

**Minutes**  
**City of Belle Meade**  
**Historic Zoning Commission**  
**Tuesday, August 11, 2020**

**Call to order**

The "Zoom" platform meeting was called to order by the Chairman, Mal Wall at 3:00pm.

**Commission Members present**

Chairman, Mal Wall                      Ron Farris                      Jeanette Whitson  
Bunny Blackburn                      Gavin Duke

**Staff Members present**

City Manager, Beth Reardon                      City Attorney, Doug Berry  
Assistant City Manager and Building Official, Lyle Patterson  
City Recorder, Edie Glaser

**Consideration of the Minutes**

Minutes of the HZC meeting held June 9, 2020

**Motion to approve:** Blackburn                      **Second:** Farris                      **Vote:** All Aye

**Old Business:** None

**New Business**

1. The application for a certification of appropriateness for Greg and Holly Gaughan, (20081) 429 Royal Oaks Drive, to construct a new single-family home.

**Presentation:** Preston Shea with P. Shea Design, this is a two story residence in an Italianate style. This home was submitted to the Commission as the Bass home several months ago in a Classic Revival Style. We have made several modifications mainly pairing down the overall massing. We have gone from full utilization of the two story massing at all the insulated wings to two story primarily at the main mass.

We have gone from a Classical Revival gable to hip roof forms. Primary materials for this home are painted brick at the main house and a mix of hardie and hardie artisan siding at the added wings. We feel like this home fits with the existing homes in the neighborhood both in terms of massing and material. The overall layout is basically the same. Due to the strange cross slop to the lot there is a curved retaining wall on the South side and the garage has remained on the North side. The elevations have become less imposing. As part of the previous submittal the HZC had asked that we add a retaining wall as a means to reduce the overall foundation exposure at the front of the house. We are using a grand manor composition shingle and cast stone headers at the arched windows upstairs. At the side structures we are using crown mold over the window heads.

**Board Questions/Comments:**

Blackburn, there is a lot going on here. There are different styles of windows, double columns, it seems to be a lot of parts.

Shea, the Italianate style lends itself to a mix of elliptical significant arches, flat tops, pronounced headers, double windows and columns.

Blackburn, the front door and the French doors to the left and right with transoms do not look Italianate to me.

Duke, on the two side wings there are no rooms above them, correct?

Shea, that is correct.

Duke, the scale and proportion at the top of the windows where the soffit is has the hardie siding exposure at 4 inches and I believe it should be 5 inch exposure. Is there anything above those windows?

Shea, there are minor closets and/or bathrooms tucked within those hip roofs. We could raise the window heights, add transoms and/or increase the detail at the cornice.

Duke, your front porch has a scale then at the two wings the soffits go above that level. It seems like these two wings are starting to sail above the first level of the porch.

Farris, the composition and study of the massing at the front elevation accomplishes the Italianate scale and proportion. The front door seems to be more classical in nature than the Italianate style. It gets complicated to me on the side and the back. The fireplace component is a broad mass.

The materials need to be limestone instead of cast stone.

Duke, have you considered shutters? They would help with the massing of the two wings.

Shea, we would be open to that.

Duke, is it correct that an exterior fireplace can only be 16ft?

Shea, that scale is right at 16ft.

Duke, is the garage extension a 7inch exposure of the hardie plank?

Shea, yes.

Duke, the other ones are showing four but if you are thinking 7inch that might help with the scale at that second story first story split. Perhaps some kind of fascia banding there to break up the long view vertically.

Blackburn, I'm curious if this design is Italianate why the two wings are designed like they are?

Shea, comments before was that this home was massive and imposing because the secondary elements were full two story.

Blackburn, we appreciate that you are addressing that however the center of the house does not go with the wings. I don't think the front door is Italianate and does not match the French doors. It is not a defined style. I think it would be easier to not make it Italianate on the center of the house. In the inspirational photos you presented they do not have any wings like the ones your showing in your design.

Duke, depending on budget you could do the two wings in brick and then figured out some kind of decorative element over the windows. A blank panel recessed brick or something that is the Italianate style would be more in character with the house.

Whitson, I agree that the hardie plank does not lend anything to the Italianate style.

Blackburn, the Italianate style windows do not have many variations.

Shea, one of the distinguishing characteristics of the Italianate is a variety of windows specifically floor to floor. Many go up then arched.

Blackburn, that would be two style windows. The homes in the inspirational photos do not show that many different types of windows.

Shea, we can certainly look at this.

Duke, in the inspirational photos they give some examples of banding to give a little more division between the long gap between the top of the window.

Shea, that is a good idea, we would be open to that.

Farris, I am not asking you to take the house to the style that is in the inspirational photos. I would just continue to edit the overall style.

On the back elevation most of those windows speak a similar language. I am respectful of the challenge before you.

Shea, I made the decision to reduce things, but I can certainly raise and align things more. We can do something to make it more consistent.

Duke, what are the ceiling heights of the second floor bedrooms?

Shea, 10ft and the walk in closets are 8ft.  
Duke, lowering that might make the back not feel as prominent as the front.  
Shea, would raising the central portion help?  
Duke, it would help with the second floor windows.

#### **Board Discussion**

Farris, we have given the applicants representative a lot of feedback. It will need to be developed and studied from our comments.

**Motion to defer:**    Farris                      **Second:**    Duke                      **Vote:**    All aye

Change the siding pattern.  
Change the immediate second forms to painted brick.  
Add fascia banding above the windows.  
Add shutters or closed shutters on the left side elevation.  
Study raising the main box of the house to within the allowable limits.  
Look at windows for more consistency.  
Study alternates for the French doors.  
Massing and composition study at the rear of the house.

2. The application for the certificate of appropriateness for Chad and Dayla Calendine, (20072) 4416 Chickering Lane, for the partial demolition of existing home (Property of Significance) and construct a new addition of 35%.

**Presentation:** Neil McGlothlin with Vesta Homes, we are proposing to take down the existing garage and apartment leaving the green house that will be attached to the new build. The new build will be a three bedroom, 2 bath, with full kitchen. We will be matching it to the existing Georgian style of the house. We will reclaim the existing stone and brick from the garage we are to demo. On the right side of the home we will be adding a garage with an upper deck that comes off the upstairs master bedroom. We are adding a pretty good size porch to the left of the new construction. All the concrete will be permeable. The driveway to the garage will also be a permeable material for stormwater purposes to capture the rainwater. We will be adding a retaining wall to the back of that garage for grade purposes. We will be matching the windows.

#### **Board Questions/Comments:**

Whitson, is the roof height of the addition the same height of the roof of the existing house?  
McGlothlin, it is close. I am not the architect but does not appear to be going over the height.  
Duke, what are the existing balusters of the house made of?  
McGlothlin, wood.  
Duke, are you going to use wood balusters throughout?  
McGlothlin, we will have to do custom balusters.  
Whitson, I have a little bit of an issue on how tall the building is to the left on the other side of the porte-cochere. It matches the same height of the existing house. Is there a reason why that is so tall to the left?  
McGlothlin, there are two bedrooms.  
Whitson, what is the ceiling height of those bedrooms?  
McGlothlin, they are 8.4 ½ .  
Duke, there is a lot of distance between the bay below and the top of the fascia and garage area. Your connector seem like it could have more architectural character. It resembles more of a hospital connector than some passage that compliments the architecture of the house. The space above the

bay could use even some brick panels to break it up. I think architecturally it needs to be studied a little more and it seems a little too tall. Calendine, my main purpose of taking on this project is to accommodate my grandmother who will be living with us. The porte-cochere will allow for easy access for her getting in and out of a car. It will have a second floor to connect to the house. In my discussions with Carrie Stringer, the designer, we wanted something that would go well with the balcony on the front porch. I chose to put the windows on the back because we have a beautiful back yard that we want to be able to look out and enjoy. Our intent is to put a seating area on one side with the windows on the opposite side.

Whitson, is that a pitch ceiling in the walkway?

Stringer, it is vaulted.

Farris, I am troubled by the blank wall above the bay. I think the crosswalk needs to be elevated to a stronger architectural style to the existing house. The right addition I struggle with the most. That is a large flat roof.

Calendine, if we flipped the windows on the porte-cochere and put the windows on the front would that work?

Duke, yes and would you ever entertain the idea of bringing the siding down on both of the areas where the balustrade is and have an opening? There is a floating aspect to this connector. It seems like it needs to have some feet. That would help anchor that connector to the earth even if you did not have the window above.

Blackburn, my concern is this addition is way too overwhelming to the house. The height is overwhelming, the distance from the windows to the roof line is too great, the porte-cochere is floating and too much unbroken siding. On the right side there is a very large porch there. The scale of that is giving me pause.

Farris, will this be going to the BZA as well? There is a nine foot wall near the garage area.

Patterson, this wall is serving a purpose as retaining and not decorative.

Whitson, list of items to take to your architect.

. Height of the left addition is not subservient to the main house therefore the massing is problematic.

. The connector needs something to carry down to the ground and something more decorative.

. On the right side the massing and width of the garage with the small roof cover looks out of place.

#### **Board Discussions:**

**Motion to defer for sixty days: Farris      Second: Whitson      Vote: All aye**

3. The application for a certificate of appropriateness for Allen and Delphine Damon, (20073) 1019 Chancery Lane, for the demolition of garage and to construct an addition to existing home, (Property of Conservation) more than 35%.

**Presentation:** Charlie Rankin, architect for 1019 Chancery Lane, this is a 1964 Colonial Revival Style home that is worthy of conservation. The clients are seeking to renovate a portion of the existing house and place an addition to the North end of the house. To accomplish the addition, we are proposing to demo the existing one story garage. The intent of the project is to expand and renovate the kitchen, add a new screened porch, add a master bedroom on the main floor level, create an improved laundry room, add an elevator, and clean up a some what choppy floor plan on the first and second floor levels.

The main entry to the house is located on the back of the house. Our design seeks to place a new screened porch and a new master bedroom on the East side of the house facing Chancery. In an effort to be sensitive to the scale of the existing house the eaves of the proposed addition are set to align to the eaves of the existing main body of the house. The addition is to mirror or match the main level of the house. Our intention is to match the eave detail to that main portion of the house. The ridge line of the new addition is in line with the ridge height of the existing house. We are not going any taller than the existing house. The screen porch is a low slope roof allowing us to keep the second floor windows in place. There will be a Chippendale railing style around the perimeter of the porch. We will be doing lap siding that will allow us to do a mitered corner. We have created two story mill work bays on both the front and back. This is to break up the mass of the front facing gable and add some architectural interest to the street facing façade. The brick base around the proposed addition will be brick that we have salvaged from the garage demo. We will mix in a new or reclaimed brick that we can find to match as close as possible. The design meets the footprint and FAR allowances. There is an existing non-conformity on the South end of the house. We have adjusted our setbacks to account for Zoning Ordinance 2018-5 that limits the overall width of the house to the width of the building envelope.

Delphine Damon, owner of 1019 Chancery Lane, Tara Armstead has just completed a re-design of the front. There is now a new parking area.

Whitson, this is a beautiful historic structure and an incredible thoughtful job that was done on this new addition.

Duke, what is the size of the lap siding?

Rankin, it is a 6inch reveal

**Board Discussion:**

**Motion to approve as submitted: Duke      Second: Whitson      Vote: All aye**

**Motion to adjourn at 4:56pm: Whitson      Second: Duke      Vote: All aye**

---

Chairman Mal Wall

---

City Recorder Edie Glaser