

**Minutes  
City of Belle Meade  
Historic Zoning Committee  
Tuesday, June 9, 2020**

**Call to order**

The "Zoom" platform meeting was called to order by the Chairman, Mal Wall at 3:00pm.

**Commission members present**

Chairman, Mal Wall	Jeanette Whitson	Ron Farris
Bunny Blackburn	Gavin Duke	

**Staff Members present**

City Manager, Beth Reardon	City Attorney, Doug Berry
Assistant City Manager and Building Official, Lyle Patterson	
City Recorder, Edie Glaser	

**Consideration of the Minutes**

Minutes of the HZC meeting held May 12, 2020

**Motion to approve:**    Whitson            **Second:** Duke            **Vote:** All aye

**Old Business:**

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for EL Jack Custom Homes, LLC. (20032), 4310 Sunnybrook Drive, for the demolition of existing home (demo approved 3/10/20, Property of Conservation) and construct a new single family home.

**Presentation:** Mark Spivey with EL Jack Custom Homes and Chris Tippett with Tippett Sease Baker Architecture, began their presentation with listing the changes they have made to the plan since the last meeting. The patio was addressed with getting the proportions of the columns correct. The windows on either side of the front portico were made taller. The front door was replaced with a more traditional one with side lights to be more in keeping with the American Colonial Architecture and style. The house will be clapboard with corner boards and shed dormers. The house was raised to 647.5 to the finished floor keeping the grade at 645 creating a series of steps to go down to the drive so that the drive is 640 at the walkway. This allows for a retaining wall that is flush.

**Board Questions/ Comments:**

Duke, is the retaining wall stone?

Tippett, it is a stone retaining wall to tie into the base of the house that is stone also.

Farris, compliments to the revisions, I am concerned with the cast stone water table. Our Ordinance reads the materials need to be natural.

Spivey, we can do limestone.

**Motion to approve with the revision of limestone:**    Farris            **Second:** Duke  
**Vote:** All aye

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Chandelier Development (20033), 100 Bellevue Drive South, for the demolition of existing home (Property of Conservation) and renovations of more than 35%.

**Presentation:** Joel Lyons, property owner and Preston Shea with P. Shea Designs, began their presentation listing the changes made to the design since the last meeting.

Revisions have been made to the driveway access to shield the three car garage from Bellevue South Drive. A cedar shake roof and copper gutters have been added to the design. The front entrance has been improved upon to make a more pronounced entrance.

The shed dormers on the previous plan have been changed to gamble to be in more keeping with the style of the house. The body of the house will be an unpainted brick. The back and the connectors of the house will be an artisan siding.

The overall height of the home is 33 foot that is well below the bulk standards and close to the same size as the previous house on this lot.

**Board Questions/ Comments:**

Whitson, you have made some great improvements and streamlined the Dutch Colonial style. Moving the driveway looks much better and the 33 foot overall height of the house will blend much better in that neighborhood of cottages with the true shingles and the true brick.

Blackburn, how many steps are there up to the front door?

P. Shea, 5 or 6 that is natural grade with very little manipulation.

Blackburn, it feels a little out of proportion to me that it is that high.

Lyons, it creates the 3 foot minimum crawl space height. It also fits on the lot with the current grading of the lot.

Patterson, it falls about 10 feet from the back of the property line to the front porch.

Duke, the improvements look nice. Could you explain why you went to brick for the main body versus what is shown in the inspirational photos?

P. Shea, brick was the preferred material of the owner. The brick breaks it up so there is some definition between the main house.

Farris, compliments to the revisions and the massing and scale of this corner lot.

Wall, the body of the house being brick and the back portion of it in siding does reduce the massiveness of the side of the house down Bellevue.

Farris, this style of house can shoulder those kinds of steps or that base. I would suggest more attention to the detail instead of grading.

Blackburn, the right side of the front of the house is showing a lot of brick and no window.

P. Shea, that is a master closet. We can add a window there.

Blackburn, what is the brick work above the window?

P. Shea, it is a 12 inch jack arch. Those bricks are set completely vertical in the center then spring from a common point.

Duke, did the floor plan change when the elevations were done?

P. Shea, I ended an off set at the kitchen and re-worked the butler's pantry. The kitchen was brought in to create a corner. We can then turn it with the brick.

Duke, instead of a window in the master closet would you consider a blank window to change up the large brick wall.

P. Shea, I like the idea of closed shutters. I can detail it with the jack arch.

Duke, can the steps be brought to 30 inches, so you don't have to have the pickets and railing on the front? It would clean it up. You could have a post and rail instead.

Lyons, we could add topsoil and build the beds up to get to 30 inches and elevate the sidewalk. That would eliminate some of the steps up to the front patio.

Blackburn, I think it would look cleaner if all was clapboard. It is just a suggestion. Most of the inspirational photos are clapboard.  
Blackburn, what are the windows?  
Lyons, Aluminum Clad

**Public Comments:**

Carolyn Sorenson, 106 Bellevue Drive South, I live next door to the property. My husband and I like the improvements on this design. Is it allowable for them to make a loop driveway on the side of Bellevue Drive South?  
Lyons, I would be for that and eliminate the lead walk. It would help with getting in and out of the guest parking if you had a separate connector to Bellevue Drive South.  
Jeanette, L. Patterson would have to speak to hardscape limits.  
L. Patterson, your allowed 12% of the total square footage lot for driveway. It is a matter of numbers.  
Carolyn Sorenson, can you use the permeable pavement, so you do not have as much stormwater run off?  
L. Patterson, no  
P. Shea, if we use Bellevue Drive South as the front yard, we are approaching maximums.  
Whitson, if you extend the driveway to go all the way through that would be helpful to the homeowner and everyone on Bellevue Drive South.  
Duke, there are ways you can put turf in the center part of the drive to reduce your numbers if you are close.  
Farris, I think I would be careful with the amount of hard surface you would put on the driveway side of the house. This house also has the flexibility to be slid over to the left side set back to give you a little greener space to Bellevue Drive South if you needed it.

**Board Discussion/Comments:**

Farris gave a summary of board comments and provisions.  
1-Revise the brick to siding but leaving below the water table brick  
2-Add a window at the master closet side elevation that is shuttered closed  
3-Raise grade at the front in order to eliminate the necessity of railings  
4-Slightly alter the positions of the windows on the side of Bellevue Drive South in the living room and pantry.  
5-Study the revision of the driveway to enter Bellevue Drive South  
6-Narrow the chimney as it leaves the porch.

**Motion to approve for the bullet point provisions previously numerated:**

Farris                      Second: Whitson                      Vote: All aye

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Shelby Brown (20042), 815 Westview Avenue, for the partial demolition of existing home (Property of Conservation) and renovations of more than 35%.

**Motion to approve a sixty day deferral:**    Farris                      Second: Duke  
Vote: All aye

**New Business:**

1. The application of Kristi Kaminsky (20061) 609 Belle Meade Boulevard, asking for a change from the HZC approved stucco (2/11/20) to a brick veneer for the entire house.

**Presentation:** Kristi Kaminsky, homeowner, we are asking for a change of material from the original stucco to brick. We feel it will look more traditional and the durability of the brick will be a good change. We are using palmetto brick. The smooth limestone will remain as accent.

**Motion to approve:** Duke                      **Second:** Farris                      **Vote:** All aye

**2. The application for Jennifer Jacobs (20062), 436 Lynwood Boulevard, for the demolition of existing home (Property of Significance).**

**Presentation:** Jennifer Jacobs, homeowner, this is a quirky floor plan with ceiling heights of 7 and 8 inches. The basement, that is only 7ft high and floods with every rain, is the only place to house a washer and dryer. The home was renovated before I purchased it. The garage was converted to a small bedroom with a very small bathroom attached. The second story attic was converted to a bedroom.

**Board Questions/ Comments:**

Whitson, in what year was this built?

Jacobs, 1937

Whitson, what portions of the house are original and what are additions?

L. Patterson, I believe the breezeway was part of the original structure and the garage was added on and eventually converted to a bedroom.

Wall, are you attempting to sell the house now?

Jacobs, yes, it is on the market now. I have had several showings, but the feedback is that families can't work with the floor plan and better to start over. I have not had one person that wants to buy it as is.

Blackburn, your wanting to get a demolition permit to sell it as an empty lot.

Jacobs, yes.

Duke, how big is the lot?

Jacobs, it's .81

Duke, if this is taken down L. Patterson it would have to come to us to be approved correct?

L. Patterson, yes.

Jacobs, I am not planning on tearing it down. I am just trying to find out if I can. I have potential builders interested in the property.

**Board Discussions/Comments:**

Whitson, I would like to see what would be replaced if this house went down, but I don't want to unfairly burden the homeowner with her selling it because this is unclear.

Duke, is there any statement that we can give her that says she would have the right to demolish the house in the event of the sale that would help her to sell the property?

L. Patterson, the building permit is good for one year.

Farris, I don't think this home is in the category of historically significant other than the age of the house.

**Motion to approve the applicants request for demolition based on the project does fall under the date of 1939 but does not possess the integrity of design, materials, workmanship, setting, location, feeling, as defined for eligibility in the National Register of Historic Places nor does it embody other qualities or characteristic in judgement of the HZC Board. It does not possess a broad cultural, political, economic, or social association of historic development in Belle Meade and those cases have not been presented that it does hold that category. It has not been identified to be**

associated with a historic person and does not possess distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style reflective of dominant styles in the City of Belle Meade. The granting of this demolition in no way indicates to the applicant we have verified the building setbacks or building envelope for replacement therefor. I move for approval of the applicant's request to demolish: Farris      Second: Whitson      Vote: All aye

Farris, do you understand the motion?  
Jacobs, yes, I understand the motion.

**Other Business:**

Blackburn, I would like to recommend the HZC present awards for well done renovations and a well done new build.

Whitson, I agree with you. Metro does this every year. We could issue a certificate and highlight it in the Newsletter. This would give praise to the builders and architects as well.

Duke, perhaps we could classify it into square footage as well.

**Motion to establish Historic Zoning Commission Awards for best renovation and best new build:      Blackburn      Second: Duke      Vote: All aye**

Bunny Blackburn was nominated by Whitson to Chair the Historic Zoning Commission Awards.

Lyle Patterson announced at the next regularly scheduled meeting Jane Coleman Cattone will be the guest speaker.

**Motion to adjourn:      Whitson      Second: Farris      Vote: All aye**

---

Chairman Mal Wall

---

City Recorder Edie Glaser