have. We are six month past the vote. I appreciate the age of the home and the family value of it. I don't think it puts it in the category that it can not be altered or removed.

Mal Wall, if I had this information in January, I would have probably voted differently than I did. There is no house in Belle Meade that meets all the criteria to be preserved. We really, really, need to get around to changing the requirements for what we are protecting.

Bunny Blackburn, I agree. It is necessary that this Board revisit the criteria. We have approved every demolition that has come before us. On this home other than the age of the logs I would not have voted differently.

Motion to not reconsider 407 Westview: Farris Second: Duke
Vote: 5- approved, 1- opposed, 1- abstained

Meeting adjourned 4:49pm

Chairman Mal Wall

City Recorder Edie Glaser