

**Minutes
Historic Zoning Commission
City of Belle Meade
June 8, 2021**

Call to order

The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairman Jeanette Whitson at 3:05pm.

Commission members present

Mal Wall, Chairman	Vice Chairman, Jeanette Whitson	Gavin Duke
Bunny Blackburn	Ron Farris	

Staff Members present

Lyle Patterson, Assistant City Manager and Building Official
Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney
Edie Glaser, City Recorder

Consideration of the Minutes of the HZC meeting held May 11, 2021

Motion to approve: Duke **Second:** Farris **Vote:** All aye

Old Business: None

New Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Kevin Millslagle (21061), 438 Royal Oaks Drive, to connect a new single-family home on a vacant lot.

Presentation: Michael Ward, this was a vacant lot. We have been working to create a house that is appropriate for this particular lot. We are proposing a story and a half home in an English Tutor Revival style in stucco with a black/grey slate roof with copper details. This home will have large window openings. Royal Oaks has a combination of two story, one and half story, and one story homes on it. We are trying to do something in between, in terms of height and massing that really works there. Inspirational photos include Tudor Revival English cottages and English Country houses. We have a landscape plan that is very complementary to the style of the house.

Board Questions and Concerns:

- Whitson, what is the size of this lot, the square footage of the house, and the height?
- Ward, lot size is 40,850 the footprint 48,80 allowable is 4900 overall square footage of the house including basement is 8,800 square feet, 7,000 of that is above grade. Height of the house is 32.4.
- Whitson, is this within FAR and will this need to appear before the BZA?
- Patterson, they will need to go before the BZA for the pool only.
- Ward, we are planning an expanded sills on the windows, as opposed to the standard 5/8's aluminum sills. They make a much broader, more robust windowsill. There is 2 ½ inches that form the base of these.
- Duke, I am not familiar with the aluminum surround.
- Ward, in our experience, the full clad casing, the mole casing, all that casing together gives us a much more seamless look. It is a seamless casing that ties and clips directly to the window frame. Marvin will ship it in one unit.

- Duke, tell us about the dormer?
- Ward, the dormer will be trimmed out.
- Duke, I would like to have assurance that they are not going to be aluminum rounded.
- Ward, no. The clad from the street and even in person will give you a much more authentic look than us putting casing all around these windows.
- Duke, I am only seeing one set of shutters on the front elevation.
- Ward, they are purely decorative and not necessarily essential to the design. It adds more detail to give more balance to this gable. We can add shutters.
- Blackburn, what is the style of architecture for this house?
- Ward, this is more of an English Country House than a Tudor Revival. If you had to pick something out of a book it is Tudor Revival.
- Blackburn, the front door looks more modern to me than the rest of the house.
- Ward, it is a 42 inch mahogany door with side lights and transom units. The door is super traditional.
- Duke, can you tell us about the stucco? Is it three quarter thick?
- Ward, yes, and it is a fairly neutral stucco and a fairly neutral window color.
- Duke, do you have round copper gutters?
- Ward, yes, and half round down spouts. There is also a small amount of wood cedar bracketing detailing that happens up at the gable.
- Duke, my comment would be that the front door have more of an arched transom. The Tudor characteristic is more rounded.
- Blackburn, in my book (A Field Guide to American Houses) the typical Tudor entrances are mostly rounded.
- Ward, in some cases, I think they vary. We are happy to put a flattened arch up there.
- Farris, I like the front elevation and the simplicity to it. I do not see the same strength to the right side that you're going to see as you come down Royal Oaks. I recognize the difficulty and the geometry of the site. That right side gives me a little desire for development relative to what you have done in the front.
- Ward, any of these windows can be made with shutters and frankly made a little larger.
- Whitson, can you speak to me about the massive roof that is hanging over the house? The ceiling heights are 11 ft then 9 ft upstairs. It makes me feel better that the house is 32 and your allowable is 40 and you have kept it down.
- Farris, to tag on to that what I like about the front are the twin gables. I am asking if the scale of those should be increased a little to absorb some of that roof mass.
- Blackburn, I agree with that.
- Ward, the scale in our drawing is a lot more represented than the PDF you are seeing. We have PDF problems where they flatten out and the house looks short in the pictures.

Board Discussions:

Blackburn, I do not feel the center section matches the rest of the house.
 Whitson, to me that is a design decision. I have seen it both ways.

Duke, the materials are nice, the slate and stucco. I do think the view coming in off of Royal Oaks could be softened with some shutters.

Farris, I agree with the comments about the shuttering. The front bay, the scale above those windows gets a little heavy towards the top. Can the front and the back start to influence how we address the aesthetic of that right side?

Ward, given the angle of which that roof has to meet the other side we can play with hip forms, but I don't have many other tools to bring a roof into another wall at a 38 degree angle.

Farris, I'm trying to tie this right side in a little bit better.

Ward, we wanted to do that but with the two foot overhang rule with square footage we had to keep our overhangs pulled back everywhere or we would get penalized for it.

Farris, I think this Board would entertain how much overhang becomes footprint. I can look past that as a style. Some of the overhang restrictions might be causing me to be a bit restrained.

Duke, I would add that the scale of the lanterns, you might go a little larger.

Patterson, if you are asking for more roof overhang it would go before the BZA and I would inform them that it was recommended by the HZC.

**Motion to approve on the stipulations of adding shutters to the side and square footage potentially for the roof overhangs: Duke Second: Wall
Vote: All aye**

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Hill McAlister (21062), 1216 Belle Meade Boulevard, for a demolition of existing home (Property of Conservation).

Presentation: Charlie Rankin with Rankin Design Works, we are here today asking for demolition of the existing house recently acquired. The house was built in 1945, 2500 square feet, on one level. Probably best classified as a minimal traditional style house. It is very typical of the houses built in that era of the 40's and 50's. There is some minimal classical detailing at the front porch but there is nothing about this house that distinguishes that from other countless other homes built in that time. There is nothing historically or architecturally significant about the structure that is there. It has a prominent location, and we feel that a home with a richer architectural language and detailing would be more appropriate. The McAlister's intent is to build a traditional style home, fairly modest scale, 3500 to 4000 square feet. We are asking permission to demo the existing home so we can move forward with design work on a new house.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Duke, do you have a site plan?
- Rankin, survey has been ordered but we do not have a site plan.
- Whitson, this is a property of conservation. It was built prior to 1950. Is there anyone that thinks it possesses integrity of design, materials, workmanship, setting, location, feeling, and association from the original period of construction?

Public Comments:

Mr. Phipps, Phipps Construction, I have worked with McAlister's in the past, and they are very cognizant of the fact of a screening of the area toward the parking lot of the park. They are going to work within the confines and will not need any variances. The existing home is very dated. I don't see anything worth while in the house except the price.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve the request to demolish: Farris Second: Duke
Vote: All Aye

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Joel Lyons (21063), 712 Lynwood Boulevard, for a demolition of existing home (Property of Conservation).

Presentation: Charlie Rankin with Rankin Design Works, this home was built in 1948, a minimal traditional home bordering on ranch. The house sits very low to the ground. The roof sits on the window heads. We do not see anything architecturally or historically significant about the structure that is there. It is the intention of the owner to design a house that is in keeping with the design guidelines and character of Belle Meade. This is step one of the process. If the demo is approved, we will appear before the Municipal Planning Commission to establish a building envelope. We will then most likely have to go before the BZA having to do with the building envelope and setbacks.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Duke, how big is the lot?
- Rankin, it is about a half-acre.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve for demolition: Blackburn Second: Wall
Vote: All aye

4. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Alex Palmer (21064), 533 Belle Meade Boulevard, for demolition of existing home (Property of Conservation). The lot was approved to be subdivided into two lots by the Municipal Planning Commission at the January 2021 meeting.

Board Members Ron Farris and Gavin Duke recuse themselves from voting.

Presentation: Ron Farris, Farris Concepts in Architecture, this project was first heard by the Municipal Planning Commission to be subdivided. It has been passed and is now subdivided into two lots. The original structure that is there now was built in the 1960's. It has had multiple additions. Each of the two properties are just over 50,000 square feet. The minimum lot size in the city for lots is 40,000 square feet. The minimum for street frontage is 125 and we meet the requirement at the 190 range. They are very complementary size properties to others around it and meet the minimum standards of the city ordinance. I do not see that the property represents or has integrity of design, craftsmanship, setting, worthy of conservation, or would be eligible for submission as a historic place. It appears to have had multiple phases of additions and remodeling that do not tie into the original design. The

original design might be described as a ranch but what has occurred over time, I struggle to say that it is complimentary to the ranch style.

Board Questions and Comments:

- Blackburn, who was the architect for this home?
- Farris, I could not find that information.

Public Comments:

Angus Crook, 407 Leake Avenue, my concern is the view at the corner of Leake Avenue and Belle Meade Boulevard.

Patterson, in our zoning ordinance there is a radius formula that prevents the landscaping from going too close to the corner.

Farris, our proposed landscape buffering does not extend beyond the average front setback line that was approved. The City's Building Official will be looking at that as well as the second lot develops.

Keith Summar, 409 Leake Avenue, what will be the access points on Leake Avenue and Belle Meade Boulevard? What is the gap on the landscape buffering along Leake Avenue?

Ron Farris, the intent of both designs is that they would be entering off of Belle Meade Boulevard. The MPC did not preclude the second lot from having an entrance coming off Leake Avenue which is the gap in the landscape buffering. The agreement was that we would be buffering along Leake Avenue with the Building Officials overview.

Larry Buckley, resident at the condominiums neighboring the property, there is an enormous amount of greenery currently running down the lot line. I just wanted to comment that I would hope the new owners would retain or maintain that greenery.

Board Discussion:

Motion to approve demolition: Wall Second: Blackburn
Vote: All aye

Meeting adjourned at 4:15pm

Vice Chairman Jeanette Whitson

City Recorder Edie Glaser