

**Minutes
Historic Zoning Commission
City of Belle Meade
May 11, 2021**

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Mal Wall, Chairman, at 3:00pm

Commission members present

Mal Wall, Chairman

Jeanette Whitson, Vice Chairman

Bunny Blackburn

Staff Members present

Lyle Patterson, Assistant City Manager and Building Official

Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney

Edie Glaser, City Recorder

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held March 9, 2021, and April 13, 2021

Motion to approve: Whitson **Second:** Blackburn **Vote:** All Aye

Other Business: The adoption of rules and regulations for the function of this group one of which is what constitutes a quorum. We are not intending to change the quorum requirements except going forward. There is currently a quorum, a majority of all the members here. It was decided to wait until all Board members are present to rule on those procedures moving forward.

Old Business: None

New Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Russell McLean, (21051)1206 Nichol Lane, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition of the existing home on this property was approved at the March 9, 2021, HZC meeting.

Presentation: Kevin Coffee, Dwellings and Design, our approach was to do a traditional neoclassical design that would be very classical on the front of the house, that would allow us that if we went around the house to the back, that we could maybe be a little more contemporary, which I think is something that is fairly typical of most houses, these days. We also decided because of coverage issues to do the garage towards the front of the property instead of the back. This would keep us from doing a lot of paving in the back. That is one of the reasons for the strategy of the garage being in the front and to form the front courtyard having a nice approach to the neoclassical façade.

Board Questions and Concerns:

- Whitson, how tall is this house?
- Coffee, 32.6
- Wall, what is the square footage of the house?
- Coffee, the heated square footage is 4700 on the main level, 3300 up.
- Wall, what size is the lot?
- Coffee, the lot is 50,000 square feet.
- Whitson, you have submitted two different front porticos.

- Coffee, we have a couple of options there. From true elevation they look exactly alike. One is a cover at the front that projects a little the other one is more flush. Historically they are both common.
- Whitson, I believe you have options on the roofing material as well. You have listed shingle or asphalt.
- Coffee, the wish is to do cedar shake.
- Whitson, you have a couple different options on the gutters.
- Coffee, the intent is to do the more traditional copper gutters, but aluminum is the backup route. Budgetary things can happen. With the aluminum the idea would be the color to match the copper color.
- Blackburn, I am uncomfortable with this many variables because a lot of your material choices really impact the design and what is appropriate for the design. Is the window material clad?
- Coffee, yes windows will be clad unit.
- Blackburn, is this painted brick and what color will the sashes be for the windows?
- Alan with Castle Homes, Pella windows, clad windows in the architectural series. Brick will be painted Sherwin Williams Sure White. The windows will be the same color. We are not having dark windows. Roof will be cedar shake and gutters will be copper.
- Blackburn, where are you using stone?
- Alan, mainly on the flat surfaces, the patios and front porch. There will be a limestone base on each of the columns and possibly even at the top cap.
- Wall, what is the finish floor elevation?
- Coffee, 553 at the top of the wall and 552 at the pool deck.
- Whitson, are these operable doors across the front?
- Coffee, they are designed to be operable doors.
- Blackburn, are these French doors at the front?
- Alan, yes.
- Blackburn, do you have any pictures?
- Coffee, I do not have a particular picture. They are double doors but not really French doors. They are oversized at ten feet tall and three feet wide. They are meant to set off the center doors.
- Blackburn, they look a little out of place to me.
- Coffee, I do think there are a lot of precedents for the double doors, maybe not in Belle Meade itself but in general in the neoclassical architecture.
- Blackburn, I need to see some examples that show that it goes with this architecture. You typically would see a side door with side lites.
- Whitson, what is the detail that will surround the front door?
- Coffee, it will be a limestone surround. The detail will be very subtle, clean, and traditional.
- Whitson, how wide is the front door?
- Coffee, it is six feet. It will be a wood door.
- Whitson, can you discuss the railing?
- Coffee, we are planning to do a wood railing or composite railing, traditional. There is a shape to the railing then split with a series of balusters with caps. There is a small cap to it that fits under the main cap.
- Blackburn, do you have to go before the BZA for anything other than the pool?

- Coffee, no

Public Comments:

Jake Long, 413 West Brookfield, what are the setback requirements and are they within those and are the existing plantings going to remain in the back between our two properties?

Coffee, we will be cleaning out the landscaping. Some of the bad trees and older trees that are not healthy or dying. We are keeping good screening and our landscape plans include additional plantings. We are completely in the setbacks and not pushing outside of that at all.

Betsy Jarnagin, 1204 Nichol Lane, if you are looking at the house from the street I am to the left. The garage will be adjacent to me. My question is about the setbacks. How far is that garage off of the property line?

Coffee, the turn around at the garage is going to be at least 40 feet from the property line on that side and well inside the allowed setback. Your setbacks are basically half the width of the front property, split in two. We just did an equal on both sides. That way it respects both neighbors equally.

Betsy Jarnagin, what is the edge of the driveway to the edge of the driveway?

Coffee, that is probably 8 to 10 feet. The minimum is five so that leave us room for landscaping.

Whitson, the neighbor is concerned with the car lights when driving into the driveway. If your landscape architect, Gavin Duke, could please add some pretty substantial screening between the two.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve the application with the following stipulations, if there are any material changes other than what was stated today you will come before the Building Official to discuss, those being copper gutters, clad windows that are white in color, shake roof, front door made of substantial wood material, and proper landscaping on the left to help the adjacent neighbor with cars entering the driveway: Whitson Second: Blackburn
Vote: All aye

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Tim Rupert (21052), 0 Canterbury Lane, to construct a new single-family home.

Presentation: Catherine Sloan, Architect, there is not an existing house that we are tearing down. This property is a pretty park like setting, and the proposed design is within the building setbacks. It is within the FAR and the footprint. The pool will have to go before the BZA next week. The pool is within the setbacks. We are going for a colonial, federal, wood clapboard siding with a stone foundation and chimney that will be local field stone buff grey with buff grey mortar. There will be white windows that will be painted to match the siding. The owners prefer the gutters and down spouts to be painted versus covered just so they don't want to make a big statement with the copper. They want to keep it simple and let the real materials kind of speak for themselves. We are planning on a slate roof composed of reclaim versus the new. We may go to the wood shake but for right now we are slate. It is a little under 7000 square feet. It is really important to them to be able to sit out front and watch the kids play and go back and forth to

neighbors. So, we have created a side front porch on the left side that tucks in so we can keep that front door a little more formal. There are inspirational pictures and rendering on the screen. The windows and doors will be wood, and the brick will be painted white.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Whitson, what is the height of this house?
- Sloan, it is well within the allowable and I think around thirty two.
- Blackburn, will the gutters be hidden?
- Sloan, no they will be half rounds with round down spouts, but they will not be hidden.
- Whitson, the garage facing on the left, that is a lot of clapboard. Could that be two windows with shutters that matches the house?
- Sloan, we can landscape and plant some pretty sizable trees in those areas and I am definitely open to making those windows bigger with shutters or making the upstairs one bigger with shutters, we can definitely play with that.
- Whitson, I think landscaping would help it. I think this house fits on the street nicely.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve: Blackburn **Second:** Whitson **Vote:** All aye

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Residential Tech LLC (21052), 1220 Chickering Road, to construct a new single-family home.

Presentation: Jonathan Torode, this style house is English, arts and crafts. Relevant examples of this in Belle Meade are 511 Belle Meade Boulevard, 200 Jackson Boulevard and 4400 Shepard Place. Notable features of this style are vernacular forms before industrial revolution, local and natural materials, display for craftsmanship over mass production, large assemblies of windows and doors and often articulated chimneys. The existing driveway will be kept and then reworking the motor court. We are fully within our required setbacks. The materials will be brick, preferably with a lime wash. If we can not achieve the effects of the lime wash, we are going to leave it natural and not painted. Limestone accents around the windows. From the finish floor below it will be stone, stone water table, and stone base around the house and around to the back where the basement gets exposed. The gutters will be copper or zinc whatever matches the roof best. The roof will be wood shake or slate. Originally this was designed with a screened porch. The owner has decided he wants to enclose that with glass with clad windows and doors. The over all height of the house is 37 feet measured from the front elevation, taken from the average natural grade. The rear, we are at 48 feet max from the lowest point to the roof. We will be adding a flat roof over the terrace.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Whitson, there is a grade change towards the back of the house that you're using.
- Torode, correct, you do not see that on the front of the house or the side elevation.
- Wall, how tall is the retaining wall on the left hand side that goes down to the garage and back?
- Torode, I do not have that exact height, but it is at least 12 feet.
- Wall, the lower level garage is 8 feet below 623?

- Torode, yes
- Wall, so the retaining wall has got to be 8 feet.
- Torode, it is over 12 feet.
- Wall, who would actually see that wall?
- Torode, the neighbors.
- Patterson, that would be for BZA.
- Blackburn, how many square feet is the house?
- Torode, the first floor is 6000 square feet, the second floor is 5000 square feet. First and second floors are just under 11,000 square feet heated and cooled on 8.9 acres. Allowable square footage is 31,000 square feet. Allowable floor area ratio is 76,000 square feet.
- Blackburn, it is a massively big house and you have done a nice job. I think the key to the success of this is softening it up. I like the wash color of the brick.

Public Comments:

Anne Russell, 1218 Chickering Road, we think the house is lovely and have no objection to the house. We will want to hear more about the retaining wall at the next meeting.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve as submitted: Whitson **Second:** Blackburn
Vote: All aye

June Bogle, 1221 Chickering Road, I live across the street and am wondering when that property is going to be cleaned up?

L. Patterson, if you are referring to the stormwater measures, they have to be in place during construction and to protect the stream. There are a series of silt fences and straw wires that have to be in place as part of the erosion plan.

Meeting adjourned at 4:15pm

Chairman Mal Wall

City Recorder Edie Glaser