

MINUTES
HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION
BELLE MEADE CITY HALL
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 13, 2019

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Mal Wall, Chairman, at 3:00pm.

Commission members present

Mal Wall, Jeanette Whitson, Gavin Duke, Ron Farris, Bunny Blackburn

Staff members present

Beth Reardon, City Manager Doug Berry, City Attorney
Lyle Patterson, Building Official Edie Glaser, City Recorder

Also present - Mr. Philip Thomason, preservation planner of Thomason and Associates.

Consideration of the Minutes

Minutes of the HZC meeting held October 30, 2019

Motion to Approve: Whitson **Second:** Farris **Vote:** All aye

Old Business: None

New Business

1. Call to Order

2. **Phil Thomason, preservation planner of Thomason and Associates, power point presentation.**

Before starting the power point presentation P. Thomason announced that the City of Belle Meade was nominated this year by the Nashville Nine. The Nashville Nine is an organization that represents historic properties across Nashville in danger of being lost to demolition, neglect, or inappropriate renovations. There were two reasons for the nominations per P. Thomason. One, the City, largely because of the high number of demolitions that have taken place the past several years, particularly this past year. Second, loss of mid-century residential resources. This is City wide. Homes are being torn down to make way for larger houses. All the materials from these torn down homes are being shipped away to landfills. There is no reclamation of the materials and there are a number of mid -century houses scattered throughout Belle Meade.

B. Blackburn asked the question that Belle Meade does not have to worry about what Metro is doing with the tearing down of one home on a property and building two? R. Farris responded that Belle Meade has a minimum lot size. J. Whitson added you can sub-divide if it is a bigger lot. L. Patterson explained you must have a minimum of 40 thousand square feet per lot and that there are not many lots that big in Belle Meade.

P. Thomason began his power point presentation displaying maps of the City's homes starting with 1933. Other maps showing the decline during the Depression and then a burst of construction in 1936. P. Thomason went on to explain that after World War II (after 1945), there was a great deal of construction in Belle Meade. Maps of 1951 were shown. P. Thomason made the

suggestion that the 1950's might be a good place to start with the guidelines.

P. Thomason presented these questions to the Commission to consider when doing the Design Guidelines.

1. Do we allow or do we not allow demolitions?
2. If we do allow them what do we want their constructions to look like?
3. For those who want to do major additions to their historic houses how is that done in a way that respects the architectural integrity of the original property and the original footprint that allows for expansion that is compatible?

P. Thomason went on to list some common kind of new construction standards that he puts in his design guidelines.

1. New construction shall look like new construction but not distract from the character of the neighborhood.
2. Follow existing height patterns in the area, floor elevations and set backs should be similar to existing ones.
3. The Floor to floor height of a new building should match that of its neighbors.
4. The façade of a proposed building should reflect proportions and balance of adjacent facades.
5. The size and massing of new structures should be consistent with other buildings in the neighborhood.
6. Facades to be oriented in the same general direction as those of neighboring buildings.
7. Use building materials typical with the neighborhood.

In these historic neighborhoods we end up with three types, replica, replica light, and contemporary. R. Farris commented that the design guidelines should start with simplicity, proportions, and scale.

J. Whitson asked if there was any caliber or rule on landscaping? L. Paterson mentioned the there was a meeting recently on the tree ordinance and something should be coming through soon regarding landscaping. Tree ordinance is normally separate per P. Thomason.

P. Thomas continued the presentation showing examples of good and bad additions. He commented that contemporary design for alteration and additions for existing properties should not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical architectural or cultural material and such design is compatible with size, scale, color, material and character of the property. He will provide language to give to the Commission regarding corner lots. Corner lots have double view and more regulations. Lateral additions are not approved in a Historic District.

L. Patterson asked the question to the Commission what do we want coming to the HZC? Renovations, partial demo's, and is it going to be on cost or percentage basis? P. Thomason summarized that the board has two sets of criteria, one, to review new construction in all of Belle Meade. Second, to prevent demolition and make sure we have compatible additions to buildings constructed before X- date and have historic and architectural integrity.

D. Berry commented that when developing the guidelines, bylaws need to be included or a separate set of bylaws that defines L. Patterson's (City Official) discretion on applications brought before him.

L. Patterson reminded everyone that the moratorium is up December 15th and is hesitant on extending it. P. Thomason to have draft to the Commission by Monday, November 25th.

D Berry is going to ask the Board of Commissioners to consider an ordinance on the first reading establishing the city-wide overlay. Prior to second and final reading the HZC will have to adopt to the guidelines to be valid. D. Berry suggested if we have to extend the moratorium to do so. He does not think it can be in final form by December 20th. L. Patterson and D. Berry agreed to go ahead and submit the draft of the ordinance to introduce it.

D. Berry said P. Thomason to do preliminary guidelines. D. Berry and L. Patterson will then draft them to bring back in a form that can be advertised to the public to have the public comment period and public hearing period. The draft to be presented at the next meeting. D. Berry advised the Commission to send their feed back on what was presented today to P. Thomason.

Scott Kendall addressed the Commission with comments that the guidelines should reflect Belle Meade. G. Duke agreed saying that the pictures and guidelines that are used need to be from the Belle Meade Community that are of the highest quality since that is what we are asking them to strive for. R. Farris commented the guidelines should be of the highest standards and used River Oaks in Texas as an example of language. P. Thomason requested all members email him addresses of homes in the Community they would like to have in the guidelines.

Mall Wall addressed the Commission with what is the next step? Goal for the draft is Monday, November 25th. The Historic Zoning Commission is to email P. Thomason, with a copy to Lyle Patterson and Doug Berry, what they do and do not want in the preliminary guidelines along with addresses of homes in the City they would like him to include.

3. Establish Date for the Next Meeting

The next meeting will be Monday, November 25 at 3:00pm at City Hall

4. Adjourn

Motion to adjourn at 5:05pm: Wall Second: Farris Vote: All Aye

Chairman Mal Wall

City Recorder, Edie Glaser