

**Minutes
Historic Zoning Commission
City of Belle Meade
February 9, 2021 by "Zoom"**

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman, Mal Wall at 3:00pm via "Zoom".

Commission members present

Chairman, Mal Wall Vice Chairman, Jeanette Whitson
Ron Farris Gavin Duke

Staff Members present

Lyle Patterson, Assistant City Manager and Building Official
Doug Berry, City Attorney
Edie Glaser, City Recorder

Consideration of the Minutes

Consideration of the HZC meeting held January 12, 2021

Motion to approve: Whitson **Second:** Duke **Vote:** All aye

Old Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for DAC Properties, LLC (20121) 717 Westview Avenue to construct a new single-family home on a vacant lot.

Motion to defer for thirty days: Farris **Second:** Duke **Vote:** All Aye

New Business:

1. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Chris Holmes, (21021) 402 Ellendale Avenue, for the demolition of existing home (Property of Significance) and construct a new single-family home.

Presentation: Ron Farris, Farris Concepts in Architecture, we would like to construct a new Georgian Style residence and request the demolition of the existing residence that was constructed in 1936. In my opinion the existing residence has no overarching redeeming qualities in style, construction quality, systems quality, or historical significance that we have been able to find. The home has had repeated, disjointed, poorly planned, and implemented renovations and/or additions throughout multiple decades. The only designer we could find was with the additions that occurred during the 70's and 90's. That work was performed by Elliot All. I do not see that this home possesses integrity of design, materials, workmanship, setting, location, or feeling to be eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. We found no broad cultural or political economic development of this project and found no historic person associated with it. I do not think it possesses distinguishing characteristics of architectural type or style or authenticity of a period as evidenced by survival of its characteristics, historic fabric, and architectural elements. Those are key to my consideration. We did not find notable work of a master builder, designer, or architect. The original structure suffers from several awkward proportions and scale particularly beginning at the front door. The initial structure has a split level entry. The front door is well below the actual finish floor of the house. It nets a scale and proportion, in my opinion,

that does not meet a high level of standard of something that has classic proportion scale. The front doors head and elements of the front door are well below the other significant horizontal line at the window heads. It is quite awkward, in my opinion.

This home has had multiple renovations and additions. We believe that the left wing was originally a garage that got converted and then renovations occurred through out the left wing and the right wing. I cannot ascertain what period. It may have been done over multiple phases. The ceilings in the house are approximately eight feet tall. There was a renovation addition of a large sunroom with a garden structure placed in the rear of the residence. This addition to the back along with the front portico being ill designed, I find quite awkward as it is tacked on the back of what was originally a bay window. It was sewn into the previous additions and created a maze of rooms on the left side that we cannot find any resemblance of the original structure that offers architectural historical character to it. The garage was converted with some stairs added to the basement that again were very awkwardly placed. A pool and pool house was added. Broadly because of these numerous defects and repeated additions, we think poor quality of their implementation and just pure age of those additions and renovations we are asking the board to consider demolition of the structure.

Board Questions and Comments:

Duke, will any parts of the existing house going to be used for the new structure?

Farris, this home does have a mostly intact basement and foundation system that we are going to try and utilize. We are working over the center rectangle of the existing house.

Wall, will the pool and pool house remain?

Farris, the pool, and pool house will remain. The plan is to renovate the pool house. We are going to try to maintain and convert the existing structure that is there to some guest quarters and renovate the pool house to modern standards. The pool, terrace, and retaining walls will remain as well.

Wall, the reason for not sliding the whole thing forward and getting it in the building envelope is to reuse the basement and foundation system?

Farris, the proposed new structure is in the allowable building envelope. The pool and pool house are not. There is value in the pool and pool house, and we would rather not have to remove those and slide the whole composition forward. The average front setback is well forward of our proposed location. I would be well in front of the neighboring properties if I brought it all the way forward.

Duke, are those big oaks in front of that house?

Farris, they are, we are hoping to stabilize and protect the existing trees as we move through this.

Board Discussions:

Whitson, this presentation is exactly what this board is looking for moving forward. This is an extremely good example of that. Appreciate Mr. Farris and the owner putting forth an argument and the reasons behind it for why this home needs to be demolished.

Motion to approve the demolition because it does not qualify for any of the property of significance guidelines: Duke Second: Whitson

Vote: All aye

Presentation of Proposed New Design: Ron Farris, the proposed new design will be a Georgian style. We want to give the house a sense of base. The property slopes from front to back. The pool and its structure are embedded

into a hill with retaining walls. The finish floor of the house has to be well above street in order to meet and accommodate the slope issue. The effort here is to give the entry court sequence a base and console walls as you step into and make your way up to the finish floor of the house. That simple move gives the house a subsidy quality of setting on a base. The architecture is a Georgian character with common materials of a native stone and clapboard siding. There may be a bit of a departure from a pure Georgian in that we are being relevant of today's desires to implement more daylight into it with larger window patterns but we are holding to a common composition proportion of the panes of glass that we are using. The columns will be of Georgian character, Tuscan in nature with emphasis on classically scaled entablature and rack at both the front porch and the entablature and rack above its second story component. The rear is a compliment to the front minus its base because of the grading nature of it. There are a series of windows that are repeated on each side of the center line. The two side elevations offer balance and restraint in their presentation. The main body of the house will be rendered in clapboard siding and its subsequent wings will be rendered in a native stone in a random ashlar pattern. The garage front elevation is rendered in clapboard to give it a carriage house feel. We are within the height allowables. This house will have classically proportioned dormers and classically detailed shutters.

Board Questions and Comments:

Whitson, what are the windows going to be made out of?

Farris, the windows will be of a clad exterior quality, painted interior, a narrow mutton, with insulated glass. They will have scale and proportion of a classical style window.

Duke, on the front elevations any way to do four windows of the similar size possibly.

Farris, the thought for the shutters for authenticity is that we would do a bi-folded shutter that would look like it would close over it. Happy to revisit those proportions.

Duke, are these double hung?

Farris, yes

Duke, I think from the street it would be nice to have that symmetry of similar sized windows for the upper portion.

Farris, I am happy to look at that center window and I don't disagree.

Duke, are the two bays that come out flat roof?

Farris, yes

Duke, normally in a Georgian you would see hips with copper in those extensions.

Farris, I looked at hiping in the semblance of a railing around them. I did not like the composition the hip created from a front elevation standpoint. There could maybe be a little bit more scale or pieces to what is above the transom to give it a little bit more heft.

Duke, is that a flat lock copper?

Farris, it will have some pitch to it, but it will be a flat lock copper roof.

Duke, would you consider taking it to under the pediment a little? You could probably take that wing back a little closer to the house to return and then let it shed up.

Farris, it maybe something to introduce a small window above or a louvered.

Duke, like a copper vent?

Farris, correct.

Duke, on the back elevation the two windows that are over the center of the main body. It seems like there needs to be a little spacing. I know you have two bathrooms up there. They seem like they are pretty close.

Farris, there are a couple of revisions being passed around for the interior of this that I think will help with those windows. I can work on the composition of both the front and back windows.

Duke, what is the shingle?

Farris, it would be a deposit shingle or a slate, depending on budget. Grey or variegated in nature. We have not chosen a shingle yet.

Duke, on the left side elevation can you explain the two windows with a gap between the two bays?

Farris, these are in the bathroom. One is in the closet.

Duke, I think simplicity wise it might be better connected.

Whitson, I personally like it broken up. Otherwise, I feel like that would be a very heavy element. It also gives you an opportunity to really showcase a tree or something between those two.

Farris, Yes, I believe when I drafted it, it became very heavy. The effort was to get it centered and balanced. Maybe an introduction of a smaller window.

Motion to approve the plan as submitted with the addition of the comments we made in those changes: Duke Second: Whitson Vote: All aye

Comments summary:

Architect to take a look at the back windows and the front entry window above the front door area for the proportion and three windows. The potential of looking at the bay windows to do a study to get them a little bit more out of a flat roof element. Side elevation potential.

2. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Province Builders, (21022) 903 Lynwood Boulevard, to construct a new single-family home. Demolition was granted at the January 2021 meeting.

Presentation: Chris Goldbeck with PShea Designs and John Swift with Province Builders. The neighborhood of Lynwood Boulevard and neighboring streets are composed of houses predominately of French or Neoclassical character. The houses on this block are predominately a story and a half or one story. Because of this in order to fit in and maintain the character of the neighborhood this home is a story and half and stylistically we took this house in a more French direction. This home has a little bit of an English influence to it with a story and a half side facing gables with smaller individual dormer. We have tried to fit in with the character of the neighborhood both with the massing and the style. This house started out as a speculative residence. At this point there are now buyers. There is an extra sheet we submitted labeled alternate porch. We would like to compare that with the main drawings that shows Tuscan columns and the dormers rather than the curved roof with gable dormers.

Board Questions and Comments:

Duke, do we have the alternative elevations? You said the dormers changed? Goldbeck, they did. The only difference is that instead of the curved dormers they have a simple gable form to them.

Duke, they are not shed anymore. Do they have a pediment?

Goldberg, yes, that is correct. We prefer the pediment but if the Board was of the opinion that the shed is preferable, we would be fine with that too.

Duke, could you explain the dentil molding?

Goldberg, we were just trying to dress up the style slightly but if you felt that the dentil was not in keeping with the style we would be willing to eliminate this.

Duke, the earlier designed front porch goes better with these dormers in my opinion than the shed porch with the pediment dormers. You have the timbers over the headers of the windows, correct?

Goldberg, correct, they are true timber headers.

Wall, I agree with Gavin.

Duke, I would lose the dentil molding and keep the timber entry with the pediment dormers. Is the French window divided light?

Goldberg, those are simulated divided lights like the rest of the house.

Duke, at the upper dormers are those operable windows?

Goldberg, yes, they are casement windows.

Duke, on your right side elevation you have a swoop on the roof, can you do that on the main body of the house?

Goldberg, I guess as a rule, I generally will have the main house have the fancier character and then when you get towards the back of the house it becomes more relaxed with the detailing and cornice. That is why I kept it a simple 6/12 roof in the back. If you feel it needs to be dressed up more to match the main house, we can certainly do that.

Duke, I think architecturally it would add to your style maybe instead of gable you could hip it.

Farris, I would concur with that comment. I am liking the general composition. I am wondering if there is a way to make a connection of what I think the main body is, the success of it with the rear.

Duke, I think it sort of falls apart. It looks like that is an addition as opposed to something that happened concurrently.

Whitson, because of the massing and the blockness of it, it does not match the front. The pitch is off.

Farris, the pitch could be steepened.

Duke, steepened and carve it out and maybe put a hip roof on the back over that room.

Whitson, what are the ceiling height per floor?

Goldberg, 10ft on the first floor and 9ft on the second floor.

Whitson, is there a basement?

Goldberg, yes and we are at 9ft in the basement.

Farris, on the front elevation is the front door sunken in?

Goldberg, the front door is set back a little to give some depth.

Farris, so that curve of the roof is not represented in this side elevation detail?

Goldberg, I'm sure that will happen. Usually the cornice details are the last things we draw.

Whitson, on the left side elevation is there anyway you can balance the windows that are in the front portion? There is a single window and a double window that is not balanced.

Goldberg, the double windows are where they need to be floor plan wise. The second floor window is centered in the gable.

Whitson, that would be off not centered in the gable, but you could add a window below.

Farris, that is an elevation we are going to see. Would be nice to get those centered.

Goldberg, if we added a full width shutter to the left side of that window, would that help balance it more?

Whitson, I think it would look contrived.

Farris, are the stairs off the screened porch a go?

Goldberg, yes, those will be wood composite stairs to grade from the back porch.

Public Comments

Steven Mason, 901 Lynwood Boulevard, when would the landscaping plan be presented? We live next door.

Patterson, when they actually present construction drawings, we will require it then.

Wall, does it need to go to Board of Zoning Appeals?

Patterson, they are under on height and they are within their footprint.

Board Discussion:

The elements that need to be addressed are, remove dentil mold, window on the left side of the house, no pediment over the front door, pediment dormers, roof pitch in the rear.

Goldberg, the challenge with changing the roof pitch in the back is keeping that ridge below the ridge of the main house. We can increase on one side but if we increase the 612 all the way around that ridge gets up over the main house.

Whitson, on the right side elevation the main body of the house the windows are not symmetrical. The four windows seem randomly placed.

Farris, I like the three common character and the one outlier. I know that is in a bathroom. I would be asking to look at that along with the left side.

Motion to defer for sixty days: Duke Second: Farris Vote: All aye

Meeting adjourned 4:33pm

Chairman, Mal Wall

City Recorder, Edie Glaser